

SULLIVAN & YAECKEL LAW GROUP, APC

Eric K. Yaeckel (yaeckel@sullivanlawgroupapc.com)

Ryan T. Kuhn (ryan@sullivanlawgroupapc.com)

2330 Third Avenue, San Diego, CA 92101

Telephone: (619) 702-6761

COLBY LAW FIRM, PC

Aaron Colby (aaron@colbylegal.com)

Zoe Yuzna (zoe@colbylegal.com)

13263 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 203, Studio City, CA 91604

Telephone: (818) 253-1599

BIBIYAN LAW GROUP, P.C.

David D. Bibiyan (david@tomorrowlaw.com)

Jeffrey D. Klein (jeff@tomorrowlaw.com)

Matthew Carraher (matthew@tomorrowlaw.com)

1460 Westwood Boulevard, Los Angeles, California 90024

Telephone: (310) 438-5555

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

COUNTY OF IMPERIAL

PRISCILLA LOPEZ,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

GEO SECURE SERVICES, LLC, a Florida
Limited Liability Company; and DOES 1-10,
inclusive,

Defendants.

AND ALL CONSOLIDATED LITIGATIONS

Case No. ECU002060

**DECLARATION OF DAVID D.
BIBIYAN**

HEARING INFO

Date: May 9, 2024

Time: 8:30 a.m.

Judge: Hon. Jeffrey B. Jones

Dept.: 7

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

1. On or around December 20, 2021, Plaintiff filed with the Labor and Workforce Development Agency (“LWDA”) and served on defendants The GEO Group, Inc., GEO Secure Services, LLC, and Tonya Andrews (“Defendants” and collectively with Plaintiff, the “Parties”) a notice under Labor Code section 2699.3 (the “PAGA Notice”) stating Plaintiff intended to serve as a proxy of the LWDA to recover civil penalties for Aggrieved Employees for failure to comply with various Labor Code sections.

1. On or around December 20, 2021, Plaintiff filed with the Labor and Workforce Development Agency (“LWDA”) and served on defendants The GEO Group, Inc., GEO Secure Services, LLC, and Tonya Andrews (“Defendants” and collectively with Plaintiff, the “Parties”) a notice under Labor Code section 2699.3 (the “PAGA Notice”) stating Plaintiff intended to serve as a proxy of the LWDA to recover civil penalties for Aggrieved Employees for failure to comply with various Labor Code sections.

3. On or around October 20, 2021, Plaintiff filed a class action complaint in the Superior Court of California for the County of Kern, Case Number BCV-21-102469, alleging causes of action against Defendants for: (1) failure to pay overtime wages; (2) failure to pay minimum wages; (3) failure to provide meal periods; (4) failure to provide rest periods (5) waiting time penalties; (6) wage statements violations; (7) failure to indemnify; and (8) unfair competition (“Ortiz Class Action”).

/ / /

1 5. After Plaintiff filed the Ortiz PAGA Action, Defense Counsel informed Counsel
2 for Plaintiff of the existence of a settlement agreement and release in the matter of *Samantha*
3 *Garrett-Cain et al. v. The GEO Group, Inc., et al.*, Orange County Superior Court Case No.: 37-
4 2020-00008291-CU-OE-CTL. Defense Counsel conveyed to Plaintiff's Counsel its position that
5 this settlement agreement released Defendants from liability for a variety of wage-and-hour
6 violations as to non-exempt employees of Defendants in California in time up to and including
7 April 11, 2020. Defense Counsel additionally informed Counsel for Plaintiff of the existence of
8 several other individual plaintiffs who had recently filed civil complaints in California seeking
9 recovery on a class-wide basis against Defendants for the same or similar alleged violations of the
10 California Labor Code and related statutes.

11 6. On or around August 18, 2022, the Parties, including the other individual plaintiffs
12 and their counsel, participated in an all-day mediation presided over by Deborah Saxe, Esq., a
13 well-regarded mediator experienced in mediating complex labor and employment matters, but did
14 not reach a settlement.

