

1 **BLUMENTHAL NORDREHAUG BHOWMIK**
2 **DE BLOUW LLP**

3 Norman B. Blumenthal (State Bar #068687)

4 Kyle R. Nordrehaug (State Bar #205975)

5 Aparajit Bhowmik (State Bar #248066)

6 2255 Calle Clara

7 La Jolla, CA 92037

8 Telephone: (858)551-1223

9 Facsimile: (858) 551-1232

10 Attorney for Plaintiff

11
12 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

13 **COUNTY OF SAN BERNARDINO**

14
15 DENNIS EBERWEIN, an individual, on
16 behalf of himself and on behalf of all persons
17 similarly situated, and on behalf of the State of
18 California, as a private attorney general,

19 Plaintiff,

20 vs.

21 PSG CALIFORNIA LLC, a Limited Liability
22 Company; and DOES 1 through 50, inclusive,
23 Defendant,

24 Defendants.

CASE NO.: CIVSB2207161

[Consolidated with CIVSB2211719]

**[PROPOSED] FINAL APPROVAL
ORDER AND JUDGMENT**

Hearing Date: October 31, 2023

Hearing Time: 1:30 p.m.

Judge: Hon. Joseph T. Ortiz

Dept: 17

Date Filed: April 8, 2022

Trial Date: Not set

1 The unopposed motion of Plaintiff Dennis Eberwein (“Plaintiff”) for an order finally
2 approving the Class Action and PAGA Settlement Agreement (“Agreement”) with Defendant PSG
3 California LLC (“Defendant”), attorneys’ fees and costs, service payments, and the expenses of the
4 Administrator duly came on for hearing on October 31, 2023 before the Honorable Joseph T. Ortiz.

5 **I.**

6 **FINDINGS**

7 Based on the oral and written argument and evidence presented in connection with the
8 motion, the Court makes the following findings:

- 9 1. All terms used herein shall have the same meaning as defined in the Agreement.
- 10 2. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this litigation pending before
11 the Superior Court for the State of California, in and for the County of San Bernardino, and over all
12 Parties to this litigation, including the Class.
- 13 3. Based on a review of the papers submitted by Plaintiffs and a review of the
14 applicable law, the Court finds that the Gross Settlement Amount of One Million Four Hundred
15 Thousand Dollars (\$1,400,000) and the terms set forth in the Agreement are fair, reasonable, and
16 adequate.
- 17 4. The Court further finds that the Settlement was the result of arm’s length negotiations
18 conducted after Class Counsel had adequately investigated the claims and became familiar with the
19 strengths and weaknesses of those claims. In particular, the amount of the Settlement, and the
20 assistance of an experienced mediator in the settlement process, among other factors, support the
21 Court’s conclusion that the Settlement is fair, reasonable, and adequate.

22 **Preliminary Approval of the Settlement**

- 23 5. On June 20, 2023, the Court granted preliminary approval of the Settlement. At the
24 same time, the Court approved conditional certification of the Class for settlement purposes only.

25 **Notice to the Class**

- 26 6. In compliance with the Preliminary Approval Order, the Court-approved Class
27 Notice was mailed by first class mail to members of the Class at their last-known addresses on or
28

1 about July 19, 2023. Mailing of the Class Notice to their last-known addresses was the best notice
2 practicable under the circumstances and was reasonably calculated to communicate actual notice of
3 the litigation and the proposed settlement to the Class. The Class Notice given to the Class
4 Members fully and accurately informed the Class Members of all material elements of the proposed
5 Settlement and of their opportunity to object to or comment thereon or to seek exclusion from the
6 Settlement; was valid, due, and sufficient notice to all Class Members; and complied fully with the
7 laws of the State of California, the United States Constitution, due process and other applicable law.
8 The Class Notice fairly and adequately described the Settlement and provided Class Members
9 adequate instructions and a variety of means to obtain additional information.

10 7. The Response Deadline for opting out or submitting written objections to the
11 Settlement was September 5, 2023, which for re-mailings was extended by fourteen (14) days.
12 There was an adequate interval between notice and the deadline to permit Class Members to choose
13 what to do and to act on their decision. A full and fair opportunity has been afforded to the Class
14 Members to participate in this hearing, and all Class Members and other persons wishing to be heard
15 have had a full and fair opportunity to be heard. Class Members also have had a full and fair
16 opportunity to exclude themselves from the proposed Settlement and Class. Accordingly, the Court
17 determines that all Class Members who did not timely and properly submit a request for exclusion
18 are bound by the Settlement and this Final Approval Order and Judgment.

