

1 Brian J. Mankin, Esq. [CSB No. 216228]
brian@lmlfirm.com
2 Misty M. Lauby, Esq. [CSB No. 243009]
misty@lmlfirm.com
3 LAUBY, MANKIN & LAUBY, LLP
5198 Arlington Avenue, PMB 513
4 Riverside, CA 92504
Tel: (951) 320-1444 | Fax: (951) 320-1445

5 Attorneys for Plaintiff Andrew Zubia, on behalf of others similarly situated
6 *[Additional Counsel on following page]*
7

8 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
9 FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

10 ANDREW ZUBIA, DANA MARIE GANAL,
11 CHRISTIAN HERNANDEZ, and MICHAEL
12 WOODS individually, on a representative
situated;

13 Plaintiffs,

14 vs.

15 PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY, an Ohio
16 Corporation; PROCTER & GAMBLE
17 DISTRIBUTING LLC, and Ohio Company;
and DOES 1 through 20, inclusive;

18 Defendants.

Case No.: 20STCV44506
*[Assigned to Hon. Lawrence P. Riff, Dept. 7,
for all purposes]*

**DECLARATION OF MICHAEL
MOORE OF BEHALF OF PHOENIX
SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATORS
IN SUPPORT OF CLASS AND PAGA
SETTLEMENT**

Complaint filed: November 18, 2020

1 Kane Moon, Esq. (SBN 249834)
2 kane.moon@moonyanglaw.com
3 Allen Feghali, Esq. (SBN 301080)
4 allen.feghali@moonyanglaw.com
5 Edwin Kamazarian, Esq. (SBN 32780)
6 edwin.kamazarian@moonyanglaw.com
7 MOON & YANG, APC
8 1055 W Seventh Street, Suite 1880
9 Los Angeles, CA 90017
10 Telephone: (213) 232-3128 | Fax: (213) 232-3125

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff Dana Marie Ganal, on behalf of others similarly situated

12 Joseph Lavi, Esq. (SBN 209776)
13 jlavi@lelawfirm.com
14 Vincent C. Granberry, Esq. (SBN 276483)
15 vgranberry@lelawfirm.com
16 Kevin Joseph Farnan, Esq. (SBN 327524)
17 kfarnan@lelawfirm.com LAVI & EBRAHIMIAN, LLP
18 8889 W. Olympic Blvd., Suite 200
19 Beverly Hills, CA 90211
20 Telephone: (310) 432-0000 | Facsimile: (310) 432-0001

21 Attorneys for Plaintiff, Christian Hernandez, on behalf of others similarly situated

22 Carolyn H. Cottrell (SBN 166977)
23 ccottrell@schneiderwallace.com
24 Ori Edelstein (SBN 268145)
25 oredelstein@schneiderwallace.com
26 Andrew D. Weaver (SBN 318935)
27 aweaver@schneiderwallace.com
28 SCHNEIDER WALLACE COTTRELL KONECKY LLP
2000 Powell Street, Suite 1400
Emeryville, CA 94608
Tel: (415) 421-7100 | Fax: (415) 421-7105

Attorneys for Plaintiff, Michael Woods, on behalf of others similarly situated

1 I, Michael Moore, declare as follows:

2 1. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein and if called upon to
3 testify, I could and would do so competently under oath.

4 2. I am employed by Phoenix Settlement Administrators ("PSA"), as CEO and
5 Managing Partner.

6 3. I personally have over "13" years of experience in claims management and
7 administration of class and collective action matters.

8 4. PSA is an S Corporation, owned by its Employees, and has no professional or
9 financial affiliation with any of the parties involved, including class members, in this matter of
10 Zubia v. Procter & Gamble case.

11 5. PSA has extensive experience administering class action matters. PSA has
12 administered complex wage and hour, labor and employment, consumer/ product liability, TCPA,
13 FLSA, FACTA, ERISA and PAGA class action matters, thru final approval and distribution. PSA
14 has developed a system of quality assurance measures, to ensure the highest quality service is
15 provided in our cases and to class members.

16 6. PSA's Claims Management Group has extensive experiences in all aspects of
17 Notification and Identification of Class Members, Claims Processing, Formulation and Calculation
18 Methodologies, Award Distribution and Taxation, Accounting and Reconciliation.