15 7. On or around August 1, 2023, the Parties participated in an all-day mediation
16 presided over by Katherine Edwards, Esq., a well-regarded mediator experienced in mediating
17 complex labor and employment matters, which led to settlement of the actions against Defendants.

18 8. Prior to the August 1, 2023 mediation, Plaintiff's counsel obtained, through
19 informal discovery: (1) time and payroll records for the estimated 2,172 Class Members during
20 the period from April 11, 2020 through the date of mediation ("Class Period"); (2) data points,
21 including average rates of pay total hours worked during the Class Period; (3) the number of pay
22 periods worked during the Class Period; (4) the number of terminated/separated Class Members
23 eligible for waiting time penalties and their dates of separation/termination; (5) the number of
24 workweeks worked by specified Class Members ("Aggrieved Employees") during the period from
25 April 24, 2020 through the date of mediation ("PAGA Period"); (6) the number of former
26 Aggrieved Employees; (7) the number of pay periods in the Wage Statement/PAGA Period; (8)
27 policy documents purporting to reflect Defendants' relevant policies and practices in effect during
28 the Class Period; (9) Defendants' definition of a workweek and work day; (10) a list of all

1 locations in California where Defendants employed Class Members during the Class Period; (11)
2 the number of clock-in stations available to Class Members during the Class Period; (12) a list of
3 job titles held by Class Members during the Class Period, as well as written descriptions of each;
4 and (13) Plaintiff's personal employment files maintained by Defendants.

5 9. As part of the settlement agreement, the Parties, including the other individual
6 plaintiffs, agreed to the filing of an amended complaint in this instant action, entitled *Lopez v.*
7 *GEO Secure Services, LLC*, Imperial County Superior Court, Case No. ECU002060, adding,
8 among others, the factual allegations and causes of action in the Ortiz Class Action and Ortiz
9 PAGA Action to this action and adding Plaintiff Ortiz as a named plaintiff, then dismissing the
10 Ortiz Class Action and Ortiz PAGA Action without prejudice, effectively consolidating the
11 actions into one.

12 10. The amended complaint was filed in this action on January 23, 2024.

13 11. The Ortiz Class Action was dismissed without prejudice on February 26, 2024.

14 12. The Ortiz PAGA Action was dismissed without prejudice on February 27, 2024.

15 **Adequacy of Class Counsel**

16 13. I am an experienced class action attorney, have been appointed as class counsel in
17 other class actions, and have a successful track record in litigating class actions.

18 14. I graduated with a Bachelor of Arts degree from the University of California, Los
19 Angeles in 2009.

20 15. I received my Juris Doctorate from The University of Chicago Law School in 2012.

21 16. After practicing for several years as a member of Cohen & Lord, P.C., practicing
22 in an amorphous range of civil litigation on behalf of both plaintiffs and defendants, I opened up
23 a law firm in 2014 with a concentration in representation of employees against employers to
24 recover unpaid wages and vindicate harassment, discrimination and retaliation in various contexts.

25 17. I am an active member of the California Employment Lawyers' Association
26 ("CELA"), one of only a few members of its Reverse Auctions Subcommittee and serve as a
27 mediator between other plaintiffs' counsel who bring overlapping class actions. I have also
28 attended various Continuing Legal Education courses pertaining to advocacy on behalf of

1 employees.

2 18. In fact, I recently created the content for, helped organize, and served as the
3 Moderator for the 2023 California Complex Symposium Wage and Hour/PAGA Section, a
4 Continuing Legal Education seminar and forum featuring four respected Judges serving in the
5 Complex Divisions of their respective county Superior Courts. In addition, my firm served as a
6 sponsor of that event.

