

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FOR THE COUNTY OF FRESNO
(UNLIMITED JURISDICTION)

DEAN CRUMPLER, on behalf of himself, all others similarly situated, the general public, and as an “aggrieved employee” on behalf of other “aggrieved employees” under the Labor Code Private Attorneys General Act of 2004,

Plaintiff(s),

vs.

WESTCO EQUITIES, INC. DBA WESTCO PROPERTY MANAGEMENT, a California corporation; and DOES 1–50, inclusive,

Defendant(s).

Case No. 21CECG02993

**[PROPOSED] ORDER
PRELIMINARILY APPROVING
CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT**

The Motion of Plaintiff Dean Crumpler (hereafter referred to as “Plaintiff”) for Preliminary Approval of a Class Action Settlement (the “Motion”) was considered by the Court, Jonathan M. Skiles presiding. The Court having considered the Motion, the Class Action and PAGA Settlement Agreement (“Settlement” or “Settlement Agreement”), and supporting papers, **HEREBY ORDERS THE FOLLOWING:**

///



SPIVAK LAW

Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067

1 1. The Court grants preliminary approval of the Settlement and the Settlement Class
2 based upon the terms set forth in the Settlement filed as an Exhibit to the Motion for Preliminary
3 Approval. All terms herein shall have the same meaning as defined in the Settlement. The Court
4 has determined there is sufficient evidence to preliminarily determine that (a) the terms of the
5 Settlement appear to be fair, adequate, and reasonable to the Settlement Class and (b) the
6 Settlement falls within the range of reasonableness and appears to be presumptively valid, subject
7 only to any objections that may be raised at the final hearing and final approval by this Court. The
8 Court will make a determination at the hearing on the motion for final approval of class action
9 settlement (the “Final Approval Hearing”) as to whether the Settlement is fair, adequate and
reasonable to the Settlement Class.

10 2. For purposes of this Preliminary Approval Order, the “Class” means all persons
11 employed by Defendant in California and classified as hourly, non-exempt who worked for
12 Defendant during the Class Period. The “Class Period” shall mean the period of time from
13 October 7, 2017 through September 17, 2022. Defendant estimates that as of September 17, 2022,
14 there were 158 potential Settlement Class Members. The “Effective Date” means as follows: If
15 no objection to this Settlement or to any of the terms and or conditions of the Settlement are filed
16 by Plaintiff, another member of the Settlement class, or any intervenor to this Lawsuit, the
17 Effective Date shall occur on the day that the Court enters an order of final approval of this
18 Settlement; however, if any objection to this Settlement or to any of the terms and or conditions
19 of the Stipulation is filed by a member of the Settlement class, or any intervenor to this Lawsuit,
20 the Effective Date shall occur upon the expiration of the time for the filing any appeal of the order
21 of final approval of this Settlement. If an appeal is filed or any writ granted, then the Effective
22 Date shall occur after the appeal has been dismissed or the writ dissolved and when there is no
23 further time to appeal the dismissal of the appeal or the dissolution of the writ. The occurrence of
24 the Effective Date is a prerequisite to any obligation of Defendant to pay any funds into the
Settlement Account.

25 3. This action is provisionally certified pursuant to section 382 of the California Code
26 of Civil Procedure and Rule 3.760, et seq. of the California Rules of Court as a class action for
27 purposes of settlement only with respect to the proposed Settlement Class.

28 4. The Court hereby preliminarily finds that the Settlement was the product of
serious, informed, non-collusive negotiations conducted at arm’s length by the Parties. In making



SPIVAK LAW

Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067

1 this preliminary finding, the Court considered the nature of the claims set forth in the pleadings,
2 the amounts and kinds of benefits which shall be paid pursuant to the Settlement, the allocation
3 of Settlement proceeds to the Settlement Class, and the fact that the Settlement represents a
4 compromise of the Parties' respective positions. The Court further preliminarily finds that the
5 terms of the Settlement have no obvious deficiencies and do not improperly grant preferential
6 treatment to any individual Class Member. Accordingly, the Court preliminarily finds that the
Settlement was entered into in good faith.

