BIBIYAN LAW GROUP, P.C.
Keaton D. Mendoza (SBN 321172)
kmendoza@tomorrowlaw.com
1460 Westwood Boulevard
Los Angeles, California 90024
Tel: (310) 438-5555; Fax: (310) 300-1705

Attorneys for Plaintiff, ALEX RAD,
as an aggrieved employee, and on behalf of
all other aggrieved employees

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

ALEX RAD, as an aggrieved employee, and on behalf of all other aggrieved employees under the Labor Code Private Attorneys General Act of 2004,

Plaintiff,

v.

4 OVER, LLC, a California limited liability company; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO.: 23STCV07319

[Assigned for all purposes to the Hon. Samantha Jessner, in Dept. SSC-7]

DECLARATION OF DAVID D. BIBIYAN IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR APPROVAL OF REPRESENTATIVE ACTION SETTLEMENT

HEARING INFORMATION:

DATE: February 22, 2027
TIME: 11:00 a.m.
DEPT: 7

DECLARATION OF DAVID D. BIBIYAN

1. I am an attorney at law, duly licensed to practice before all the Courts of the State of California and I am the Chief Executive Officer and Managing Partner of Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., counsel of record for plaintiff Alex Rad ("Plaintiff") and all others aggrieved. As such, I am familiar with the file in this matter and, if called as a witness, I could and would competently testify to the following facts of my own personal knowledge.

2. I submit this declaration in support of Plaintiff's Motion for Approval of Representative Action Settlement. I believe that the Settlement is fair, reasonable and adequate in light of the probable outcome of further litigation relating to liability and damages issues.

PERSONAL QUALIFICATIONS

3. I graduated with a Bachelor of Arts degree from the University of California, Los Angeles in 2009.

4. I received my Juris Doctorate from The University of Chicago Law School in 2012.

5. After practicing for several years as a member of Cohen & Lord, P.C., practicing in an amorphous range of civil litigation on behalf of both plaintiffs and defendants, I opened up a law firm in 2014 with a concentration in representation of employees against employers to recover unpaid wages and vindicate harassment, discrimination and retaliation in various contexts.

6. I am an active member of the California Employment Lawyers' Association ("CELA"). I am one of its founding members and actively remain a member of its Reverse Auctions Subcommittee; in doing so, I serve as a mediator between other plaintiffs' counsel who bring overlapping class actions. I have also attended various Continuing Legal Education courses pertaining to advocacy on behalf of employees.

7. I also created the content for, helped organize, and served as the Moderator for the 2023 California Complex Symposium Wage and Hour/PAGA Section, a Continuing Legal Education seminar and forum featuring four respected Judges serving in the Complex Divisions of their respective county Superior Courts. In addition, my firm served as a sponsor of that event.

8. Once again, in 2026, I helped create content for, helped organize, and served as a Moderator for the 2026 California Complex Symposium Class Action Section, a Continuing Legal

Education seminar and forum featuring four respected Judges in the Complex Divisions of their respective Superior Courts. My Firm, again, served as a sponsor for the event.

9. Not only have I practiced almost exclusively in this field for years and have contributed to the legal education curriculum for attorneys practicing within it, I am also a published author in the Daily Journal as a contributor in the Wage and Hour and PAGA context, including, in December 15, an article entitled: "PAGA: What's Gone, What's Left and What's Next." I have also been a quoted source in multiple other publications, including in article pushed by Bloomberg Law dated November 1, 2023 entitled: "Adidas, Home Depot Sued in Test Cases on Job Ad Pay Transparency."

FIRM QUALIFICATIONS

10. My Firm has the experience, resources, and means necessary to allow us to provide adequate representation in complex wage-and-hour matters, including class and representative actions, to all stakeholders, be it the Labor and Workforce Development Agency ("LWDA") and/or Aggrieved Employees. With approximately fifty (50) attorneys, as well as supporting staff consisting of paralegals and legal assistants, my office has the capacity to represent hundreds of thousands of employees across state lines, bring forth efficient resolution of class actions and PAGA actions, engage in complex litigation, file contested motions for class certification, and engage in trial practice.