7 19. Not only have I practiced almost exclusively in this field for years and have
8 contributed to the legal education curriculum for attorneys practicing within it, I am also a
9 published author in the Daily Journal as a contributor in the Wage and Hour and PAGA context,
10 including, in December 15, 2023, an article entitled: “PAGA: What’s Gone, What’s Left and
11 What’s Next.” I have also been a quoted source in multiple other publications, including in article
12 pushed by Bloomberg Law dated November 1, 2023 entitled: “Adidas, Home Depot Sued in Test
13 Cases on Job Ad Pay Transparency.”

14 20. My firm has the experience, resources, and means necessary to allow us to provide
15 adequate representation as Class Counsel to all class members in this litigation.

16 21. I have filed contested motions for class certification in the past and have been
17 appointed Class Counsel by the Superior Court of California in the past for purposes of certifying
18 a class. Some examples of Actions in which I was appointed Class Counsel include:

19 • *Santoyo v. Consolidated Foundries, Inc.*, Case No. BC612298, California Superior
20 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Ann I. Jones, presiding;

21 • *Arendorff v. Stanley Steamer International, Inc.*, Case No. BC681368, California
22 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos, presiding;

23 • *Barreto v. Don Roberto Jewelers, Inc.*, Case No. BC495451, California Superior Court,
24 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

25 • *Junior Amilcar Laguna Gonzalez v. Takaaki Koyama*, Case No. BC641998, Los Angeles
26 Superior Court, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;

27 • *Rios v. Nongshim America, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1807390, California Superior Court,
28 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

1 • *Stoddard v. Molded Fiber Glass – West*, Case No. 1517758, California Superior Court,
2 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;
3 • *Mata v. Sahara Scaffold, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1810785, California Superior Court,
4 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;
5 • *Carrasco v. Pure Dental Solutions*, Case No. BC645995, Los Angeles Superior Court,
6 Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman, presiding;
7 • *Gonzalez v. Gochez, et al.*, Case No. BC648729, Los Angeles Superior Court, Honorable
8 Maren Nelson, presiding;
9 • *Montoya v. Superior Paving Co.*, Case No. CIVDS1833422, County of San Bernardino,
10 Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;
11 • *Lopez v. Norred & Associates, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1824109, California Superior
12 Court, County of San Bernardino, David S. Cohn, presiding;
13 • *Noyola v. Lacren, LLC*, Case No. BC717024, California Superior Court, County of Los
14 Angeles, Hon. Anthony Mohr, presiding;
15 • *Luciano, et al. v. O’Tasty Foods, Inc., et al.*, Case No. BC711988, California Superior
16 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;
17 • *Gordon v. Hospice Source, LLC*, Case No. 34-2018-00250022-CU-OE-GDS, California
18 Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Christopher E. Krueger, presiding;
19 • *Barragan v. Refrigeration Supplies Distributor*, Case No. 19STCV09312, California
20 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;
21 • *Ramirez v. Acre Gourmet, Inc.*, Case No. CGC-19-575117, California Superior Court,
22 County of San Francisco, Honorable Andrew Y.S. Cheng, presiding;
23 • *Villafuerte v. Bay Alarm Company*, Case No. BC689110, California Superior Court,
24 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;
25 • *Cazares v. Areas USA LAX, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
26 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;
27 • *Magana v. Castlerock Environmental, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 19STCV38353, California
28 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