19 7. PSA has extensive experience in and are experts at all aspects of administering
20 complex class action matters including; (i) preparing, printing, mailing and tracking privacy
21 notices; (ii) operation of a 24/7/365 multi-lingual call center; (iii) establishing settlement websites;
22 (iv) claims management; (v) USPS processes and systems, third party tracing, including the use of
23 reverse telephone directory services; (vi) database management, programming and security
24 protocols; (vii) calculating and issuing settlement payments; (viii) tax management, filings, and
25 account reconciliation; and (ix) final approval.

26 8. As part of Settlement Notice procedures, PSA will run the names of all Settlement
27 Class Members through the National Change of Address ("NCOA") database to determine any
28 updated addresses for Settlement Class Members. If a Class Notice Packet from the initial notice

1
2 mailing is returned as undeliverable, the Settlement Administrator will attempt to obtain a current
3 address for the Settlement Class Member to whom the returned Class Notice Packet had been
4 mailed by undertaking skip tracing. If the Settlement Administrator is successful in obtaining a new
5 address, it will promptly re-mail the Class Notice Packet to the Settlement Class Member. Further,
6 any Class Notice Packets that are returned to the Settlement Administrator with a forwarding
7 address before the Response Deadline shall be promptly re-mailed to the forwarding address affixed
8 thereto.

9 9. PSA has been appointed as a Settlement Administrator in both State and Federal
10 Courts.

11 10. A true and correct copy of PSA's Curriculum Vitae is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

12 11. Phoenix Settlement Administrators has adequate procedure in place to safeguard the
13 data and funds to be entrusted to it. PSA's Technology and Banking groups are directly involved
14 with Management on all issues of Information Security and Settlement Fund transfer, as it pertains
15 to the continuance of business processes, and all risk, vulnerability, security and assessments as it
16 pertains to information. The group, along with internal systems in place, monitor and communicate
17 with Management on a Preventative and comprehensive level, in order to prevent potential Strategic
18 or Compliance Risks. All processing of confidential and personal information is handled and
19 maintained within the organization and therefore all data received is kept within a strict chain of
20 custody internally. All informational assets are classified and assigned based on initial case
21 assessment, client and procedural requirements. The Technology Group handles all higher-level
22 ownership of information and physical peripherals, as well as ownership of direct / indirect assets
23 associated with technology and the continuance of business, Specific Users, Groups or Entities are
24 assigned Shared Ownership or Management Capability based on procedural needs, and security
25 level granted.

26 12. In addition to high levels of Data Center Policies/Procedures and
27 Facility/Maintenance Security Protocols, PSA's conducts semiannual training to maintain
28 additional safeguards such as:

- 1 a. Phoenix Settlement Administration Business Continuity Policy
- 2 b. Phoenix Settlement Administration Disaster Recovery Plan
- 3 c. Phoenix Settlement Administration Incident Response Plan
- 4 d. Phoenix Settlement Administration Personal Computer Security Policy
- 5 e. Phoenix Settlement Administration Phoenix Data Archiving and Retention Policy
- 6 f. Phoenix Settlement Administration Phoenix Personnel Security Policy
- 7 g. Phoenix Settlement Administration Risk Assessment
- 8 h. Phoenix Settlement Administration Service Provider Risk Assessment
- 9 i. Phoenix Settlement Administrator Classification and Access Rights Policy
- 10 j. Phoenix Settlement Administrator Password Policy
- 11 k. Phoenix Settlement Administrators Certification of Destruction
- 12 l. Phoenix Settlement Administrators Security Awareness Training Program.
- 13
- 14 13. PSA currently maintains both an errors and omissions insurance policy and a
- 15 separate data breach insurance policy, with coverages of \$2 million and \$3 million
- 16 respectively and with each policy providing coverage on an occurrence basis.
- 17 14. PSA costs are reasonable and competitive when compared to the industry.
- 18 15. PSA only employs a certified and/or qualified translator to translate Court-
- 19 approved Notices for postings on PSA's website for dissemination to the Class.
- 20 16. To complete the Settlement Administration for the Zubia v. Procter & Gamble case,
- 21 the Settlement Administration will include hard cost and hourly costs detailed below:
- 22 • Hard Cost: Postage, Printing Supplies, Toll Free Setup, QSF Bank Setup, NCOA,
- 23 Skip Tracing, Re-Mail and Translation costs.
- 24 • Hourly Cost: The hourly rates include Programming Database & Setup, Project
- 25 Management, Notice Packet Formatting, Programming Undeliverable, Programming Claims
- 26 Database, Programming Calculations, Disbursement Review, Printing of Notice & Checks,
- 27
- 28

1 Reconcile Uncashed Checks, Conclusion Reports, Potential Tax Filing and Case
2 Management/Maintenance.

3 17. Having factored in the hard and hourly cost, the settlement administration for this
4 project has a Will Not Exceed Fee of \$13,000.00. A detailed breakdown of PSA's cost is attached
5 hereto as Exhibit B.

