

1 **BLUMENTHAL NORDREHAUG BHOWMIK**
2 **DE BLOUW LLP**

3 Norman B. Blumenthal (State Bar #068687)

4 Kyle R. Nordrehaug (State Bar #205975)

5 Aparajit Bhowmik (State Bar #248066)

6 2255 Calle Clara

7 La Jolla, CA 92037

8 Telephone: (858)551-1223

9 Facsimile: (858) 551-1232

10 Website: www.bamlawca.com

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff

12 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
13 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

14 DAGIM WOLDETSADIK, an individual, on
15 behalf of himself and on behalf of all persons
16 similarly situated,

17 Plaintiff,

18 vs.

19 THE MILLENNIUM GROUP OF
20 DELAWARE, INC., a Corporation; and
21 DOES 1 through 50, inclusive,

22 Defendants.

CASE NO.: **23CV049184**

**[PROPOSED] PRELIMINARY
APPROVAL ORDER**

Hearing Date: December 17, 2024

Hearing Time: 1:30 p.m.

Judge: Hon. Noel Wise

Dept: 21

Date Filed: October 25, 2023

Trial Date: Not set

23
24 This matter came before the Honorable Noel Wise of the Superior Court of the State of
25 California, in and for the County Alameda, on December 17, 2024, for hearing on the unopposed
26 motion by Plaintiff Dagim Woldetsadik ("Plaintiff") for preliminary approval of the Settlement
27 with Defendant The Millennium Group of Delaware, Inc. ("Defendant"). The Court, having
28

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL ORDER

1 considered the briefs, argument of counsel and all matters presented to the Court and good cause
2 appearing, hereby GRANTS Plaintiff's Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action
3 Settlement.

4
5 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:**

6 1. The Court preliminarily approves the Class Action and PAGA Settlement
7 Agreement ("Agreement") attached as Exhibit #1 to the Declaration of Kyle Nordrehaug in
8 Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement. This is based
9 on the Court's determination that the Settlement set forth in the Agreement is within the range of
10 possible final approval, pursuant to the provisions of Section 382 of the California Code of Civil
11 Procedure and California Rules of Court, rule 3.769.

12 2. This Order incorporates by reference the definitions in the Agreement, and all
13 terms defined therein shall have the same meaning in this Order as set forth in the Agreement.

14 3. The Gross Settlement Amount that Defendant shall pay is One Million Two
15 Hundred Fifty Thousand Dollars (\$1,250,000). It appears to the Court on a preliminary basis that
16 the settlement amount and terms are fair, adequate and reasonable as to all potential Class
17 Members when balanced against the probable outcome of further litigation and the significant
18 risks relating to certification, liability and damages issues. It further appears that investigation and
19 research have been conducted such that counsel for the Parties are able to reasonably evaluate
20 their respective positions. It further appears to the Court that the Settlement will avoid substantial
21 additional costs by all Parties, as well as avoid the delay and risks that would be presented by the
22 further prosecution of the Action. It further appears that the Settlement has been reached as the
23 result of serious and non-collusive, arm's-length negotiations.

24 4. The Court preliminarily finds that the Settlement appears to be within the range of
25 reasonableness of a settlement that could ultimately be given final approval by this Court. The
26 Court has reviewed the monetary recovery that is being granted as part of the Settlement and
27 preliminarily finds that the monetary settlement made available to the Class is fair, adequate, and
28

1 reasonable when balanced against the probable outcome of further litigation and the significant
2 risks relating to certification, liability, and damages issues.

3 5. The Agreement specifies for an attorneys' fees award not to exceed one-third of the
4 Gross Settlement Amount, an award of litigation expenses incurred, not to exceed \$55,000, and
5 proposed Class Representative Service Payment to the Plaintiff in an amount not to exceed
6 \$15,000. The Court will not approve the amount of attorneys' fees and costs, nor the amount of
7 any service award, until the Final Approval Hearing. Plaintiff will be required to present evidence
8 supporting these requests, including lodestar, prior to final approval.