1 • *Chilel v. Sushi California, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
2 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;
3 • *Malone v. Orange Courier, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 30-2016-00763474, California Superior
4 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Glenda Sanders, presiding;
5 • *Rivera v. Talamo Food Services, Inc.*, Case No. 19CV355856, California Superior Court,
6 County of Santa Clara, Honorable Patricia M. Lucas, presiding;
7 • *Olguin v. Cal Central Harvesting, Inc.*, Case No. 18CV03860, California Superior Court,
8 County of Santa Barbara, Honorable James F. Rigali, presiding;
9 • *Pence v. Sober Living by the Sea, Inc.*, Case No. 2018-00988742, California Superior
10 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman, presiding;
11 • *Franco v. Vincent Rags, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV07768, California Superior Court,
12 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;
13 • *Cabral v. Miller Castings, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
14 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;
15 • *Bolanos v. Texas Roadhouse, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
16 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Sunshine Sykes, presiding;
17 • *Rodriguez v. Scott A. Humphreys, Inc.*, Case No. 30-2021-01184556-CU-OE-CXC,
18 California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Matthew P. Guasco, presiding; and
19 • *Torres v. Primal Pet Foods, Inc.* Case No. FCS054783, California Superior Court,
20 County of Solano, Honorable Wendy G. Getty, presiding;
21 • *Hanson v. Zapata Nuccio, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV28951, California Superior Court,
22 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
23 • *Molina v. Avibank Mfg, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV03910, California Superior Court,
24 County of Los Angeles, Honorable John P. Doyle, presiding;
25 • *Cetina v. Lawry's Restaurants, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV05201, California Superior Court,
26 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;
27 • *Luna v. Pronto California General Agency, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV39951, California
28 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;

- 1 • *Alvarez v. Kazak-Mars, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV42587, California Superior Court,
2 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
- 3 • *Noe v. My Pillow, Inc.* Case No. CIVDS 2011360, California Superior Court, County of
4 San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;
- 5 • *Nunez v. 2751 West Coast Acquisition Company*, Case No. 30-2020-01145215-CU-
6 OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman,
7 Presiding;
- 8 • *Smith v. McMillen Enterprises, Inc.*, Case No. CV-20-002938, California Superior Court,
9 County of Stanislaus, Honorable John R. Mayne, presiding;
- 10 • *Turner v. Plant Prefab Inc., et al.*, Case No. CIVDS2017517, California Superior Court,
11 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;
- 12 • *Duran v. Fresh Select, LLC*, Case No. VCU284892, California Superior Court, County
13 of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;
- 14 • *Reynoso, et al. v. Cream of the Crop AG Service, Inc.*, Case No. VCU278847, California
15 Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;
- 16 • *Michel v. Universal Waste Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV46181, California Superior
17 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding;
- 18 • *Jungers v. U.S. Borax Inc., et al.*, Case No. BCV-21-10003, California Superior Court,
19 County of Kern, Honorable Bernard C. Barmann Jr. presiding;
- 20 • *Fortune v. Amoroso Limited Partnership, et al.*, Case No. 20STCV25874, California
21 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;
- 22 • *Montoya, et al. v. Remo, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV34614, California Superior Court,
23 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
- 24 • *Rincon, et al. v. New-Indy Tripaq, LLC, et al.* Case No. 20STCV17118, California
25 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
- 26 • *De Leon, et al. v. Wismettac Asian Foods, Inc.* Case No. 19STCV18172, California
27 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
- 28 • *Tapia v. Mercer Foods, Inc.* Case No. CV-21-000020, California Superior Court,

1 County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
2 • *Molina v. Reser's Fine Foods, Inc.* Case No. 37-2021-00013052-CU-OECTL, California
3 Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Eddie C. Sturgeon presiding;
4 • *Reyes v. Imperial Sprinkler Supply, Inc.* Case No. 30-2020-01167748-CU-OE-CXC,
5 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Peter Wilson presiding;
6 • *Zavala, et al. v. PLS Check Cashers, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV42586, California Superior
7 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
8 • *Paz v. Hill Brothers Chemical Company.* Case No. 20STCV48279, California Superior
9 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
10 • *Garcia v. Inwesco Incorporated.* Case No. 20STCV46833, California Superior Court,
11 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
12 • *Guevara v. J&K Culver, LLC, et al.* Case No. 19STCV39951, California Superior Court,
13 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
14 • *Hamilton v. Michael Kors Stores, Inc. et al.,* Case No. 19STCV37061, California
15 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
16 • *Arzooian v. A&M Administration, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV05576, California
17 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
18 • *Santos, et al. v. Maruzen of America, Inc.,* Case No. 19STCV37662, California Superior
19 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
20 • *Schaffino v. M.O. Dion & Sons., Inc., et al.,* Case No. 20STCV38023, California Superior
21 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Gail Killefer presiding;
22 • *Moreno v. Santa Paula Post Acute, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV12533, California
23 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;
24 • *Singer v. Desert Area Resources and Training,* Case No. BCV-21-101093, California
25 Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Thomas S. Clark presiding;
26 • *Clarizio v. Guard-Systems, Inc.,* Case No. 21STCV28667, California Superior Court,
27 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Armen Tamzarian presiding;
28 • *Guzman v. Freschco Painters, Inc.,* Case No. 21STCV04683, California Superior Court,