6 18. Phoenix Class Action Administrators is an S Corporation owned by its Employees
7 and has no professional affiliation with any of the parties involved in this matter.

8
9 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States and state of California
10 that the foregoing is true and correct.

11 Executed on February 14, 2023, at Orange, California.

12
13
14 A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Michael E. Moore", is written over a horizontal line.

15 Michael E. Moore
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Exhibit A



CLASS ACTION ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

1411 N. Batavia Street, Suite 105, Orange, CA 92867

800.523.5773

www.phoenixclassaction.com

CURRICULUM VITAE

Phoenix, Class Action Administrators, PSA Overview

Phoenix Settlement Administrators, PSA, is an emerging, National, Class Action Notification and Claims Administration firm, located in Orange County, California. PSA's core competencies ensure delivery of the highest quality and accuracy to its Clients and Class members. With a combined 22 years of expert experience, PSA's Managing Partners, Case Supervisors, Managers and Associates, Data Programming, and Certified Secure Strategic Partners possess all the qualities that our Clients expect throughout the Noticing and Administration process to Final Approval. It is our Value Pricing, Efficiency, Experience, Consultative Expertise and Delivery, that has perpetuated PSA, as an emerging leader in Class Action Settlement Administration. Expert PSA staff members are currently managing, Consumer and Product Liability, TCPA, Complex Labor & Employment, FLSA, ERISA and PAGA cases.

PSA has over 100 Attorney & Law Firm Clients, which have entrusted us with the management of their claims administration, because of the "Boutique" attention every case receives. PSA is value driven on all size cases. Large or small, cases receive expert management, secure data custody, neutral communication and a dedicated team. This seamless process maintains superior case continuity to ensure our clients receive timely final approval and conclusion to their actions. Phoenix Settlement Administrators implements its successful C.A.S.E. solutions on all our class action matters.

With tens of Millions of dollars in award distributions currently under management since our inception, PSA has the ability and strengths to manage all levels of Complex Cases. PSA's Staff "Synergy" is our greatest attribute. It allows our people to work closely together and solve our client's case issues. PSA prides itself as a true "Third Party Administrator" and holds Neutrality and Service as a mantra. Because of this approach, both Defense and Plaintiff Clients, experience fairness, trust and confidence in us, and allows for continued business from both parties. PSA has been appointed Third Party Administrator in State and Federal Courts.

We look forward to working with you on your next Class Action Noticing Campaign or Claims Administration. Let us design a C.A.S.E. solution, which will allow us to showcase the difference you'll experience. Superior Service, Class Savings Value Pricing and Timely Outcomes is why our clients come back to PSA.



Expert Core Services

Initial Planning and Consultative Service on Class Action Cases and Noticing Plans.

State/Nationwide Noticing Expertise: Privacy, Media, Publication, Internet & Email Campaigns.

Attorney General(s) CAFA Notification

Claims Programming, Administration, Processing and Reporting.

24/7/365 Multi-Lingual Call Center Support and Claims Processing

Secure Data Management Environment, Individual Firewalls, Encrypted Data and Storage

Settlement Fund Calculations, Solutions, Award Distribution, Award Reconciliation

Tax Filings: State, Federal, EDD, ETT, FUTA, PAGA Payments

Partial PSA Client List, Defense and Plaintiff

Fisher & Phillips
Gordon & Rees
Paul Plevin Sullivan & Connaughton
Call & Jensen
Seyfarth Shaw
McKenna Long & Aldridge
Greenberg Traurig
Manning & Kass
Littler Mendelson
Perkins Coie
Orrick Herrington & Sutcliffe
Ogletree Deakins Nash Smoak & Stewart
Perkins Coie
Ulwelling Siddiqui
Winston & Strawn
Sheppard Mullins
Lewis Brisbois Bisgaard & Smith
Morgan Lewis & Bockius
Paul Hastings
Snell & Wilmer
Sidley Austin
Higgs Fletcher & Mack
Jackson Lewis
Norton Rose Fulbright