9 6. The Court recognizes that Plaintiff and Defendant stipulate and agree to
10 representative treatment and certification of a class for settlement purposes only. This stipulation
11 will not be deemed admissible in this or any other proceeding should this Settlement not become
12 final. For settlement purposes only, the Court conditionally certifies the Class which consists of
13 "all individuals who are or previously were employed by Defendant in California, including any
14 employees staffed with Defendant by a third party, who were classified as non-exempt in
15 California and who did not execute Arbitration Agreements at any time during the Class Period."
16 The "Class Period" is October 25, 2019 through the date of this Order.

17 7. The Court concludes that, for settlement purposes only, the Class meets the
18 requirements for certification under section 382 of the California Code of Civil Procedure in that:
19 (a) the Class is ascertainable and so numerous that joinder of all members of the Class is
20 impracticable; (b) common questions of law and fact predominate, and there is a well-defined
21 community of interest amongst the members of the Class with respect to the subject matter of the
22 litigation; (c) the claims of the Plaintiff are typical of the claims of the members of the Class; (d)
23 the Plaintiff will fairly and adequately protect the interests of the members of the Class; (e) a class
24 action is superior to other available methods for the efficient adjudication of this controversy; and
25 (f) counsel for the Class is qualified to act as counsel for the Class and the Plaintiff is an adequate
26 representative of the Class.

27 8. The Court provisionally appoints Plaintiff as the representatives of the Class. The
28

1 Court provisionally appoints Norman B. Blumenthal, Kyle R. Nordrehaug, Aparajit Bhowmik,
2 Nicholas J. De Blouw, Jeffrey S. Herman, Sergio J. Puche, and Trevor G. Moran of Blumenthal
3 Nordrehaug Bhowmik De Blouw LLP as Class Counsel for the Class.

4 9. The Agreement provides for a PAGA Penalties out of the Gross Settlement
5 Amount of \$25,000, which shall be allocated \$18,750 to the Labor & Workforce Development
6 Agency (“LWDA”) as the LWDA’s 75% share of the settlement of civil penalties paid under this
7 Agreement pursuant to the PAGA and \$6,250 to the Aggrieved Employees. “Aggrieved
8 Employees” are all individuals who are or previously were employed by Defendant in California,
9 including any employees staffed with Defendant by a third party, and classified as non-exempt
10 employees in California and who did not execute Arbitration Agreements that were effective
11 during the PAGA Period (September 9, 2021 through the date of this Order). Pursuant to Labor
12 Code section 2699, subdivision (l)(2), the LWDA will be provided notice of the Agreement and
13 these settlement terms. The Court finds the PAGA Penalties to be reasonable.

14 10. The Court hereby approves, as to form and content, the Class Notice attached to the
15 Agreement as Exhibit A. The Court finds that the Class Notice appears to fully and accurately
16 inform the Class of all material elements of the proposed Settlement, of the Class Members’ right
17 to be excluded from the Class by submitting a written opt-out request, and of each member’s right
18 and opportunity to object to the Settlement. The Court further finds that the distribution of the
19 Class Notice substantially in the manner and form set forth in the Agreement and this Order meets
20 the requirements of due process, is the best notice practicable under the circumstances, and shall
21 constitute due and sufficient notice to all persons entitled thereto. The Court orders the mailing of
22 the Class Notice by first class mail pursuant to the terms set forth in the Agreement. If a Class
23 Notice Packet is returned because of an incorrect address, the Administrator will promptly search
24 for a more current address for the Class Member and re-mail the Class Notice Packet to any new
25 address for the Class Member no later than seven (7) days after the receipt of the undelivered
26 Class Notice.

1 11. The Court hereby appoints Apex Class Action, LLC as the Administrator. No later
2 than fifteen (15) days after this Order, Defendant will provide the Class Data to the Administrator.
3 The Administrator will perform address updates and verifications as necessary prior to the first
4 mailing. Using best efforts to mail it as soon as possible, and in no event later than fourteen (14)
5 days after receiving the Class Data, the Administrator will mail the Class Notice Packet to all
6 Class Members via first-class regular U.S. Mail to their last known address.