7 5. The Court finds that the dates set forth in the Settlement for mailing and
8 distribution of the Class Notice meet the requirements of due process and provide the best notice
9 practicable under the circumstances, and constitute due and sufficient notice to all persons entitled
10 thereto, and directs the mailing of the Class Notice by first class mail to the Settlement Class as
11 set forth in the Settlement. Accordingly, the Court orders the following implementation schedule
for further proceedings:

12 a. By _____, Defendant shall provide Simpluris, Inc.,
13 the appointed Settlement Administrator, with: (a) An electronic database of all
14 Class Members, last known mailing address, Social Security number and
15 Defendant's employee identification number ("Class Members' Data"); and
16 (b) Corresponding to each Class Member's name, Defendant shall provide a
17 figure indicating the total number of Work Weeks during the Class Period in
18 which Defendant employed the Class Member. That number of Work Weeks
19 shall be referred to as that Class Member's "Individual Work Weeks;" (c) If
20 any of the Class Members' Data are unavailable to Defendant, Defendant will
21 so inform Class Counsel and the Parties will make their best efforts to
22 reconstruct or otherwise agree upon the Class Members' Data prior to when it
23 must be submitted to the Settlement Administrator. Class Members' Data will
24 otherwise remain confidential and will not be disclosed to anyone, except as
necessary to applicable taxing authorities, or pursuant to Defendant's express
written authorization or by order of the Court.

25 b. **Mailing of Class Notice.** Approximately fourteen (14) days after receiving the
26 Class Members' Data, or as soon thereafter as it can do so, the Settlement
27 Administrator will mail the Class Notice to all identified Class Members via
28



SPIVAK LAW

Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067

1 first-class U.S. mail using the mailing address information provided by
2 Defendant, unless modified by any updated address information that the
3 Settlement Administrator obtains in the course of administration of the
4 Settlement.

5 c. **Returned Class Notice.** If a Class Notice is returned because of an incorrect
6 address, the Settlement Administrator will promptly, and not later than ten (10)
7 days from receipt of the returned Class Notice, search for a more current
8 address for the Class Member and re-mail the Class Notice to the Class
9 Member. The Settlement Administrator will use the Class Members' Data and
10 otherwise work with Defendant's Counsel and Class Counsel to find a more
11 current address. The Settlement Administrator will be responsible for taking
12 reasonable steps, consistent with its agreed-upon job parameters, court orders,
13 and fee, to trace the mailing address of any Class Member for whom a Class
14 Notice is returned as undeliverable by the U.S. Postal Service. These
15 reasonable steps shall include the tracking of all undelivered mail; performing
16 address searches for all mail returned without a forwarding address; and
17 promptly re-mailing to Class Members for whom new addresses are found. If
18 the Class Notice is re-mailed, the Settlement Administrator will note for its
19 own records and notify Class Counsel and Defendant's Counsel of the date and
20 address of each such re-mailing as part of a weekly status report provided to
21 the Parties.

22 d. **Declaration of Settlement Administrator.** Not later than twenty-one (21)
23 court days prior to the Final Approval Hearing, the Settlement Administrator
24 will provide the Parties for filing with the Court a declaration of due diligence
25 setting forth its compliance with its obligations under this Agreement. Prior to
26 the Final Approval Hearing, the Settlement Administrator will supplement its
27 declaration of due diligence if any material changes occur from the date of the
28 filing of its prior declaration.

e. **Requests for Exclusion from Settlement; and Objections to Settlement.**
Class Members may submit requests to be excluded from the effect of the
Settlement, or objections to the Settlement, pursuant to the following



SPIVAK LAW

Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067

procedures:

- i. **Request for Exclusion from Settlement.** A Class Member may request to be excluded from the effect of this Agreement, and any payment of amounts under this Agreement, by timely mailing a letter to the Settlement Administrator stating that the Class Member wants to be excluded from this Action. This letter must include the Class Member's name, address, telephone number, and signature. To be valid and timely, the request to be excluded must be postmarked by the date specified in the Class Notice (60 days from the initial mailing of the Class Notice by the Settlement Administrator). A Class Member who properly submits a valid and timely request to be excluded from the Action shall not receive any payment of any kind in connection with this Agreement or this Action, shall not be bound by or receive any benefit of this Agreement, and shall have no standing to object to the Settlement. A request for exclusion must be mailed to the Settlement Administrator at the address provided on the Class Notice. The Settlement Administrator shall transmit the request for exclusion to counsel for the Parties as follows:

To Class Counsel:

David G. Spivak, Esq.
The Spivak Law Firm
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069

To Defense Counsel:

