

1 B. James Fitzpatrick (SBN: 129056)
2 Alison L. Baker (SBN: 193601)
3 **FITZPATRICK & SWANSTON**
4 555 S. Main Street
5 Salinas, CA 93901
6 Telephone: (831) 755-1311
7 Facsimile: (831) 755-1319

8 Larry W. Lee (SBN: 228175)
9 Kristen Agnew (SBN: 247656)
10 **DIVERSITY LAW GROUP, P.C.**
11 515 South Figueroa Street, Suite 1250
12 Los Angeles, California 90071
13 Telephone: (213) 488-6555
14 Facsimile: (213) 488-6554

15 Attorneys for Plaintiff Espiridion Gopar

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN BENITO**

ESPIRIDION GOPAR, an individual and on
behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

TAYLOR FARMS RETAIL, INC.; and DOES 1
through 50, inclusive,

Defendant.

Case No. CU-24-00222

**DECLARATION OF MARALLE
MESSRELIN IN SUPPORT OF
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR APPROVAL
OF PAGA SETTLEMENT UNDER
CALIFORNIA LABOR CODE § 2698 ET
SEQ.**

[Assigned for all purposes to The Honorable
Omar Rodriguez, Dept. 1]

Date: June 22, 2026
Time: 10:30 a.m.
Dept.: 1
Action Filed: September 11, 2024
Trial Date: None Set

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

I, Maralle Messrelian, declare as follows:

1. I am an attorney at law, duly licensed to practice before all Courts in the State of California, and am with the law firm Messrelian Law Inc., counsel of record for Plaintiffs Silvia Armenta, Maria Castro Garcia, Enedina De La Torre, Espiridion Gopar, Socorro Sena, and Adolfo Esquivel Illu (“Plaintiffs” or “PAGA Representatives”). I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth below and if called to testify I could and would do so competently.

8

2. In 2003, I earned a Bachelor of the Science degree with a major in Accounting from Cal State University, Northridge. In 2017, I earned a Juris Doctor degree from Southwestern University School of Law.

3. In December of 2017, the Supreme Court for the State of California admitted me as an Attorney and Counselor at Law and licensed me to practice law in all the Courts of this State.

4. I am experienced in handling employment law matters and specifically wage and hour cases. I have been practicing law since 2017. My experience has been almost exclusively in the area of employment law representing employees with claims of wrongful termination, harassment, whistleblower retaliation, discrimination, wage and hour, and family and medical leave violations. I am a member of the California Employment Lawyers Association (CELA).

5. In my representation of employees, I have prosecuted several lawsuits on behalf of employees with claims of rest and meal period and overtime violations or other wage claims.

6. I have been involved in the prosecution of numerous wage and hour class and representative actions at various stages of litigation. A small sampling of the wage and hour class and representative action cases in which I have been counsel of record is as follows:

a) *Joshua Silva v. Payo Laboratories, Inc., et al.*, San Luis Obispo County Superior Court, Case No. 19CV-0689 (appointed Class Counsel and granted final approval of class action settlement by the court).

b) *Mervin Perkins v. CC Venice, LLC, et al.*, Los Angeles Superior Court,
Case No. BC703660 (appointed Class Counsel and granted final approval of class action settlement)

1 by the court).

2 c) *Jashar Bryant v. Pinnacle Cabling & Construction, Inc., et al.*, Orange
3 County Superior Court, Case No. 30-2020-01123094-CU-OE-CXC (appointed Class Counsel and
4 granted final approval of class action settlement by the court).

5 d) *Collins v. Spa Products Import & Distribution Co., LLC, et al.*, Los Angeles
6 County Superior Court, Case No. 19STCV10586 (granted final approval of class action settlement
7 by the court)

8 e) *Sabrina Slater v. Avalon Care Center – Sonora, L.L.C., et al.*, Tuolumne
9 County Superior Court, Case No. CV62006 (granted final approval of class action settlement by the
10 court)

11 f) *Violet Avalos v. Smithcare Incorporated, et al.*, Tulare County Superior
12 Court, Case No. VCU272975 (granted final approval of class action settlement by the court)

13 g) *David Contreras v. HTX Services LLC, et al.*, Los Angeles County Superior
14 Court, Case No. 19STCV43405 (granted final approval of class action settlement by the court)

15 h) *Devin Cherry v. LA Corral Three, Inc., et al.*, Kern County Superior Court,
16 Case No., BCV-18-101817-DRL (granted final approval of class action settlement by the court)

17 i) *Vikki Curl and Anthony J. Gratton v. Reel Security Corp., et al.*, Los
18 Angeles County Superior Court, Case No. 18STCV09302 (granted final approval of class action
19 settlement by the court)

20 j) *Corrine Lashbrook and Joshua Sweat v. Andy's BP, Inc., et al.*, San Mateo
21 County Superior Court, Case No. 19CIV02344 (granted final approval of class action settlement by
22 the court)

23 k) *Stephen Aguirre and Christopher Walls v. Anlin Industries*, Fresno County
24 Superior Court, Case No. 17CECG04326 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
25 court)

26 l) *Rebecca Mallory v. Odyssey Healthcare Operating A, L.P.*, Kern County
27 Superior Court, Case No. BCV-19-102735 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
28 court)

1 m) *Wendy Chavez v. Texas De Brazil (Fresno) Corporation, et al.*, Fresno
2 County Superior Court, Case No. 19CECG04249 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement
3 by the court)

4 n) *Kevin Littleton v. Lincoln Military Property Management LP.*, San Diego
5 County Superior Court, Case No. 37-2018-00061799-CU-OE-NC (order and judgment approving
6 PAGA settlement by the court)

