

1 DAVID G. SPIVAK (SBN 179684)
david@spivaklaw.com

2 LAUREN R. DAVIS (SBN 294115)
lauren@spivaklaw.com

3 THE SPIVAK LAW FIRM

8605 Santa Monica Bl

4 PMB 42554

West Hollywood, CA 90069

5 Telephone: (213) 725-9094

6 Facsimile: (213) 634-2485

Attorneys for Plaintiff(s),

7 NAOMI MOJADDIDI, KIA SPURNEY, and all others similarly situated
(Additional attorneys for Plaintiff(s) on following page)

9 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

10 **FOR THE COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO**

11
12 NAOMI MOJADDIDI, KIA SPURNEY,
and ANTOLIN NAJERA, on behalf of
13 themselves and all others similarly
situated, the general public, and as
14 “aggrieved employees” on behalf of other
“aggrieved employees” under the Labor
Code Private Attorneys General Act of
15 2004,

16 *Plaintiff(s),*

17 vs.

18 ELITE DINERS, LLC, a California
limited liability company; ELITE
19 DEVCO, LLC, a California limited
liability company; ELITE SPORTS BAR
20 GROUP, LLC, a California corporation;
SOCAL DINERS, LLC, a California
21 limited liability company; ELITE
BUSINESS ENTERPRISES, INC., a
22 California corporation; and DOES 1–50,
inclusive,

23 *Defendant(s).*

Case No. 34-2020-00273090-CU-OE-GDS
Reservation # A-273090-001
[Assigned for all purposes to the Hon. Jill
Talley in Dept. 23]

**DECLARATION OF DAVID D. BIBIYAN
IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS’ MOTION
FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF
CLASS AND PAGA SETTLEMENT**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

ADDITIONAL ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF(S)

WALTER L. HAINES (SBN 71075)
 walter@uelglaw.com
UNITED EMPLOYEES LAW GROUP
8605 Santa Monica Bl.
PMB 63354
West Hollywood, CA 90069
Telephone: (562) 256-1047
Facsimile: (562) 256-1006

Attorneys for Plaintiff(s),
NAOMI MOJADDIDI, KIA SPURNEY, and all others similarly situated

DAVID D. BIBIYAN (SBN 287811)
 david@tomorrowlaw.com
JEFFREY D. KLEIN (SBN 297296)
 jeff@tomorrowlaw.com
VEDANG J. PATEL (SBN 328647)
 vedang@tomorrowlaw.com
BIBIYAN LAW GROUP, P.C.
1460 Westwood Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90024
Telephone: (310) 438-5555
Facsimile: (310)300-1705

Attorneys for Plaintiff(s),
ANTOLIN NAJERA, and all others similarly situated

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

7
8
9
0
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

2
3
4
5
6
7
8

4
5
6
7
8

7

8

- 1 • *Arendsdorff v. Stanley Steemer International, Inc.*, Case No. BC681368, California
2 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos, presiding.
- 3 • *Barreto v. Don Roberto Jewelers, Inc.*, Case No. BC495451, California Superior Court,
4 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding.
- 5 • *Junior Amilcar Laguna Gonzalez v. Takaaki Koyama*, Case No. BC641998, Los Angeles
6 Superior Court, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding.
- 7 • *Rios v. Nongshim America, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1807390, California Superior Court,
8 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding.
- 9 • *Stoddard v. Molded Fiber Glass – West*, Case No. 1517758, California Superior Court,
10 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding.
- 11 • *Mata v. Sahara Scaffold, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1810785, California Superior Court,
12 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding.
- 13 • *Carrasco v. Pure Dental Solutions*, Case No. BC645995, Los Angeles Superior Court,
14 Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman, presiding.
- 15 • *Gonzalez v. Gochez, et al.*, Case No. BC648729, Los Angeles Superior Court, Honorable
16 Maren Nelson, presiding.
- 17 • *Montoya v. Superior Paving Co.*, Case No. CIVDS1833422, County of San Bernardino,
18 Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding.
- 19 • *Lopez v. Norred & Associates, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1824109, California Superior
20 Court, County of San Bernardino, David S. Cohn, presiding.
- 21 • *Noyola v. Lacren, LLC*, Case No. BC717024, California Superior Court, County of Los
22 Angeles, Hon. Anthony Mohr, presiding.
- 23 • *Luciano, et al. v. O’Tasty Foods, Inc., et al.*, Case No. BC711988, California Superior
24 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding.
- 25 • *Gordon v. Hospice Source, LLC*, Case No. 34-2018-00250022-CU-OE-GDS, California
26 Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Christopher E. Krueger, presiding.
- 27 • *Barragan v. Refrigeration Supplies Distributor*, Case No. 19STCV09312, California
28 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;

1 • *Ramirez v. Acre Gourmet, Inc.*, Case No. CGC-19-575117, California Superior Court,
2 County of San Francisco, Honorable Andrew Y.S. Cheng, presiding.