11. My office has filed contested motions for class certification in the past and have been appointed Class Counsel by the Superior Court of California and the Central District of California over the opposition of defendant-employers. Some of the classes and theories we have certified include, without limitation, for failure to pay the regular rate of pay; failing to pay overtime and minimum wages, including, without limitation, for temperature checks; failure to provide meal and rest premiums, including, without limitation, for requiring employees to walk during breaks; failure to timely pay wages prior to separation of employment; wage statement violations; and unfair competition. Some examples of matters in which we have done so include, without limitation:

- *Hernandez, et al. v. C.R. Lawrence* Co., Inc., Case No. 20STCV32372, California

Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. William Highberger presiding; and

• *Lopez v. Rolling Hills Country Club*, Case No. 21STCV22636, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles; Hon. Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding; and

• *Torres v. Johnston Nurseries, FLP,* Case No. BCV-19-100830 TSC, California Superior Court, County of Kern; Hon. Thomas S. Clark, presiding;

• *Officer v. Mid Valey Providers, Inc.,* Case No. 22CV-0201036, California Superior Court, County of Shasta; Hon. Benjamin Hanna, presiding; and

• *Thoma v. VXN Group, LLC*, Case No. 2-23-cv-04901-WLH-ACCV, United States District Court for the Central District of California; Hon. Wesley L. Hsu, presiding.

12. Moreover, my Firm has been designated class counsel hundreds of times in the past for purposes of certifying a class for settlement purposes by the Superior Court of California. Some examples of Actions in which I was appointed Class Counsel for include:

• *Santoyo v. Consolidated Foundries, Inc.,* Case No. BC612298, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Ann I. Jones, presiding;

• *Arensdorff v. Stanley Steemer International, Inc.*, Case No. BC681368, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos, presiding;

• *Barreto v. Don Roberto Jewelers, Inc.*, Case No. BC495451, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

• *Junior Amilcar Laguna Gonzalez v. Takaaki Koyama,* Case No. BC641998, Los Angeles Superior Court, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;

• *Rios v. Nongshim America, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1807390, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

• *Stoddard v. Molded Fiber Glass – West,* Case No. 1517758, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

• *Mata v. Sahara Scaffold, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1810785, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

• *Carrasco v. Pure Dental Solutions*, Case No. BC645995, Los Angeles Superior Court, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman, presiding;

• *Gonzalez v. Gochez, et al.*, Case No. BC648729, Los Angeles Superior Court, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;

• *Montoya v. Superior Paving Co.*, Case No. CIVDS1833422, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

• *Lopez v. Norred & Associates, Inc.,* Case No. CIVDS1824109, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, David S. Cohn, presiding;

• *Noyola v. Lacren, LLC,* Case No. BC717024, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. Anthony Mohr, presiding;

• *Luciano, et al. v. O'Tasty Foods, Inc., et al.*, Case No. BC711988, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;

• *Gordon v. Hospice Source, LLC,* Case No. 34-2018-00250022-CU-OE-GDS, California Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Christopher E. Krueger, presiding;

• *Barragan v. Refrigeration Supplies Distributor*, Case No. 19STCV09312, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;

• *Ramirez v. Acre Gourmet, Inc.,* Case No. CGC-19-575117, California Superior Court, County of San Francisco, Honorable Andrew Y.S. Cheng, presiding;

• *Villafuerte v. Bay Alarm Company*, Case No. BC689110, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;

• *Cazares v. Areas USA LAX, LLC,* Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;

• *Magana v. Castlerock Environmental, Inc., et al*., Case No. 19STCV38353, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

• *Chilel v. Sushi California, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

• *Malone v. Orange Courier, Inc., et al.,* Case No. 30-2016-00763474, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Glenda Sanders, presiding;

• *Rivera v. Talamo Food Services, Inc.,* Case No. 19CV355856, California Superior Court, County of Santa Clara, Honorable Patricia M. Lucas, presiding;

• *Olguin v. Cal Central Harvesting, Inc.,* Case No. 18CV03860, California Superior Court, County of Santa Barbara, Honorable James F. Rigali, presiding;

• *Pence v. Sober Living by the Sea, Inc.,* Case No. 2018-00988742, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman, presiding;

• *Franco v. Vincent Rags, Inc.,* Case No. 20STCV07768, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

• *Cabral v. Miller Castings, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;

• *Bolanos v. Texas Roadhouse, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Sunshine Sykes, presiding;

• *Rodriguez v. Scott A. Humphreys, Inc.*, Case No. 30-2021-01184556-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Matthew P. Guasco, presiding; and

• *Torres v. Primal Pet Foods, Inc.* Case No. FCS054783, California Superior Court, County of Solano, Honorable Wendy G. Getty, presiding;

