

LIDMAN LAW, APC

Scott M. Lidman (SBN 199433)
slidman@lidmanlaw.com
Elizabeth Nguyen (SBN 238571)
enguyen@lidmanlaw.com
Milan Moore (SBN 308095)
mmoore@lidmanlaw.com
Romina Tamiry (SBN 328420)
rtamiry@lidmanlaw.com
2155 Campus Drive, Suite 150
El Segundo, California 90245
Tel: (424) 322-4772
Fax: (424) 322-4775

Attorneys for Plaintiff
FRANCISCO CALDERON

HAINES LAW GROUP, APC

Paul K. Haines (SBN 248226)
phaines@haineslawgroup.com
2155 Campus Drive, Suite 180
El Segundo, California 90245
Tel: (424) 292-2350
Fax: (424) 292-2355

Attorneys for Plaintiff
FRANCISCO CALDERON

**SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES**

FRANCISCO CALDERON, as an individual
and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

SMILEDIRECTCLUB, LLC, a Tennessee
limited liability company; JEFFREY
SULITZER, D.M.D., PROFESSIONAL
CORPORATION, a California corporation; and
DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 20STCV03799

*[Assigned for all purposes to the Hon. Yvette M.
Palazuelos, Dept. SSC-9]*

**DECLARATION OF PAUL K. HAINES IN
SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY
APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION
SETTLEMENT**

Date: May 17, 2021
Time: 10:00 a.m.
Dept.: SSC-9

Complaint Filed: January 30, 2020
Trial Date: None

1 I, PAUL K. HAINES, declare as follows:

2 1. I am the principal of the law firm Haines Law Group, APC, and counsel for the named
3 Plaintiff Francisco Calderon ("Plaintiff") and the proposed Settlement Class in the above-captioned
4 matter. I am a member in good standing of the bar of the State of California and am admitted to practice
5 in this Court. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated in this declaration and could testify
6 competently to them if called upon to do so.

7 2. I am a 2006 graduate of Pepperdine University School of Law, where I graduated cum
8 laude. During law school, I worked as a law clerk for the appellate firm of Horvitz & Levy, located in
9 Encino, California. I also spent a semester in law school working as an extern for the Honorable Edward
10 Rafeedie, District Judge for the United States District Court for the Central District of California.

11 3. Since graduating from law school, my practice has focused exclusively on employment
12 litigation. In September 2007, I began working as an associate attorney at the international law firm of
13 Littler Mendelson P.C., at its Los Angeles office, which according to its website is the "largest U.S.-
14 based law firm exclusively devoted to representing management in every aspect of labor and employment
15 law." While at Littler Mendelson, I was primarily staffed on wage and hour class actions venued in both
16 state and federal courts, and I also worked on a number of single and multi-plaintiff wage and hour
17 matters as well.

18 4. During my employment at Littler Mendelson, I played a significant role in the class
19 actions that I was staffed on, as I was often the only associate staffed on such cases. In particular, I
20 received a wide-array of wage and hour class action experience performing the following types of tasks:
21 drafting demurrers, motions to strike and/or dismiss; removing actions from state court to federal court;
22 drafting and responding to written discovery; drafting and opposing discovery related motions; arguing
23 discovery related motions; drafting motions to consolidate related matters; interviewing putative class
24 members and obtaining declarations in connection with class certification; drafting oppositions to
25 motions for class certification; drafting motions for decertification following class certification;
26 conducting exposure analyses to assess the strengths and weaknesses of asserted claims, the likelihood
27 of prevailing at class certification and potential damages resulting from such claims; drafting mediation
28 briefs; serving as the primary contact to in-house counsel; deposing named plaintiff and putative class

1 members; deposing retained expert witnesses; and defending the depositions of corporate witnesses. In
2 short, I played an integral role in all aspects of litigation from the inception of a matter through and
3 beyond class certification. I also supervised the work of several junior attorneys who were staffed on the
4 same wage and hour class actions.

5 5. In June 2011, I voluntarily resigned from Littler Mendelson in order to accept an associate
6 attorney position with the international law firm of Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP, at its Los Angeles
7 office, where I began working in July 2011. During my employment at Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP,
8 I worked exclusively on the defense of wage and hour class and collective actions. For the vast majority
9 of these cases, I was the only associate staffed on the matter, and I performed the same job duties as
10 described in the immediately preceding paragraph. In addition to working on wage and hour class
11 actions, at Morgan, Lewis & Bockius I also worked on a number of “hybrid” actions asserting nationwide
12 wage and hour claims under the Fair Labor Standards Act (“FLSA”), as well as California-specific claims
13 under Rule 23 of the Rules of Civil Procedure.