7 o) *Krystal Thomas v. Choice Physicians Network, Inc., et al.*, San Bernardino
8 County Superior Court, Case No. CIVDS2013964 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement
9 by the court)

10 p) *Otina Sengvong v. Probuild Company, LLC, et al.*, United States District
11 Court, Southern District of California, Case No. 3:19-cv-02231-MMA (JLB) (granted final approval
12 of class action settlement by the court)

13 q) *Orland Perez Avalos v. Milagros Restaurant LLC, et al.*, San Mateo County
14 Superior Court, Case No. 22-CIV-01222 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
15 court)

16 r) *David Xiqui Vasquez v. The Province LLC, et al.*, Santa Clara County
17 Superior Court, Case No. 22CV397541 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
18 court)

19 s) *Manuel Melendrez v. Clean Auto Inc., et al.*, San Mateo County Superior
20 Court, Case No. 22CIV01967 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court)

21 t) *Arturo Vera Lopez v. Green Valley Landscape, et al.*, Monterey County
22 Superior Court, Case No. 22CV003751 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
23 court)

24 u) *Erasmo Gomez v. A-1 Jay's Machining, Inc., et al.*, Santa Clara County
25 Superior Court, Case No. 22CV394795 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
26 court)

27 v) *Iris Rodriguez v. Facility Masters, Inc.*, Santa Clara County Superior Court,
28 Case No. 23CV423999 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court)

1 w) *Mariana Ruelas v. Vista La Mesa Senior Living, Inc., et al.*, San Diego
2 Superior Court, Case No. 37-2023-00050755-CU-OE-CTL (order and judgment approving PAGA
3 settlement by the court).

4 x) *Jose Angel Lopez v. Moreno & Associates, Inc., et al.*, Santa Clara Superior
5 Court, Case No. 23CV422622 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court).

6 y) *Irma Tapia v. Posada Associates, et al.*, Santa Cruz Superior Court, Case
7 No. 23CV00355 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court).

8 z) *Andres Ibarra v. Stadco, et al.* Los Angeles Superior Court, Case No.
9 23STCV26591 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court).

10 aa) *Alfredo Betancourt v. L3 Technologies, Inc.*, San Mateo County Superior
11 Court, Case no. 23-CIV-05704 (appointed Class Counsel and granted final approval of class action
12 settlement by the court).

13 bb) *Eduardo Martinez Guizar v. Air Culinaire Worldwide, LLC*, Santa Clara
14 County Superior Court, Case No. 23CV415879 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement
15 by the court).

16 cc) *Jesse Altamirano v. Weber Metals, Inc.*, Los Angeles Superior Court, Case
17 No. 24STCV05326 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court).

18 dd) *Noriell Hoff v. Anthem Mechanical, et al.*, Riverside County Superior
19 Court, Case No. CVRI2401199 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court).

20 ee) *Lukas Javier v. Hyatt Corporation dba The Seabird*, San Diego County
21 Superior Court, Case No. 37-2024-00018273-CU-OE-NC (order and judgment approving PAGA
22 settlement by the court).

23 ff) *Nathalie Barcenas v. El Toro Meat Shop*, Orange County Superior Court, Case
24 No. 30-2023-01351414-CU-OE-CXC (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
25 court).

26 gg) *Ruben Ortiz Salgado v. Bob Baffert Racing, Inc.*, Los Angeles County Superior
27 Court, Case No. 24STCV00686 (appointed Class Counsel and granted final approval of class action
28 settlement by the court).

1 hh) *Edgar Herrera v. Environmental Remedies, Inc., et al.*, Alameda County
2 Superior Court, Case No. 24CV092901 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the
3 court).

4 ii) *Sahid Irad Magana Segura v. DWH Restaurants, Inc., et al.*, Santa Clara
5 County Superior Court, Case No. 24CV428664 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement
6 by the court).

7 jj) *Bethany Clayton, et al. v Saltie Girl LA LLC*, Los Angeles Superior Court Case
8 No. 25STCV14374 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court).

9 kk) *Edilberto Paredes v. Heritage Landscape Services, Inc., et al.*, San Diego
10 Superior Court, Case No. 37-2024-00004064-CU-OE-CTL (appointed Class Counsel and granted
11 final approval of class action settlement by the court).

12 ll) *Cruz De Leon Serrano, et al. v. Kohana Coffee, LLC, et al.*, Contra Costa Superior
13 Court, Case No. C24-02642 (appointed Class Counsel and granted final approval of class action
14 settlement by the court).

15 mm) *Adolfo Lozoya Ramirez v. Bemus Landscape, Inc.*, Los Angeles Superior Court,
16 Case No. 24STCV08944 (order and judgment approving PAGA settlement by the court).

17 ***Fairness of the Settlement***

18 7. I believe that the Settlement is fair, adequate, and reasonable. The Settlement
19 provides substantial monetary benefits to Aggrieved Employees and is a product of diligent efforts
20 of PAGA Counsel to obtain the best possible result for the Aggrieved Employees. This Settlement
21 was reached following thorough legal and factual research and analysis, thorough review of extensive
22 data relative to the claims in the action, arduous settlement negotiations, and thorough investigation
23 of the underlying facts by the respective parties and review of records. The settlement negotiations
24 were, at all times, adversarial and non-collusive in nature. The proposed Settlement is within the
25 range of reasonableness, and a favorable result for the Aggrieved Employees.

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 I declare under penalty of perjury of the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is
2 true and correct.

3 Executed this May 28, 2026, at Glendale, California.

4
5 
6 Maralle Messrelian