The Arns Law Firm
Work Lawyers, PC
Mahoney Law Group
Law Office of Thomas Rutledge
Lawyers for Justice PC
Remedy Law Group
Rastegar Law Group
Diversity Law Group
Righetti & Glugoski
Cohelan, Khoury & Singer
Moon & Yang, APC
Moss & Moss
The Spivak Law Firm
Law Offices of Kenneth Yoon
Paul Haines Law Group
Kearney Littlefield, LLP
Mallison & Martinez
Jackson, APC
David Yeremian & Associates
Aegis Law Firm
Lauby, Mankin & Lauby, APC
Jones Law Firm
Short Legal, APC
Levine Law Group, APC

Exhibit B



February 2, 2023

Case: Zubia v. P&G, Opt-Out Administration

Phoenix Contact: Michael E. Moore
 Contact Number: 949.331.0131
 Email: mike@phoenixclassaction.com

CASE ASSUMPTIONS

Class Members	900
Opt Out Rate	1%
Opt Outs Received	9
Total Class Claimants	891
Subtotal Admin Only	\$13,487.41

Flat Fee Total \$13,000.00

For 900 Class Members

Pricing Good for Scope of Estimate Only

All Aspects of Escheating to the State of CA Included

Spanish Translation, Printing & Mailing Included

Assumptions and Estimate are based on information provided by counsel. If class size changes, PSA will need to adjust this Estimate accordingly. Estimate is based on **900** Class Members. PSA assumes class data will be sent in Microsoft Excel or other usable format with no or reasonable additional formatting needed. A rate of \$150 per hour will be charged for any additional analysis or programming.

Case & Database Setup / Toll Free Setup & Call Center / NCOA (USPS)

Administrative Tasks:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Programming Manager	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
Programming Database & Setup	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
Toll Free Setup*	\$150.00	1	\$150.00
Call Center & Long Distance	\$2.00	120	\$240.00
NCOA (USPS)	\$225.00	1	\$225.00
Total			\$1,015.00

* Up to 120 days after disbursement

Data Merger & Scrub / Notice Packet, Opt-Out Form & Postage / Spanish Translation / Website

Project Action	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Notice Packet Formatting	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
Spanish Translation	\$800.00	1	\$800.00
Data Merge & Duplication Scrub	\$0.10	900	\$90.00
Notice Packet & Opt-Out Form	\$1.30	900	\$1,170.00
Estimated Postage (up to 2 oz.)*	\$0.78	900	\$702.00
Static Website	\$100.00	1	\$100.00
Check Cashing Reminder Postcard Postage Included	\$0.60	187	\$112.27
Total			\$3,174.27

* Prices good for 90 days. Subject to change with the USPS Rate or change in Notice pages or Translation, if any.



PHOENIX

CLASS ACTION ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

Skip Tracing & Remailing Notice Packets / Tracking & Programming Undeliverables

Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item	Estimate
Case Associate	\$55.00	4		\$220.00
Skip Tracing Undeliverables	\$0.85	225		\$191.25
Remail Notice Packets	\$0.75	222		\$166.50
Estimated Postage	\$0.84	222		\$186.48
Programming Undeliverables	\$50.00	1		\$50.00
			Total	\$814.23

Database Programming / Processing Opt-Outs, Deficiencies or Disputes

Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item	Estimate
Programming Claims Database	\$150.00	2		\$300.00
Non Opt-Out Processing	\$200.00	1		\$200.00
Case Associate	\$55.00	5		\$275.00
Opt-Outs/Deficiency/Dispute Letters	\$10.00	15		\$150.00
Case Manager	\$85.00	4		\$340.00
			Total	\$1,265.00

Calculation & Disbursement Programming/ Create & Manage QSF/ Mail Checks

Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item	Estimate
Programming Calculations	\$135.00	2		\$270.00
Disbursement Review	\$135.00	2		\$270.00
Programming Manager	\$95.00	1		\$95.00
QSF Bank Account & EIN	\$135.00	1		\$135.00
Check Run Setup & Printing	\$135.00	10		\$1,350.00
Mail Class Checks *	\$0.90	891		\$801.90
Estimated Postage	\$0.61	891		\$543.51
			Total	\$3,465.41

* Checks are printed on 8.5 x 11 in. sheets with W2/1099 Tax Filing



PHOENIX

CLASS ACTION ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

Tax Reporting & Reconciliation / Re-Issuance of Checks / Conclusion Reports and Declarations				
Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item	Estimate
Case Supervisor	\$115.00	3		\$345.00
Remail Checks & Tax Forms (Postage Included)	\$1.70	205		\$348.50
Case Associate	\$55.00	4		\$220.00
Reconcile Uncashed Checks	\$85.00	6		\$510.00
Conclusion Reports	\$115.00	3		\$345.00
Case Manager Conclusion	\$85.00	4		\$340.00
Final Reporting & Declarations	\$115.00	3		\$345.00
IRS & QSF Annual Tax Reporting * (1 State Tax Reporting Included)	\$1,000.00	1		\$1,000.00
Check to Cy-Pres	\$150.00	1		Included
Uncashed Checks to the State of California Controllers Office	\$300.00	1		\$300.00
Estimated <u>19</u> Total Class Members				
Total				\$3,753.50

* All applicable California State & Federal taxes, which include SUI, ETT, and SDI, and FUTA filings. Additional taxes are Defendant's responsibility.