14 6. In July 2012, I transitioned into litigating wage and hour class actions from the Plaintiff’s
15 side, first as a Partner with the law firm of Boren, Osher & Luftman, LLP, and since February 2016, as a
16 Shareholder of the Haines Law Group, APC. Currently, over ninety percent (90%) of my practice is
17 dedicated exclusively to the prosecution of wage and hour class actions, and I am currently responsible
18 for prosecuting over thirty (30) wage and hour class actions filed in both State and Federal courts
19 throughout California. Below are some of the matters in which I have been appointed as Class Counsel,
20 all of which have been granted final approval: *Hilberger v. Eisenhower Medical Center*, Case No.
21 INC1204915, California Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Judge John G. Evans,
22 presiding, (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2012 and 2013);
23 *Lopez v. Cornucopia Tools and Plastics, Inc.*, Case No. CV138049, California Superior Court, County
24 of San Luis Obispo, Honorable Judge Martin J. Tangeman, presiding, (in which I was approved for an
25 hourly rate of \$425 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Tacker v. Compass Health, Inc.*, Case No.
26 CV13-02261 BRO (JCG), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge
27 Beverly Reid O’Connell, presiding, (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work
28 performed in 2013 and 2014); *Noell v. American Professional Ambulance Corporation, Inc.*, Case No.

1 BC499345, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Kenneth R. Freeman,
2 presiding, (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014);
3 *Bautista v. Harvest Management Sub LLC*, Case No. CV12-10004 FMO (CWx), United States District
4 Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Fernando M. Olguin, presiding (in which I was
5 approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2012, 2013 and 2014); *Davila v. OCB*
6 *Restaurant Co.*, Case No. CV13-5403 PA (JCG), United States District Court, Central District of
7 California, Honorable Judge Percy Anderson, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of
8 \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Abad v. Waste Connections, Inc.*, Case No. CV12-06708
9 DDP (PJWx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Dean D.
10 Pregerson, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013
11 and 2014); *Plantillas v. Snap-On Incorporated*, Case No. CV13-05153 DDP (VBKx), United States
12 District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Dean D. Pregerson, presiding (in which I
13 was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Theodore v. Keyes*
14 *European, LLC*, Case No. BC521395, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable
15 Judge Elihu Berle, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in
16 2013 and 2014); *Morales v. Sunset Tower Hotel LLC*, Case No. BC511924, California Superior Court,
17 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge John Shepard Wiley Jr., presiding (in which I was approved
18 for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Gonzalez v. Universal Alloy Corp.*,
19 Case No. SACV13-00807 JVS (MRWx), United States District Court, Central District of California,
20 Honorable Judge James V. Selna, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work
21 performed in 2013 and 2014); *Morawski v. Milt Guggia Enterprises, Inc.*, Case No. CV13-2349 ABC
22 (RZx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Andre Birotte, Jr.,
23 presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014);
24 *Thorp v. Alcal Industries, Inc., et al.*, Case No. CV13-02289 YGR, United States District Court, Northern
25 District of California, Honorable Judge Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers, presiding (in which I was approved
26 for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Myles v. College Hospital*, Case No.
27 BC487206, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge John Shepard Wiley,
28 Jr., presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013, 2014 and

2015); *Sarinana v. DS Waters of America, Inc.*, Case No. C13-0905 EMC, United States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable Edward M. Chen, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Julio v. Anthony, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-03172 AB (SHx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Andre Birotte Jr., presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Litt v. Western Stone & Metal Corp.*, Case No. 3:14-cv-02804-PJH, United States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable Judge Phyllis J. Hamilton, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Rubalcava v. United Towing and Transport Burbank, et al.*, Case No. BC518468, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Kenneth Freeman, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2013, 2014 and 2015); *Sanchez v. Res-Care, Inc.*, Case No. BC526175, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable John S. Wiley, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2013, 2014 and 2015); *Prado v. Warehouse Demo Services, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-3170 JFW (Ex), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge John F. Walter, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Rivera Regalado v. Jaguar Farm Labor Contracting*, Case No. CV 130569, California Superior Court, County of San Luis Obispo, Honorable Martin J. Tangeman, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Rodas v. Gateways Hospital and Mental Health Center*, Case No. BC503179, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Amy D. Hogue, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Escobar v. Century West, LLC*, Case No. BC564873, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Jane L. Johnson, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015 and 2016); *Shaw v. Conant Auto Retail, San Diego*, Case No. 37-2014-00044052-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Judge Joan M. Lewis, presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2014, 2015, and 2016); *Tirado v. Ricon Corp.*, Case No. BC537042, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable John S. Wiley, presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2014, 2015, and 2016); and *Horta v. Searles Valley Minerals*,