Ian B. Wieland
Sagaser, Watkins & Wieland PC
Mr. Ian B. Wieland Esq.
5260 N. Palm Ave.
Ste. 400
Fresno, CA 93704

- ii. **Objections to Settlement.** The Class Notice will provide that any Class Member who does not request exclusion from the Action and who wishes to object to the Settlement should submit an objection in writing to the Settlement Administrator no later than 60 days after the Settlement Administrator mails the Class Notice, a written objection to



SPIVAK LAW

Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067

the Settlement which sets forth the grounds for the objection and the other information required by this paragraph. The objection should be mailed to the Settlement Administrator at the address provided on the Class Notice. The Settlement Administrator shall transmit the objections to counsel for the Parties as follows:

To Class Counsel:

David G. Spivak, Esq.
The Spivak Law Firm
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069

To Defense Counsel:

Ian B. Wieland
Sagaser, Watkins & Wieland PC
Mr. Ian B. Wieland Esq.
5260 N. Palm Ave.
Ste. 400
Fresno, CA 93704

The written objection should state the objecting Class Member's full name, address, and the approximate dates of his or her employment with Defendant. The written objection should state the basis for each specific objection and any legal support in clear and concise terms. The written objection also should state whether the Class Member intends to formally intervene and become a party of record in the action, and upon formally intervening, appear and argue at the Final Approval Hearing. However, the objectors will be provided with the opportunity to speak at the final approval hearing regardless of whether they have filed an appearance or submitted a written opposition beforehand.

If the objecting Class Member does not formally intervene in the action and/or the Court rejects the Class Member's objection, the Class Member may still be bound by the terms of this Agreement.

- f. **Report.** Not later than fourteen (14) days after the deadline for submission of requests for exclusion, the Settlement Administrator will provide the Parties with a complete and accurate list of all Class Members who sent timely requests to be excluded from the Action and all Class Members who objected



SPIVAK LAW

Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067



Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

to the settlement.

6. The Court approves, as to form and content, the Class Notice in substantially the form attached as Exhibit A to the Settlement, the Exclusion Request form in substantially the form attached as Exhibit B to the Settlement, and the Work Weeks Dispute form in substantially the form attached as Exhibit C to the Settlement.

7. The Court approves, for settlement purposes only, David Spivak of The Spivak Law Firm and Walter L. Haines of United Employees Law Group as Class Counsel.

8. The Court approves, for settlement purposes only, Dean Crumpler as the Class Representative.

9. The Court approves Simpluris, Inc. as the Settlement Administrator.

10. The Court preliminarily approves Class Counsel's request for attorneys' fees and costs subject to final review by the Court.

11. The Court preliminarily approves the estimated Settlement Administrator costs payable to the Settlement Administrator subject to final review by the Court.

12. The Court preliminarily approves Plaintiff's Class Representative Payment subject to final review by the Court.

13. A Final Approval Hearing shall be held on _____ at _____**.m.** in the Superior Court for the State of California, County of Fresno, located at 1130 "O" Street, Dept. 403, Fresno, CA 93724 to consider the fairness, adequacy and reasonableness of the proposed Settlement preliminarily approved by this Preliminary Approval Order, and to consider the application of Class Counsel for attorneys' fees and costs and the Class Representative Payment to the Class Representative. The notice of motion and all briefs and materials in support of the motion for final approval of class action settlement and motion for attorneys' fees and litigation costs shall be served and filed with this Court on or before _____.

14. If for any reason the Court does not execute and file a final approval order and judgment, or if the Effective Date, as defined in the Settlement, does not occur for any reason, the proposed Settlement that is the subject of this order, and all evidence and proceedings had in connection therewith, shall be without prejudice to the status quo ante rights of the Parties to the litigation, as more specifically set forth in the Settlement.

15. The Court expressly reserves the right to adjourn or continue the Final Approval Hearing from time to time without further notice to members of the Class. The Plaintiff shall give

1 prompt notice of any continuance to Settlement Class Members who object to the Settlement.

2 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

3
4 DATED: _____

JONATHAN M. SKILES
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28



SPIVAK LAW
E-Discovery Rights Attorneys

Mail:
8605 Santa Monica Bl
PMB 42554
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(213) 725-9094 Tel
(213) 634-2485 Fax
SpivakLaw.com

Office:
1801 Century Park East
25th Fl
Los Angeles, CA 90067