1 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
2 • *Koutny v. PAE Aviation and Technical Services, LLC*, Case No. 21C-0106, California
3 Superior Court, County of Kings, Honorable Melissa R. D’Morias presiding;
4 • *Rodriguez v. Pacifica Trucks, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV37576, California Superior Court,
5 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding;
6 • *Ramos v. AEGIS Treatment Centers, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV41429, California Superior
7 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
8 • *Valdez v. Integrated Building Services, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV37793, California Superior
9 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
10 • *Harris v. America One Security, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV01399, California Superior
11 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
12 • *Moreno v. M&J Seafood Company, Inc.* Case No. 22STCV03341, California Superior
13 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
14 • *Corrales v. Q&B Foods, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV40885, California Superior Court,
15 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu Berle presiding;
16 • *Arteaga v. Demolition Specialist, Inc.* Case No. RIC2001133, California Superior Court,
17 County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;
18 • *Vigil, et al. v. Capstone Turbine Corporation*, Case No. 20STCV32123, California
19 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
20 • *Ramirez v. Sea-Win, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV22026, California Superior Court, County
21 of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
22 • *Ortega Chavez v. Winpak Lane, Inc.* Case No. CIVSB2207313, California Superior
23 Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
24 • *Garcia v. American Licorice Company.* Case No. RG21107049, California Superior
25 Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Brad Seligman presiding;
26 • *Madrono v. Vitale Nursing, Inc, et al.*, Case No. 21STCV09845, California Superior
27 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding; and
28 • *Orellana v. Advanced Building Maintenance.* Case No. 34-2020-00286791-CU-OE-

1 GDS, California Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Jill Talley presiding.

2 22. I have also settled matters on a “PAGA Only” basis for aggrieved employees in the
3 past, including in:

4 • *Flores v. Delta Apparel, Inc.*, Case No. BC641499, California Superior Court, County
5 of Los Angeles, Honorable Daniel J. Buckley, presiding;

6 • *Segura v. CJ Foods Service Holdings USA, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV24918, California
7 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maureen Duffy-Lewis, presiding;

8 • *Sierra v. Nexem-Allied, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV11281, California Superior Court,
9 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Randolph M. Hammock, presiding;

10 • *Nodal v. Sodexo, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV40601, California Superior Court, County of
11 Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff, presiding; and

12 • *Cooper v. Lucas Health Partners*, Case No. 20STCV20050, California Superior Court,
13 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;

14 • *Herrera v. Greystar Management, LP, et al.*, Case No. 37-2020-00009672-CU-OE-CTL,
15 California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Carolyn Caietti, presiding;

16 • *Slater v. Jo-Ann Stores, LLC.*, Case No. 21STCV18454, California Superior Court,
17 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maurice A. Leiter, presiding;

18 • *Bolanos v. Canoga Park Heating & Air Conditioning, Co., Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV12674,
19 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yolanda Orozco, presiding;

20 • *Granados v. Cosmetic Ideas, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV10797, California Superior Court,
21 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Richard L. Fruin, presiding;

22 • *Ruano v. DPC Woodwork, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV00408, California Superior Court,
23 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Jon R. Takasugi presiding;

24 • *Tarin v. TPS Solutions, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV07844, California Superior Court, County
25 of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren E. Nelson presiding;

26 • *Echegoyen v. The ADT Security Corporation.*, Case No. 21STCV07206, California
27 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding; and

28 • *Iraheta v. Legacy Farmers, Inc.*, Case No. MSC21-00762, California Superior Court,

1 County of Contra Costa, Honorable Edward G. Weil presiding.

2 23. I believe that I am sufficiently experienced and qualified to evaluate the Class
3 Members' claims and viability of Defendants' defense.