3 • *Villafuerte v. Bay Alarm Company*, Case No. BC689110, California Superior Court,
4 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding.

5 • *Cazares v. Areas USA LAX, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
6 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding.

7 • *Magana v. Castlerock Environmental, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 19STCV38353, California
8 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding.

9 • *Chilel v. Sushi California, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
10 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding.

11 • *Malone v. Orange Courier, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 30-2016-00763474, California Superior
12 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Glenda Sanders, presiding.

13 • *Rivera v. Talamo Food Services, Inc.*, Case No. 19CV355856, California Superior Court,
14 County of Santa Clara, Honorable Patricia M. Lucas, presiding.

15 • *Olquin v. Cal Central Harvesting, Inc.*, Case No. 18CV03860, California Superior Court,
16 County of Santa Barbara, Honorable James F. Rigali, presiding.

17 • *Pence v. Sober Living by the Sea, Inc.*, Case No. 2018-00988742, California Superior
18 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman, presiding.

19 • *Franco v. Vincent Rags, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV07768, California Superior Court,
20 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding.

21 • *Cabral v. Miller Castings, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
22 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding.

23 • *Bolanos v. Texas Roadhouse, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
24 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Sunshine Sykes, presiding.

25 • *Rodriguez v. Scott A. Humphreys, Inc.*, Case No. 30-2021-01184556-CU-OE-CXC,
26 California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Matthew P. Guasco, presiding.

27 • *Torres v. Primal Pet Foods, Inc.* Case No. FCS054783, California Superior Court,
28 County of Solano, Honorable Wendy G. Getty, presiding.

- 1 • *Hanson v. Zapata Nuccio, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV28951, California Superior Court,
2 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding.
- 3 • *Molina v. Avibank Mfg, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV03910, California Superior Court,
4 County of Los Angeles, Honorable John P. Doyle, presiding.
- 5 • *Cetina v. Lawry's Restaurants, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV05201, California Superior Court,
6 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;
- 7 • *Luna v. Pronto California General Agency, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV39951, California
8 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding.
- 9 • *Alvarez v. Kazak-Mars, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV42587, California Superior Court,
10 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding.
- 11 • *Noe v. My Pillow, Inc.* Case No. CIVDS 2011360, California Superior Court, County of
12 San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding.
- 13 • *Nunez v. 2751 West Coast Acquisition Company*, Case No. 30-2020-01145215-CU-
14 OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman,
15 Presiding.
- 16 • *Smith v. McMillen Enterprises, Inc.*, Case No. CV-20-002938, California Superior Court,
17 County of Stanislaus, Honorable John R. Mayne, presiding.
- 18 • *Turner v. Plant Prefab Inc., et al.*, Case No. CIVDS2017517, California Superior Court,
19 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding.
- 20 • *Duran v. Fresh Select, LLC*, Case No. VCU284892, California Superior Court, County
21 of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding.
- 22 • *Reynoso, et al. v. Cream of the Crop AG Service, Inc.*, Case No. VCU278847, California
23 Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding.
- 24 • *Michel v. Universal Waste Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV46181, California Superior
25 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding.
- 26 • *Jungers v. U.S. Borax Inc., et al.*, Case No. BCV-21-10003, California Superior Court,
27 County of Kern, Honorable Bernard C. Barmann Jr. presiding.
- 28 • *Fortune v. Amoroso Limited Partnership, et al.*, Case No. 20STCV25874, California

1 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding.

2 • *Montoya, et al. v. Remo, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV34614, California Superior Court,

3 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding.

4 • *Rincon, et al. v. New-Indy Tripaq, LLC, et al.* Case No. 20STCV17118, California

5 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding.

6 • *De Leon, et al. v. Wismettac Asian Foods, Inc.* Case No. 19STCV18172, California

7 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding.

8 • *Tapia v. Mercer Foods, Inc.* Case No. CV-21-000020, California Superior Court,

9 County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding.

10 • *Molina v. Reser's Fine Foods, Inc.* Case No. 37-2021-00013052-CU-OECTL, California

11 Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Eddie C. Sturgeon presiding.

12 • *Reyes v. Imperial Sprinkler Supply, Inc..* Case No. 30-2020-01167748-CU-OE-CXC,

13 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Peter Wilson presiding.

14 • *Zavala, et al. v. PLS Check Cashers, Inc..* Case No. 20STCV42586, California Superior

15 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding.

16 • *Paz v. Hill Brothers Chemical Company.* Case No. 20STCV48279, California Superior

17 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding.