Estimate Total: \$13,487.41



PHOENIX

CLASS ACTION ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

TERMS AND CONDITIONS

Provisions: The case estimate is in good faith and does not cover any applicable taxes and fees. The estimate does not make any provision for any services or class size not delineated in the request for proposal or stipulations. Proposal rates and amounts are subject to change upon further review, with Counsel/Client, of the Settlement Agreement. Only pre-approved changes will be charged when applicable. No modifications may be made to this estimate without the approval of PSA (Phoenix Settlement Administrators). All notifications are mailed in English language only unless otherwise specified. Additional costs will apply if translation into other language(s) is required. Rates to prepare and file taxes are for Federal and California State taxes only. Additional charges will apply if multiple state tax filing(s) is required. **Pricing is good for ninety (90) days.**

Data Conversion and Mailing: The proposal assumes that data provided will be in ready-to-use condition and that all data is provided in a single, comprehensive Excel spreadsheet. PSA cannot be liable for any errors or omissions arising due to additional work required for analyzing and processing the original database. A minimum of two (2) business days is required for processing prior to the anticipated mailing date with an additional two (2) business days for a National Change of Address (NCOA) update. Additional time may be required depending on the class size, necessary translation of the documents, or other factors. PSA will keep counsel apprised of the estimated mailing date.

Claims: PSA's general policy is to not accept claims via facsimile. However, in the event that facsimile filing of claims must be accepted, PSA will not be held responsible for any issues and/or errors arising out of said filing. Furthermore, PSA will require disclaimer language regarding facsimile transmissions. PSA will not be responsible for any acts or omissions caused by the USPS. PSA shall not make payments to any claimants without verified, valid Social Security Numbers. All responses and class member information are held in strict confidentiality. Additional class members are \$10.00 per opt-out.

Payment Terms: All postage charges and 50% of the final administration charges are due at the commencement of the case and will be billed immediately upon receipt of the data and/or notice documents. PSA bills are due upon receipt unless otherwise negotiated and agreed to with PSA by Counsel/Client. In the event the settlement terms provide that PSA is to be paid out of the settlement fund, PSA will request that Counsel/Client endeavor to make alternate payment arrangements for PSA charges that are due at the onset of the case. The entire remaining balance is due and payable at the time the settlement account is funded by Defendant, or no later than the time of disbursement. Amounts not paid within thirty (30) days are subject to a service charge of 1.5% per month or the highest rate permitted by law.

Tax Reporting Requirements

PSA will file the necessary tax returns under the EIN of the QSF, including federal and state returns. Payroll tax returns will be filed if necessary. Under the California Employment Development Department, all taxes are to be reported under the EIN of the QSF with the exception of the following taxes: Unemployment Insurance (UI) and Employment Training Tax (ETT), employer-side taxes, and State Disability Insurance (SDI), an employee-side tax. These are reported under Defendant's EIN. Therefore, to comply with the EDD payroll tax filing requirements we will need the following information:

1. Defendant's California State ID and Federal EIN.
2. Defendant's current State Unemployment Insurance (UI) rate and Employment Training Tax (ETT) rate. This information can be found in the current year DE 2088, Notice of Contribution Rates, issued by the EDD.
3. Termination dates of the class members, or identification of current employee class members, so we can account for the periods that the wages relate to for each class member.
4. An executed Power of Attorney (Form DE 48) from Defendant. This form is needed so that we may report the UI, SDI, and ETT taxes under Defendant's EIN on their behalf. If this form is not provided we will work with the EDD auditors to transfer the tax payments to Defendant's EIN.
5. Defendant is responsible for reporting the SDI portion of the settlement payments on the class member's W-2. PSA will file these forms on Defendant's behalf for an additional fee and will issue an additional W-2 for each class member under Defendant's EIN, as SDI is reported under Defendant's EIN rather than the EIN of the QSF. The Power of Attorney (Form DE 48) will be needed in order for PSA to report SDI payments.