19 **Fairness of the Settlement**

20 8. The Agreement is entitled to a presumption of fairness. *Dunk v. Ford Motor Co.* 48
21 Cal.App.4th 1794, 1801 (1996).

22 a. The settlement was reached through arm's-length bargaining between the
23 Parties during an all-day mediation before Tripper Ortman, an experienced mediator of wage and
24 hour class actions. There has been no collusion between the Parties in reaching the Settlement.

25 b. Plaintiff and his counsel's investigation and discovery have been sufficient to
26 allow the Court and counsel to act intelligently.

1 c. Counsel for all Parties are experienced in similar employment class action
2 litigation. Plaintiffs' counsel recommended approval of the Agreement.

3 d. The percentage of objectors and requests for exclusion is small. No
4 objections were received. Five (5) requests for exclusion were received.

5 e. The participation rate was high. 450 Class Members will be mailed a
6 settlement payment, representing 99.12% of the overall Class.

7 9. The consideration to be given to the Class Members under the terms of the
8 Agreement is fair, reasonable, and adequate considering the strengths and weaknesses of the claims
9 asserted in this action and is fair, reasonable, and adequate compensation for the release of Class
10 Members' claims, given the uncertainties and significant risks of the litigation and the delays which
11 would ensue from continued prosecution of the action.

12 10. The Agreement is approved as fair, adequate, and reasonable and in the best interests
13 of the Class Members.

14 **Class Counsel Fees Payment and Class Counsel Litigation Expenses Payment**

15 11. An award of \$466,666 for attorneys' fees, representing one-third of the Gross
16 Settlement Amount, and \$22,593.15 for litigation costs and expenses, is reasonable, in light of the
17 contingent nature of Class Counsel's fee, the hours worked by Class Counsel, and the results
18 achieved by Class Counsel. The requested award has been supported by Class Counsel's lodestar
19 and billing statement.

20 **Class Representative Service Payment**

21 12. The Agreement provides for a Class Representative Service Payment of not more
22 than \$10,000 to Plaintiff, subject to the Court's approval. The Court finds that a Class
23 Representative Service Payment in the amount of \$10,000 to Plaintiff is reasonable in light of the
24 risks and burdens undertaken by Plaintiff in this litigation, for his time and effort in bringing and
25 prosecuting this matter on behalf of the Class, and for his execution of a general release.

1
2 16. All persons who meet the foregoing definition are members of the Class, except for
3 those individuals who submitted a valid request for exclusion (“opt out”) from the Class. The five
4 Class Members who are excluded are Mariana Moran, Jason Green, Justin Kleespies, Erick Leon,
5 and Daniel Bavadian.

6 17. The Agreement is hereby finally approved as fair, reasonable, adequate, and in the
7 best interest of the Class.

8 18. Class Counsel are awarded attorneys’ fees in the amount of \$466,666 and costs in the
9 amount of \$22,593.15. Class Counsel shall not seek or obtain any other compensation or
10 reimbursement from Defendant, Plaintiff or members of the Class.

11 19. The payment of Class Representative Service Payment in the amount of \$10,000 to
12 Plaintiff is approved.

13 20. The payment of \$11,000 to the Administrator for its fees and expenses is approved.

14 21. The PAGA Penalties of \$30,000 is approved and is to be distributed in accordance
15 with the Agreement.

16 22. Pursuant to Labor Code section 2699, subdivision (1)(2), Class Counsel shall submit a
17 copy of this Final Approval Order and Judgment to the LWDA within 10 days after its entry.

18 23. Neither the Agreement nor this Settlement is an admission by Defendant, nor is this
19 Final Approval Order and Judgment a finding, of the validity of any claims in the Action or of any
20 wrongdoing by Defendant or that this Action is appropriate for class or representative treatment
21 (other than for settlement purposes). Neither this Final Approval Order and Judgment, the
22 Agreement, nor any document referred to herein, nor any action taken to carry out the Agreement is,
23 may be construed as, or may be used as an admission by or against Defendant of any fault,
24 wrongdoing or liability whatsoever. The entering into or carrying out of the Agreement, and any
25 negotiations or proceedings related thereto, shall not in any event be construed as, or deemed to be
26 evidence of, an admission, or concession with regard to the denials or defenses by Defendant.

27 Notwithstanding these restrictions, Defendant may file in the Action or in any other proceeding this
28 Final Approval Order and Judgment, the Agreement, or any other papers and records on file in the

1 Action as evidence of the Settlement to support a defense of *res judicata*, collateral estoppel,
2 release, or other theory of claim or issue preclusion or similar defense as to the Released Class
3 Claims and/or Released PAGA Claims.