18 • *Garcia v. Inwesco Incorporated.* Case No. 20STCV46833, California Superior Court,

19 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding.

20 • *Guevara v. J&K Culver, LLC, et al..* Case No. 19STCV39951, California Superior Court,

21 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding.

22 • *Hamilton v. Michael Kors Stores, Inc. et al.,* Case No. 19STCV37061, California

23 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding.

24 • *Arzooian v. A&M Administration, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV05576, California

25 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding.

26 • *Santos, et al. v. Maruzen of America, Inc.,* Case No. 19STCV37662, California

27 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding.

28 • *Schaffino v. M.O. Dion & Sons., Inc., et al.,* Case No. 20STCV38023, California

1 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Gail Killefer presiding.

2 • *Moreno v. Santa Paula Post Acute, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV12533, California

3 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding.

4 • *Singer v. Desert Area Resources and Training*, Case No. BCV-21-101093, California

5 Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Thomas S. Clark presiding.

6 • *Clarizio v. Guard-Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV28667, California Superior Court,

7 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Armen Tamzarian presiding.

8 • *Guzman v. Freschco Painters, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV04683, California Superior

9 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding.

10 • *Koutny v. PAE Aviation and Technical Services, LLC*, Case No. 21C-0106, California

11 Superior Court, County of Kings, Honorable Melissa R. D’Morias presiding

12 • *Rodriguez v. Pacifica Trucks, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV37576, California Superior

13 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding.

14 • *Ramos v. AEGIS Treatment Centers, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV41429, California

15 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding.

16 • *Valdez v. Integrated Building Services, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV37793, California

17 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding.

18 9. I have also settled matters on a “PAGA Only” basis for aggrieved employees in the

19 past, including in:

20 • *Flores v. Delta Apparel, Inc.*, Case No. BC641499, California Superior Court, County

21 of Los Angeles, Honorable Daniel J. Buckley, presiding.

22 • *Segura v. CJ Foods Service Holdings USA, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV24918, California

23 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maureen Duffy-Lewis, presiding.

24 • *Sierra v. Nexem-Allied, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV11281, California Superior Court,

25 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Randolph M. Hammock, presiding.

26 • *Nodal v. Sodexo, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV40601, California Superior Court, County of

27 Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff, presiding.

28 • *Cooper v. Lucas Health Partners*, Case No. 20STCV20050, California Superior Court,

1 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding.

2 • *Herrera v. Greystar Management, LP, et al.*, Case No. 37-2020-00009672-CU-OE-CTL,
3 California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Carolyn Caietti, presiding.

4 • *Slater v. Jo-Ann Stores, LLC.*, Case No. 21STCV18454, California Superior Court,
5 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maurice A. Leiter, presiding;

6 • *Bolanos v. Canoga Park Heating & Air Conditioning, Co., Inc.*, Case No.
7 21STCV12674, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yolanda Orozco,
8 presiding.

9 • *Granados v. Cosmetic Ideas, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV10797, California Superior Court,
10 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Richard L. Fruin, presiding.

11 • *Ruano v. DPC Woodwork, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV00408, California Superior Court,
12 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Jon R. Takasugi presiding.

13 • *Tarin v. TPS Solutions, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV07844, California Superior Court,
14 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren E. Nelson presiding.

15 10. Currently, my firm is acting as counsel in tens of wage and hour class actions and
16 representative PAGA actions.

17 11. After a thorough investigation and settlement discussions, my office arrived at
18 terms that we viewed was in the best interest of both the class members and the parties.

19 12. Should the Court refuse to grant preliminary approval of this Settlement, many of
20 the Class Members may be denied any recourse for defendant's alleged violations.

21 13. For these reasons, as well as the reasons provided in the Declaration of David Spivak,
22 I believe that my office is sufficiently experienced and qualified to evaluate the class members'
23 claims and viability of defendant's defenses.

24 14. I believe, and as further set out in the Declaration of David Spivak, the settlement
25 presented here only resulted after having engaged in extensive informal and formal discovery and
26 investigation, and is the product of hard-fought litigation and extensive arm's-length negotiations.

27 15. I believe, based on my experience as class counsel, that the Settlement is fair,
28 reasonable, adequate and in the best interests of class members.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Plaintiff

16. I believe Plaintiff was employed by defendants Elite Diners, LLC, Elite Devco, LLC, Elite Sports Bar Group, LLC, SoCal Diners, LLC, and Elite Business Enterprises, Inc. (collectively, “Defendants”) in California as a non-exempt employee, with duties that included, but were not limited to, file management, posting payments, answering phones, and taking payments, from about June 2018 until June 2020.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the state of California that the foregoing is true and correct this February 26, 2026, at Los Angeles, California.

/s/ David D. Bibiyan

David D. Bibiyan