7 12. The Court hereby preliminarily approves the proposed procedure for exclusion
8 from the Settlement. Any Class Member may individually choose to opt out of and be excluded
9 from the Class as provided in the Class Notice by following the instructions for requesting
10 exclusion from the Class that are set forth in the Class Notice. All requests for exclusion must be
11 postmarked or received no later than thirty (30) calendar days after the date of the mailing of the
12 Class Notice (“Response Deadline”). If a Class Notice Packet is re-mailed, the Response Deadline
13 for requests for exclusion will be extended an additional fourteen (14) days. A Request for
14 Exclusion may also be faxed or emailed to the Administrator as indicated in the Class Notice.
15 Any such person who chooses to opt out of and be excluded from the Class will not be entitled to
16 any recovery under the Class Settlement and will not be bound by the Class Settlement or have
17 any right to object, appeal or comment thereon. Class Members who have not requested exclusion
18 shall be bound by all determinations of the Court, the Agreement and the Judgment. A request for
19 exclusion may only opt out that particular individual, and any attempt to effect an opt-out of a
20 group, class, or subclass of individuals is not permitted and will be deemed invalid.

21 13. Any Class Member who has not opted out may appear at the final approval hearing
22 and may object or express the Member’s views regarding the Settlement and may present evidence
23 and file briefs or other papers that may be proper and relevant to the issues to be heard and
24 determined by the Court as provided in the Class Notice. Class Members will have until the
25 Response Deadline to submit their written objections to the Administrator. Written objections
26 may also be faxed or emailed to the Administrator as indicated in the Class Notice. If a Class
27 Notice Packet is re-mailed, the Response Deadline for written objections will be extended an
28

1 additional fourteen (14) days. Alternatively, Class Members may appear at the Final Approval
2 Hearing to make an oral objection.

3 14. A final approval hearing shall be held before this Court on April 29, 2025 at 1:30
4 p.m. in Department 21 of the Alameda County Superior Court to hear the motion for final
5 approval and for attorneys' fees and costs, and to determine all necessary matters concerning the
6 Settlement, including: whether the proposed settlement of the Action on the terms and conditions
7 provided for in the Agreement is fair, adequate and reasonable and should be finally approved by
8 the Court; whether the Final Approval Order and Judgment should be entered herein; whether the
9 plan of allocation contained in the Agreement should be approved as fair, adequate and reasonable
10 to the Class Members; and to finally approve attorneys' fees and costs, service award, and the fees
11 and expenses of the Administrator. All papers in support of the motion for final approval and for
12 attorneys' fees, costs and service award shall be filed with the Court and served on all counsel no
13 later than sixteen (16) court days before the hearing and both motions shall be heard at this final
14 approval hearing.

15 15. Neither the Settlement nor any exhibit, document, or instrument delivered
16 thereunder shall be construed as a concession or admission by Defendant in any way that the
17 claims asserted have any merit or that this Action was properly brought as a class or representative
18 action, and shall not be used as evidence of, or used against Defendant as, an admission or
19 indication in any way, including with respect to any claim of any liability, wrongdoing, fault or
20 omission by Defendant or with respect to the truth of any allegation asserted by any person.
21 Whether or not the Settlement is finally approved, neither the Settlement, nor any exhibit,
22 document, statement, proceeding or conduct related to the Settlement, nor any reports or accounts
23 thereof, shall in any event be construed as, offered or admitted in evidence as, received as or
24 deemed to be evidence for any purpose adverse to the Defendant, including, but not limited to,
25 evidence of a presumption, concession, indication or admission by Defendant of any liability,
26 fault, wrongdoing, omission, concession or damage.

1 16. In the event the Settlement does not become effective in accordance with the terms
2 of the Agreement, or the Settlement is not finally approved, or is terminated, canceled or fails to
3 become effective for any reason, this Order shall be rendered null and void and shall be vacated,
4 and the Parties shall revert to their respective positions as of before entering into the Agreement,
5 and expressly reserve their respective rights regarding the prosecution and defense of this Action,
6 including all available defenses and affirmative defenses, and arguments that any claim in the
7 Action could not be certified as a class action and/or managed as a representative action . In such
8 an event, the Court's orders regarding the Settlement, including this Order, shall not be used or
9 referred to in litigation for any purpose. Nothing in this paragraph is intended to alter the terms of
10 the Agreement with respect to the effect of the Agreement if it is not approved.

11 17. The Court reserves the right to adjourn or continue the date of the final approval
12 hearing and all dates provided for in the Agreement without further notice to Class Members and
13 retains jurisdiction to consider all further applications arising out of or connected with the
14 proposed Settlement.

15 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

16 Dated: _____

17 _____
18 HON. NOEL WISE
19 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28