4 24. Notice of entry of this Final Approval Order and Judgment shall be given to all
5 Parties by Class Counsel on behalf of Plaintiff and all Class Members. The Final Approval Order
6 and Judgment shall be posted on Class Counsel's website as set forth in the Class Notice to the
7 Class. It shall not be necessary to send notice of entry of this Final Approval Order and Judgment to
8 individual Class Members.

9 25. If the Agreement does not become final and effective in accordance with the terms of
10 the Agreement, then this Final Approval Order and Judgment, and all orders entered in connection
11 herewith, shall be rendered null and void and shall be vacated, and the Parties shall revert to their
12 respective positions as of before entering into the Agreement, and expressly reserve their respective
13 rights regarding the prosecution and defense of this Action, including all available defenses and
14 affirmative defenses, and arguments that any claim in the Action could not be certified as a class
15 action and/or managed as a representative action.

16 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDICATED AND DECREED THAT:**

17 26. Except as set forth in the Agreement and this Final Approval Order and Judgment,
18 Plaintiff, and all members of the Class, shall take nothing in the Action.

19 27. The Court shall retain jurisdiction to construe, interpret, implement and enforce the
20 Agreement, to hear and resolve any contested challenge to a claim for settlement benefits, and to
21 supervise and adjudicate any dispute arising from or in connection with the distribution of
22 settlement benefits.

23 28. All Parties shall bear their own attorneys' fees and costs, except as otherwise
24 provided in the Agreement and in this Final Approval Order and Judgment.

25 29. Effective on the date when Defendant fully fund the Gross Settlement Amount and
26 all employer payroll taxes owed on the Wage Portion of the Individual Class Payments, Plaintiff,
27
28

1 Participating Class Members, Aggrieved Employees, and the LWDA will release claims against all
2 Released Parties as follows:

3 (a) All Participating Class Members, on behalf of themselves and their respective
4 former and present representatives, agents, attorneys, heirs, administrators, successors, and assigns,
5 release Released Parties from the Released Class Claims. The “Released Class Claims” are all class
6 claims pled or could have been pled based on the factual allegations contained in the Operative
7 Complaint which occurred during the Class Period, including but not limited to Labor Code §§ 201,
8 202, 203, 204, 226, 226.7, 510, 512, 1174, 1194, 1197, 1197.1, and 2802. Except as expressly set
9 forth in the Agreement, Participating Class Members do not release any other claims, including
10 claims for vested benefits, wrongful termination, violation of the Fair Employment and Housing
11 Act, unemployment insurance, disability, Social Security, workers’ compensation, or claims based
12 on facts occurring outside the Class Period.

13 (b) All Aggrieved Employees and the LWDA are deemed to release, on behalf of
14 themselves and their respective former and present representatives, agents, attorneys, heirs,
15 administrators, successors, and assigns, the Released Parties from all of the Released PAGA Claims.
16 The “Released PAGA Claims” are all PAGA claims pled or which could have been pled based on
17 the factual allegations contained in the Operative Complaint and PAGA letters sent by Plaintiff
18 which occurred during the PAGA Period. The Released PAGA Claims do not include other PAGA
19 claims, underlying wage and hour claims, claims for wrongful termination, discrimination,
20 unemployment insurance, disability and worker’s compensation, and claims outside of the PAGA
21 Period.

22 (c) Plaintiff and his respective former and present spouses, representatives,
23 agents, attorneys, heirs, administrators, successors, and assigns generally, release and discharge
24 Released Parties from all claims, transactions, or occurrences that occurred during the Class Period
25 (“Plaintiff’s Release”) as fully set forth in the Agreement.

26 30. For any Class Member or Aggrieved Employee whose Individual Class Payment
27 check or Individual PAGA Payment check is uncashed and cancelled after the void date, the
28

1 Administrator shall transmit the funds represented by such checks to the California Controller's
2 Unclaimed Property Fund in the name of the Class Member thereby leaving no "unpaid residue"
3 subject to the requirements of California Code of Civil Procedure Section 384, subd. (b).

4 31. The Court hereby enters judgment in the entire Action as of the filing date of this
5 Order and Judgment, pursuant to the terms set forth in the Settlement. Without affecting the finality
6 of this Order and Judgment in any way, the Court hereby retains continuing jurisdiction over the
7 interpretation, implementation, and enforcement of the Settlement and all orders entered in
8 connection therewith pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

9 **LET JUDGMENT BE FORTHWITH ENTERED ACCORDINGLY. IT IS SO ORDERED.**

10
11 Dated: _____

12 _____
13 HON. JOSEPH T. ORTIZ
14 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28