• *Hanson v. Zapata Nuccio, Inc.,* Case No. 20STCV28951, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;

• *Molina v. Avibank Mfg, Inc.,* Case No. 20STCV03910, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable John P. Doyle, presiding;

• *Cetina v. Lawry's Restaurants, Inc.,* Case No. 19STCV05201, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;

• *Luna v. Pronto California General Agency, LLC,* Case No. 19STCV39951, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;

• *Alvarez v. Kazak-Mars, Inc.,* Case No. 20STCV42587, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;

• *Noe v. My Pillow, Inc.* Case No. CIVDS 2011360, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;

• *Nunez v. 2751 West Coast Acquisition Company*, Case No. 30-2020-01145215-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman,

Presiding;

• *Smith v. McMillen Enterprises, Inc.*, Case No. CV-20-002938, California Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable John R. Mayne, presiding;

• *Turner v. Plant Prefab Inc., et al..*, Case No. CIVDS2017517, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;

• *Duran v. Fresh Select, LLC,* Case No. VCU284892, California Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;

• *Reynoso, et al. v. Cream of the Crop AG Service, Inc.,* Case No. VCU278847, California Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;

• *Michel v. Universal Waste Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV46181, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding;

• *Jungers v. U.S. Borax Inc., et al.,* Case No. BCV-21-10003, California Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Bernard C. Barmann Jr. presiding;

• *Fortune v. Amoroso Limited Partnership, et al..,* Case No. 20STCV25874, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;

• *Montoya, et al. v. Remo, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV34614, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;

• *Rincon, et al. v. New-Indy Tripaq, LLC, et al..* Case No. 20STCV17118, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;

• *De Leon, et al. v. Wismettac Asian Foods, Inc.* Case No. 19STCV18172, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

• *Tapia v. Mercer Foods, Inc.* Case No. CV-21-000020, California Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;

• *Molina v. Reser's Fine Foods, Inc.* Case No. 37-2021-00013052-CU-OECTL, California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Eddie C. Sturgeon presiding;

• *Reyes v. Imperial Sprinkler Supply, Inc.* Case No. 30-2020-01167748-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Peter Wilson presiding;

• *Zavala, et al. v. PLS Check Cashers, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV42586, California Superior

Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

• *Paz v. Hill Brothers Chemical Company.* Case No. 20STCV48279, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;

• *Garcia v. Inwesco Incorporated.* Case No. 20STCV46833, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;

• *Guevara v. J&K Culver, LLC, et al.* Case No. 19STCV39951, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

• *Hamilton v. Michael Kors Stores, Inc. et al.,* Case No. 19STCV37061, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;

• *Arzooian v. A&M Administration, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV05576, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;

• *Santos, et al. v. Maruzen of America, Inc.,* Case No. 19STCV37662, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;

• *Schaffino v. M.O. Dion & Sons., Inc., et al.,* Case No. 20STCV38023, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Gail Killefer presiding;

• *Moreno v. Santa Paula Post Acute, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV12533, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;

• *Singer v. Desert Area Resources and Training,* Case No. BCV-21-101093, California Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Thomas S. Clark presiding;

• *Clarizio v. Guard-Systems, Inc.,* Case No. 21STCV28667, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Armen Tamzarian presiding;

• *Guzman v. Freschco Painters, Inc.,* Case No. 21STCV04683, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

• *Koutny v. PAE Aviation and Technical Services, LLC,* Case No. 21C-0106, California Superior Court, County of Kings, Honorable Melissa R. D'Morias presiding;

• *Rodriguez v. Pacifica Trucks, LLC,* Case No. 20STCV37576, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding;

• *Ramos v. AEGIS Treatment Centers, LLC,* Case No. 20STCV41429, California Superior

Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;

• *Valdez v. Integrated Building Services, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV37793, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

• *Harris v. America One Security, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV01399, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

• *Moreno v. M&J Seafood Company, Inc.* Case No. 22STCV03341, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;

• *Corrales v. Q&B Foods, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV40885, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu Berle presiding;

• *Arteaga v. Demolition Specialist, Inc.* Case No. RIC2001133, California Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;

• *Vigil, et al. v. Capstone Turbine Corporation,* Case No. 20STCV32123, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

• *Ramirez v. Sea-Win, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV22026, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

• *Ortega Chavez v. Winpak Lane, Inc.* Case No. CIVSB2207313, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;

• *Garcia v. American Licorice Company.* Case No. RG21107049, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Brad Seligman presiding;