1 *Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS 1507615, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Donald
2 Alvarez presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2015 and 2016); *Cristobal v.*
3 *Koos Manufacturing, Inc.*, Case No. BC591484, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon.
4 William F. Highberger presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2015 and
5 2016); *Rodriguez v. Spartan, Inc.*, Case No. BCV-15-100007-DRL, California Superior Court, County
6 of Kern, Honorable David R. Lampe presiding (approving hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in
7 2015, 2016, and 2017); *Kostyuk, et al. v. Golden State Overnight Delivery Service, Inc.*, Case No.
8 RG14727191, California Superior Court, Alameda County, Honorable Winifred Y. Smith presiding
9 (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2015, 2016, and 2017); *Nunez v. CompuCom*
10 *Systems, Inc.*, Case No. BC618385, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge
11 John Shepard Wiley, Jr., presiding (approved at an hourly rate of \$600 for work performed in 2016 and
12 2017); *Mansilla v. Haeco Americas Line Services, LLC, et al.*, Case No. BC615310, Superior Court of
13 California, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Elihu M. Berle presiding (approved at an hourly
14 rate of \$600 for work performed in 2016 and 2017); *Morales v. Caremeridian, LLC, et al.*, Case No.
15 BC593191, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Judge William F. Highberger presiding
16 (granting final approval of settlement on behalf of direct support professionals involving claims for
17 unpaid wages, meal and rest period violations, wage statement violations, and other claims).

18 7. I have also moved to certify and have received an order certifying a class action and/or
19 conditionally certifying a collective action, in the following cases:

- 20 • *Medeiros v. Vortex Financial Management Inc.*, Case No. 30-2013-00644741-CU-OE-CXC,
21 California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Judge Gail A. Andler, presiding
22 (certifying a class of employees who were misclassified as independent contractors);
- 23 • *Javine v. San Luis Ambulance Service, Inc.*, Case No. CV13-07480 BRO (SSx), United States
24 District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Beverly Reid O'Connell, presiding
25 (conditionally certifying an unpaid FLSA overtime wage class);
- 26 • *Prado v. Warehouse Demo Services, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-3170 JFW (Ex), United States District
27 Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge John F. Walter, presiding (certifying a rest
28 period violation class and conditionally certifying an FLSA unpaid overtime wage class);

- 1 • *Bower v. Cycle Gear, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-2712 HSG, United States District Court, Northern
2 District of California, Honorable Judge Haywood S. Gilliam, Jr., presiding (conditionally
3 certifying an unpaid FLSA overtime wage class);
- 4 • *Vega v. Weatherford U.S., Limited Partnership*, Case No. CV14-1790-JLT, United States District
5 Court, Eastern District of California, Honorable Jennifer L. Thurston, presiding (conditionally
6 certifying an unpaid FLSA overtime wage class);
- 7 • *Galvan v. AMVAC Chemical Corporation*, Case No. 30-2014-00716103-CU-OE-CXC, California
8 Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Judge William Claster, presiding (certifying unpaid
9 overtime wage class and waiting time penalty class); and
- 10 • *Ontiveros v. Safelite Fulfillment, Inc., et al*, Case No. CV 15-7118-DMG (RAOx), United States
11 District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Dolly M. Gee presiding (certifying six
12 classes of employees for rest period violations, wage statement violations, meal period violations,
13 and overtime and double-time violations);
- 14 • *Vazquez, et al v. Kraft Heinz Foods Company*, Case No. 16-cv-2749-WQH-BLM, United States
15 District Court, Southern District of California, Honorable William Q. Hayes presiding (certifying
16 six classes of employees for unpaid wages, meal period violations, wage statement violations, and
17 waiting time penalties); and
- 18 • *Caudle, et al. v. Sprint/United Management Company, et al.* Case No. C 17-06874-WHA, United
19 States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable William H. Alsup presiding
20 (certifying three classes of employees for unlawful wage deduction violations, wage statement
21 violations, and waiting time violations).

22 8. In 2015, 2016 and 2017, Thomson Reuters and Los Angeles Magazine recognized me as
23 a Top Young Attorney in Southern California in the annual Rising Star Edition of Super Lawyer. This
24 is an honor awarded to no more than two and a half percent of attorneys under the age of forty in Southern
25 California each year. In 2018 and 2019 Thomson Reuters recognized me as a “Super Lawyer” in the
26 annual Super Lawyer magazine, an honor awarded to no more than five percent of all attorneys in
27 Southern California each year.

28 9. As co-counsel for Plaintiff and the proposed Settlement Class, I have been intimately

1 involved in every aspect of this case from its inception through the present, and believe that the proposed
2 Settlement is an excellent result for the Settlement Class.

3 10. The details of the worked completed by my firm and/or my co-counsel are set forth in the
4 declaration of Elizabeth Nguyen filed concurrently herewith. I declare under penalty of perjury under the
5 laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

6 Executed on March 2, 2021, at El Segundo, California.

7 
8 _____
9 Paul K. Haines
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28