

1 **BLUMENTHAL NORDREHAUG BHOWMIK**
2 **DE BLOUW LLP**

3 Norman B. Blumenthal (State Bar #068687)
4 Kyle R. Nordrehaug (State Bar #205975)
5 Aparajit Bhowmik (State Bar #248066)
6 2255 Calle Clara
7 La Jolla, CA 92037
8 Telephone: (858)551-1223
9 Facsimile: (858) 551-1232
10 Email: Kyle@bamlawca.com
11 Website: www.bamlawca.com

12 **LAVI & EBRAHIMIAN, LLP**

13 Joseph Lavi, Esq. (SBN 209776)
14 Vincent C. Granberry, Esq. (SBN 276483)
15 8889 W. Olympic Blvd., Suite 200
16 Beverly Hills, California 90211
17 Telephone: (310) 432-0000
18 Facsimile: (310) 432-0001

19 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

LOLA MARCUM and JOSE G. IRIZARRY,
on behalf of the State of California as private
attorneys general, and as individuals, on behalf
of themselves and on behalf of all persons
similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

HUNTSMAN ADVANCED MATERIALS
AMERICAS LLC, a Limited Liability
Company; HUNTSMAN INTERNATIONAL
LLC, a Limited Liability Company; and
DOES 1 through 50, inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO.: 22STCV03845
[Consolidated with Case No. 22STCV22712]

**[PROPOSED] PRELIMINARY
APPROVAL ORDER**

Hearing Date: February 2, 2024
Hearing Time: 10:30 a.m.

Judge: Hon. Stuart M. Rice
Dept: SS-1

Date Filed: January 31, 2022
Trial Date: Not set

1 This matter came before the Honorable Stuart M. Rice of the Superior Court of the State of
2 California, in and for the County Los Angeles, on February 2, 2024, for hearing on the unopposed
3 motion by Plaintiffs Lola Marcum and Jose G. Irizarry (“Plaintiffs”) for preliminary approval of
4 the Settlement with Defendants Huntsman International LLC and Huntsman Advanced Materials
5 Americas LLC (“Defendants”). The Court, having considered the briefs, argument of counsel and
6 all matters presented to the Court and good cause appearing, hereby GRANTS Plaintiffs’ Motion
7 for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement.

8
9 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:**

10 1. The Court preliminarily approves the Class Action and PAGA Settlement
11 Agreement (“Agreement”) attached as Exhibit #1 to the Declaration of Kyle Nordrehaug in
12 Support of Plaintiffs’ Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement. This is based
13 on the Court’s determination that the Settlement set forth in the Agreement is within the range of
14 possible final approval, pursuant to the provisions of Section 382 of the California Code of Civil
15 Procedure and California Rules of Court, rule 3.769.

16 2. This Order incorporates by reference the definitions in the Agreement, and all
17 terms defined therein shall have the same meaning in this Order as set forth in the Agreement.

18 3. The Gross Settlement Amount that Defendants shall pay is Four Hundred Eighty
19 Thousand Dollars (\$480,000). It appears to the Court on a preliminary basis that the settlement
20 amount and terms are fair, adequate and reasonable as to all potential Class Members when
21 balanced against the probable outcome of further litigation and the significant risks relating to
22 certification, liability and damages issues. It further appears that investigation and research have
23 been conducted such that counsel for the Parties are able to reasonably evaluate their respective
24 positions. It further appears to the Court that the Settlement will avoid substantial additional costs
25 by all Parties, as well as avoid the delay and risks that would be presented by the further
26 prosecution of the Action. It further appears that the Settlement has been reached as the result of
27 serious and non-collusive, arm’s-length negotiations.

1 4. The Court preliminarily finds that the Settlement appears to be within the range of
2 reasonableness of a settlement that could ultimately be given final approval by this Court. The
3 Court has reviewed the monetary recovery that is being granted as part of the Settlement and
4 preliminarily finds that the monetary settlement awards made available to the Class are fair,
5 adequate, and reasonable when balanced against the probable outcome of further litigation and the
6 significant risks relating to certification, liability, and damages issues.

7 5. The Agreement specifies for an attorneys' fees award not to exceed one-third of the
8 Gross Settlement Amount, an award of litigation expenses incurred, not to exceed \$21,000, and
9 proposed Class Representative Service Payments to the Plaintiffs in an amount not to exceed
10 \$10,000 each. The Court will not approve the amount of attorneys' fees and costs, nor the amount
11 of any service award, until the Final Approval Hearing. Plaintiffs will be required to present
12 evidence supporting these requests, including lodestar, prior to final approval.