• *Madrono v. Vitale Nursing, Inc, et al.,* Case No. 21STCV09845, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

• *Orellana v. Advanced Building Maintenance.* Case No. 34-2020-00286791-CU-OE-GDS, California Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Jill Talley presiding;

• *Aguilar v. Bioness, Inc., et al., Case* No. 21STCV41702, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

• *Antoine v. Pinky Beverly Hills, LLC., et al.* Case No. 19STCV44856, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

• *Bailey v. Cannon Constructors, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV38274, California Superior

Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;

- *Phambui v. Fashion Marketing and Merchandising Group, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV06634, Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Rice presiding;
- *Ortega Chavez v. Winpak Lane, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2202274, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
- *Carrasco v O.H. Barkhordar D.D.S., Inc., et al.* Case No. 22STCV21188, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff presiding;
- *Correia v. Gallo Glass Company, et al.* Case No. CV-21-006459, California Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
- *Davis v. Beeline Import and Services, LLC, et al. Case No.* CIVSB2119287, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;
- *Angel Lopez v Innovative Coatings Technology Corporation dba Incotec, et al. Case No. 30-2020-01173245-CU-OE-CXC,* California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon Hurwitz presiding;
- *Lopez v UPM, Inc., et al. Case No. 20STCV36695,* California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
- Moreno v. Infiniti Group LLC., et al. Case No. CIVSB2223551, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph T. Ortiz presiding;
- *Kelley v. Applus Technologies, Inc., et al. Case No.* CIVSB2204889, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
- *Hernandez v Bromley Foods, Inc., et al.* Case No. 56-2021-00561326-CU-OE-VTA, California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Henr Walsh presiding;
- *Heredia v. Alan Smith Pool Plastering, Inc., et al.* Case No. 30-2020-01163609-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman presiding;
- *Martinez Guzman v Freshco Painters Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV04683, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
- *Gomez Mireles v. USG Ceilings Plus, LLC., et al. Case No. 21STCV45606*, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

- *Garzon v. Mobile Hi-Tech Wheels, LLC., et al., Case No. 21STCV15396*, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
- *Dethrasavong v. ASI Computer Technologies, Inc., et al.* Case No. 20STCV32312, California Superior Court, County of Contra Costa, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
- *Lopez v. Waldorf Astoria Management LLC., et al.* Case No. 20STCV17212, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
- *Viveros v. Mission Produce, Inc., et al.* Case No. 20STCV15737, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
- *Flores v. United Maintenance Company, Inc.,* et al. Case No. 21STCV07008, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
- *Blandi v. Francesca Restaurant, LLC., et al.* Case No. 37-2022-00049034-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Marcella O. McLaughling presiding;
- *Lopez Cabrera v. South Valley Almond Company, LLC, et al.* Case No. BCV-2-100722, California Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Bernard C. Barmann, Jr. presiding;
- Guillermo Cruz v. Alma Family Serives, et al. Case No. 21STCV18156, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
- *Davood v. NKSFB, LLC, et al.* Case No. 22STCV17305, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui presiding;
- *Ferrer v. Ineos USA, LLC., et al.,* Case No. 21STCV28076, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
- *Portillo Sanchez v. Paragon Services Janitorial Orange County, LLC, et al.* Case No. 20STCV38562, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
- *Trigueros Garcia v. Highland Plastics, Inc., et al.,* Case No. CVRI2202836, California Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;
- *Magana Ramirez v. 360 Support Services, et al.* Case No. 22STCV20456, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
- *Morales v. Baldy's Restaurant Group, LLC.,* et al. Case No. 20STCV36535, California

Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;

- *Gonzales v. El Monte Rents, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV10209, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Rice presiding;
- *Gonzalez v. Total Education Solutions, Inc., et al.* Case No. 20STCV37984, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
- *Helaire v. Smithfield Packaged Meats Corp, et al.* Case No. JCCP5244, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
- *Hernandez v. Central Valley Recovery Services, et al.* Case No. VCU290220, California Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Brett Hillman presiding;
- *Hernandez v. SC Commercial, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2020-01166961-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon Hurwitz presiding;
- *Hines v. Constellis Integrated Risk Management Services, et al.* Case No. 20STCV26962, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui presiding;
- *Moya v. Valassis Direct Mail, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV09412, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding;
- *Jordan v. The Martin-Brower Company, LLC, et al.,* Case No. 21STCV41435, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, honorable Stuart Rice presiding;
- *Juarez v. Calmet Services, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV33668, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding*;*
- *Mcintosh v. WWL Vehicle Services Americas Inc., et al.* Case No. 56-2022-00562544-CU-OE-VTA, California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Benjamin Coats presiding;
- *Mendoza v. Amusement Industry, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV09790, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
- *Moore v. Dnata US Inflight Catering LLC, et al.* Case No. CGC-20-586512, California Superior Court, County of San Francisco, Honorable Curtis Karnow presiding;
- *Peterson v. Sorenson Engineering, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVDS2023994, California

Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;

- *Torres v. Laurel Avenue, LLC, et al.* Case No. CIVSB2202708, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;
- *Nunley v. Cardinal Logistics Management Corporation et al.* Case No. CIVSB2210430, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph T. Ortiz presiding;
- *Pastrana v. National Sign & Marketing Corporation et al.* Case No. CIVSB2118749, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;
- *Pineda v. Grand Life, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV28066, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
- *Pattingale v.* Laird Family Estate, LLC et al. Case No. 22CV000048, California Superior Court, County of Napa, Honorable Cynthia P. Smith presiding;
- *Ramirez v. Sea Win, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV22026, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawerence P. Riff presiding;
- *Reategui v. Cal Building & Maintenance Industries, Inc.,* Case No. 20STCV39648, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
- *Rodriguez v. ACRA Aerospace, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2020-01171360-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman presiding;
- *Rodriguez v. Ultra Pro International LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV11250, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
- *Ruiz v. Kleen Harvest, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21CV002319, California Superior Court, County of Monterey, Honorable Thomas W. Wills presiding;
- *Roberto Ruiz v. Protech Delivery and Installation et al.* Case No. 21STCV07001, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Rice presiding;
- *Russell v. CIMC Reefer Trailer, Inc., et al.* Case No. RIC2001777, California Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harld Hopp presiding;
- *Russell v. Staffmark Investment LLC, et al.* Case No. CVRI12103921, California Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;
- *Quintanilla et al. v. Chrome Hearts LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV43180, California

Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu B. Berle presiding;

- *Taat v. Acell, Inc., et al.* Case No. 37-2022-00005437-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Matthew C. Braner presiding;
- *Todd v. Motivate, LLC, et al.* Case No. CGC-23-605052, California Superior Court, County of San Francisco, Honorable Anne- Christine Massullo presiding;
- *Turner Sr., v. The Sidewalk Café, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV10154, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
- *Vargas-Flores v. Harbor Bay Club, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21CV002396, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Michael Markman presiding;
- *Vasquez v. Liquid Technologies, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVDS2023892, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph Ortiz presiding;
- *Vasquez et al. v. Kingswood LLC, et al.,* Case No. 20STCV32123, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
- *Sandoval Villafana v. Satco, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV17085, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
- *Williams v. Marrs Services, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV23775, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Stuart presiding;
- *Low v. Triple Canopy, Inc., et al.* Case No. 37-2023-0007078-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Carolyn Caietti presiding;
- *Camacho v. Premium Electric Corp, et al.* Case No. 22STCV26878, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding;
- *Lopez v. Bachem Americas, Inc., et al.* Case No. 23STCV04258, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Laura Seigle presiding;
- *Mendoza Cendejas v. E. & J. Gallo Winery, et al.* Case No. CV-22-005396, California Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
- *Romero v. Armstrong Installation Service, et al.* Case No. 22CV022519, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Noel Wise presiding;
- *Perez v. D&G Restaurants, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2021-01209638-CU-OE-CXC,

California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Peter Wilson presiding;