4 24. After a thorough investigation and settlement discussions, Class Counsel arrived at
5 terms that they viewed was in the best interest of both the class members and the parties.

6 25. I believe recovery for each Class Member is well within the acceptable range for
7 this type of action. Class Counsel and Plaintiff were prepared to litigate the claims in this Action,
8 but they strongly and unequivocally support the proposed Settlement as being in the best interest
9 of the Settlement Class based on the circumstances referenced herein. I believe that this Settlement
10 is favorable given that the Settlement Class will receive compensation promptly rather than facing
11 uncertainties inherent in further litigation and waiting years for this Action to be tried.
12 Furthermore, I believe the Settlement Class has, overwhelmingly supported the Settlement on the
13 terms set forth in the Settlement Agreement. Thus, this Settlement is highly favorable and is in
14 the best interests of the Settlement Class.

15 26. For these reasons, as well as the reasons provided in the declarations of co-counsel,
16 I believe that Class Counsel are sufficiently experienced and qualified to evaluate the class members'
17 claims and viability of defendants' defenses.

18 27. I believe, and as further set out in the declarations of co-counsel, the settlement
19 presented here only resulted after having engaged in extensive informal and formal discovery and
20 investigation and is the product of hard-fought litigation and extensive arm's-length negotiations.

21 **An Award of Attorneys' Fees as Requested is Appropriate Under the Lodestar Method**

22 28. I believe Class Counsel earned the requested fee, as this case was vigorously
23 litigated. Over 560 hours will have been expended by Bibiyan Law Group, P.C.'s attorneys and
24 staff to date.

25 29. To summarize Class Counsel's lodestar request, Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., will have
26 collectively worked approximately 560.7 hours. Class Counsel's hourly rate in this case for David
27 D. Bibiyan is \$1,000 per hour (approx. 131.2 hours); Jeffrey D. Klein is \$900 per hour (approx.
28 165.8 hours); Vedang J. Patel is \$550 per hour (approx. 9.4 hours); Brandon M. Chang is \$500 per

1 hour (approx. 8.2 hours); Matthew Carraher is \$425 per hour (approx. 193.7 hours); Christopher Michail is \$300 per hour (approx. 25.9 hours); Paralegals are \$175 per hour (approx. 11.5 hours); and Legal Assistants are \$75 per hour (approx. 15.0 hours). At Class Counsel's hourly rates, this results in a total lodestar amount of \$382,920.00.

30. The over 560 hours expended by the lawyers and staff members of Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., in connection with this Action is only a calculation of efforts made thus far; it does not include the time that will be spent preparing for the Final Approval Hearing and updating this Court regarding the disposition of uncashed checks and/or amending the judgment, if necessary. Thus, Class Counsel request that the Court find that these hours are reasonable in this litigation.

Costs Incurred by Bibiyan Law Group, P.C.

31. The itemized costs incurred by Bibiyan Law Group, P.C. in the above-referenced matter total \$16,059.78.

(1)	Case Filing Fees	\$3,534.35
(2)	Service of Process	\$1,192.00
(3)	LWDA Filing Fee	\$75.00
(4)	CourtCall	\$374.00
(5)	Mediations	\$5,167.34
(6)	Expert Data Analysis	\$5,450.00
(7)	Postage/FedEx	\$182.29
(8)	Case Document Purchase	\$16.00
(9)	Photocopies (344 x \$0.20)	\$68.80

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the state of California that the foregoing is true and correct this April 12, 2024, at Los Angeles, California.

David D. Bibiyan
David D. Bibiyan