13 6. The Court recognizes that Plaintiffs and Defendants stipulate and agree to
14 representative treatment and certification of a class for settlement purposes only. This stipulation
15 will not be deemed admissible in this or any other proceeding should this Settlement not become
16 final. For settlement purposes only, the Court conditionally certifies the Class which consists of
17 "all individuals who were employed by Defendants Huntsman International LLC and Huntsman
18 Advanced Materials Americas LLC in California and classified as a hourly non-exempt employee
19 at any time during the Class Period." The "Class Period" is January 31, 2018 and continuing
20 through February 17, 2023.

21 7. The Court concludes that, for settlement purposes only, the Class meets the
22 requirements for certification under section 382 of the California Code of Civil Procedure in that:
23 (a) the Class is ascertainable and so numerous that joinder of all members of the Class is
24 impracticable; (b) common questions of law and fact predominate, and there is a well-defined
25 community of interest amongst the members of the Class with respect to the subject matter of the
26 litigation; (c) the claims of the Plaintiffs are typical of the claims of the members of the Class; (d)
27 the Plaintiffs will fairly and adequately protect the interests of the members of the Class; (e) a
28

1 class action is superior to other available methods for the efficient adjudication of this controversy;
2 and (f) counsel for the Class is qualified to act as counsel for the Class and the Plaintiffs are
3 adequate representatives of the Class.

4 8. The Court provisionally appoints Plaintiffs as the representatives of the Class. The
5 Court provisionally appoints Norman B. Blumenthal, Kyle R. Nordrehaug, and Aparajit Bhowmik
6 of Blumenthal Nordrehaug Bhowmik De Blouw LLP and Joseph Lavi and Vincent Granberry of
7 Lavi & Ebrahimian, LLP as Class Counsel for the Class.

8 9. The Agreement provides for PAGA Penalties out of the Gross Settlement Amount
9 of \$7,500, which shall be allocated \$5,625 to the Labor & Workforce Development Agency
10 (“LWDA”) as the LWDA’s 75% share of the settlement of civil penalties paid under this
11 Agreement pursuant to the PAGA and \$1,875 to the Aggrieved Employees. “Aggrieved
12 Employees” are all individuals who were employed by Defendants in California and classified as a
13 non-exempt employee at any time during the PAGA Period (November 19, 2020 through February
14 17, 2023). Pursuant to Labor Code section 2699, subdivision (l)(2), the LWDA will be provided
15 notice of the Agreement and these settlement terms. The Court finds the PAGA Penalties to be
16 reasonable.

17 10. The Court hereby approves, as to form and content, the Class Notice attached to the
18 Agreement as Exhibit A. The Court finds that the Class Notice appears to fully and accurately
19 inform the Class of all material elements of the proposed Settlement, of the Class Members’ right
20 to be excluded from the Class by submitting a written opt-out request, and of each member’s right
21 and opportunity to object to the Settlement. The Court further finds that the distribution of the
22 Class Notice substantially in the manner and form set forth in the Agreement and this Order meets
23 the requirements of due process, is the best notice practicable under the circumstances, and shall
24 constitute due and sufficient notice to all persons entitled thereto. The Court orders the mailing of
25 the Class Notice by first class mail pursuant to the terms set forth in the Agreement. If a Class
26 Notice Packet is returned because of an incorrect address, the Administrator will promptly search
27 for a more current address for the Class Member and re-mail the Class Notice Packet to any new
28

1 address for the Class Member no later than seven (7) days after the receipt of the undelivered
2 Class Notice.

3 11. The Court hereby appoints ILYM Group as the Administrator. No later than fifteen
4 (15) days after this Order, Defendants will provide the Class Data to the Administrator. The
5 Administrator will perform address updates and verifications as necessary prior to the first
6 mailing. Using best efforts to mail it as soon as possible, and in no event later than fourteen (14)
7 days after receiving the Class Data, the Administrator will mail the Class Notice Packet to all
8 Class Members via first-class regular U.S. Mail to their last known address.

9 12. The Court hereby preliminarily approves the proposed procedure for exclusion
10 from the Settlement. Any Class Member may individually choose to opt out of and be excluded
11 from the Class as provided in the Class Notice by following the instructions for requesting
12 exclusion from the Class that are set forth in the Class Notice. All requests for exclusion must be
13 postmarked or received no later than sixty (60) calendar days after the date of the mailing of the
14 Class Notice (“Response Deadline”). If a Class Notice Packet is re-mailed, the Response Deadline
15 for requests for exclusion will be extended an additional fourteen (14) days. A Request for
16 Exclusion may also be faxed or emailed to the Administrator as indicated in the Class Notice.
17 Any such person who chooses to opt out of and be excluded from the Class will not be entitled to
18 any recovery under the Class Settlement and will not be bound by the Class Settlement or have
19 any right to object, appeal or comment thereon. Class Members who have not requested exclusion
20 shall be bound by all determinations of the Court, the Agreement and the Judgment. A request for
21 exclusion may only opt out that particular individual, and any attempt to effect an opt-out of a
22 group, class, or subclass of individuals is not permitted and will be deemed invalid.

23 13. Any Class Member who has not opted out may appear at the final approval hearing
24 and may object or express the Member’s views regarding the Settlement, and may present
25 evidence and file briefs or other papers that may be proper and relevant to the issues to be heard
26 and determined by the Court as provided in the Class Notice. Class Members will have until the
27 Response Deadline to submit their written objections to the Administrator. Written objections
28

1 may also be faxed or emailed to the Administrator as indicated in the Class Notice. If a Class
2 Notice Packet is re-mailed, the Response Deadline for written objections will be extended an
3 additional fourteen (14) days. Alternatively, Class Members may appear at the Final Approval
4 Hearing to make an oral objection.

5 14. A final approval hearing shall be held before this Court on _____
6 _____ at _____ in Department 1 at the Spring Street Courthouse of the Los
7 Angeles County Superior Court to hear the motion for final approval and the motion for attorneys'
8 fees and costs, and to determine all necessary matters concerning the Settlement, including:
9 whether the proposed settlement of the Action on the terms and conditions provided for in the
10 Agreement is fair, adequate and reasonable and should be finally approved by the Court; whether
11 the Final Approval Order and Judgment should be entered herein; whether the plan of allocation
12 contained in the Agreement should be approved as fair, adequate and reasonable to the Class
13 Members; and to finally approve attorneys' fees and costs, service award, and the fees and
14 expenses of the Administrator. All papers in support of the motion for final approval and the
15 motion for attorneys' fees, costs and service award shall be filed with the Court and served on all
16 counsel no later than sixteen (16) court days before the hearing and both motions shall be heard at
17 this final approval hearing.

18 15. Neither the Settlement nor any exhibit, document, or instrument delivered
19 thereunder shall be construed as a concession or admission by Defendants in any way that the
20 claims asserted have any merit or that this Action was properly brought as a class or representative
21 action, and shall not be used as evidence of, or used against Defendants as, an admission or
22 indication in any way, including with respect to any claim of any liability, wrongdoing, fault or
23 omission by Defendants or with respect to the truth of any allegation asserted by any person.
24 Whether or not the Settlement is finally approved, neither the Settlement, nor any exhibit,
25 document, statement, proceeding or conduct related to the Settlement, nor any reports or accounts
26 thereof, shall in any event be construed as, offered or admitted in evidence as, received as or
27 deemed to be evidence for any purpose adverse to the Defendants, including, but not limited to,

1 evidence of a presumption, concession, indication or admission by Defendants of any liability,
2 fault, wrongdoing, omission, concession or damage.

3 16. In the event the Settlement does not become effective in accordance with the terms
4 of the Agreement, or the Settlement is not finally approved, or is terminated, canceled or fails to
5 become effective for any reason, this Order shall be rendered null and void and shall be vacated,
6 and the Parties shall revert to their respective positions as of before entering into the Agreement,
7 and expressly reserve their respective rights regarding the prosecution and defense of this Action,
8 including all available defenses and affirmative defenses, and arguments that any claim in the
9 Action could not be certified as a class action and/or managed as a representative action. In such
10 an event, the Court's orders regarding the Settlement, including this Order, shall not be used or
11 referred to in litigation for any purpose. Nothing in this paragraph is intended to alter the terms of
12 the Agreement with respect to the effect of the Agreement if it is not approved.

13 17. The Court reserves the right to adjourn or continue the date of the final approval
14 hearing and all dates provided for in the Agreement without further notice to Class Members and
15 retains jurisdiction to consider all further applications arising out of or connected with the
16 proposed Settlement.

17 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

18 Dated: _____

19 _____
20 HON. STUART M. RICE
21 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA
22
23
24
25
26
27
28