- *Sarmiento, et al. v. Neil Jones Food Company* Case No. 21CECG03825, California Superior Court, County of Fresno, Hon. Kristi Culver Kapetan presiding;
- *Garcia v. Nature Fresh Farms, LLC, et al.* Case No. ECU001961, California Superior Court, County of Imperial, Honorable Jeffery B. Jones presiding.
- *Machuca v. Charleys Philly Steaks, et al.* Case No. FCS057713, California Superior Court, County of Solano, Hon. Christine A. Carringer presiding;
- *Machuca v. Charleys Philly Steaks, et al.* Case No. FCS058064, California Superior Court, County of Solano, Hon. Christine A. Carringer presiding;
- *Olivares v. PCI Industries, LLC, et al.* Case No. 22STCV37965, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. Samantha P. Jessner presiding;
- *Robles v. FM Mexican Grill Inc., et al.* Case No. BC716450, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. Daniel J. Buckley presiding;
- *Sarmiento v. The Neil Jones Food Company*., et al. Case No. 21CECG03825, California Superior Court, County of Fresno, Hon. Kristi Culver Kapetan presiding;
- *Jimenez v. Route 66, Post Acute LLC Agency, LLC., et al.* Case No. 23STCV03441, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. Laura A. Seigle presiding;
- *Diaz v. UCA General Insurance Services, Inc., et al.* Case No. 30-2021-01185227-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Hon. Randall J. Sherman presiding;
- *Moctezuma v. Direct Line Global, LLC., et al.* Case No. 23CV033075, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Hon. Michael Markman presiding;
- *Williams v. Fortec Medical, Inc., et al*. Case No. 22CV014116, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Hon. Michael Markman presiding;
- *Franco et al. v. Inland Behavioral and Health Services et al.* Case No. CIVSB2118579, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Hon. Christian Towns presiding;
- *Arballo et al. v. California Custom Fruits and Flavors, Inc., et al.* Case No. 22STCV35657, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. Elihu Berle presiding;
- *Henderson v. Bizon Group, Inc., et al.* Case No. HG21115170, California Superior Court,

County of Alameda, Hon. Noel Wise presiding;

- *Boothe et al. v. Lemonade Restaurant Group, LLC, et al.* Case No. 22STCV38302, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. Laura Seigle presiding;
- *Montoya et al. v. FPR II, L.L.C., et al.* Case No. 22CV404499, California Superior Court, County of Santa Clara, Hon. Theodore C. Zayner;
- *Martinez Flores v. APT Maintenance, Inc., et al.,* Case No. 22CV024427, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Somnath Raj Chatterjee presiding;
- *Montoya v. TLMVACO LLC., et al.,* Case No. 23CV001593, California Superior Court, County of Monterey, Honorable Thomas W. Willis presiding;
- *Getaw v. Consolidated Disposal Services LLC., et al*., Case No. 21STCV22036, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu Berle presiding;
- *Barocio v. Industrial Field Services Inc., et al.,* Case No. 23STCV01522, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
- *Mostafa Gad v. St. George Auto Sales, Inc., et al.,* Case No. 30-2019-01058127-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon F. Hurwitz presiding;
- *Federics v. The HWood Group, LLC., et al.,* Case No. 21STCV44105, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
- *Deaver v. Blue Diamond Growers, et al.,* Case No. 34-2022-00316490-CU-OE-GDS, California Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Lauri A. Damrell presiding;
- *Rosa v. Paqueteria HR Express, Inc., et al.,* Case No. 23STCV00890, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Theresa M. Traber presiding;
- *Martnez v. Kenyon Plastering, Inc., et al.,* Case No. CIVSB2216155, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Christian Towns presiding;
- *Mora v. IGT Global Solutions Corporation, et al.,* Case No. 22STCV05393, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Timothy Patrick Dillon presiding;
- *Zuniga v. House Foods America Corporation, et al.,* Case No. 8:22-cv-00372-JWH-JDEx, California State Court, County of Orange, Honorable John W. Holcomb presiding;
- *Ramirez v. Primez Farms LLC, et al.,* Case No. 20STCV06328, California Superior

Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elaine Lu presiding;

- *Pacheco v. JCC Logistics, Inc., et al.,* Case No. B-21-102266, California Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Thomas Clark presiding;
- *Caballero v. The Ensign Group, Inc., et al.,* Case No. 19STCV43230, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
- *Graciano v. Hignell, Incorporated, et al.,* Case No. 22CV01196, California Superior Court, County of Butte, Honorable Stephen E. Benson presiding;
- *Ruiz v. Butterfield Electric, Inc., et al,* Case No. 22CV010662, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Michael Markman presiding;
- *Lozano v. LECC Berg Feinfield Eye Centers, LLC., et al.,* Case No. 22STCV40646, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
- *Villalpando et al. v. Los Angeles Truck Service, LLC, et al.,* Case No. 22STCV11804, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
- *Pablo Martinez v. Superior Cattle Feeders, LLC, et al.,* Case No. ECU002635, California Superior Court, County of Imperial, Honorable Brooks Anderhold presiding;
- *Milon v David & Esperanza Chavez Family Limited Partnership DBA Chavez Supermarket et al.*, Case No. 20CV368379, California Superior Court, County of Santa Clara, Honorable Theodore C. Zayner presiding;
- *Flores et al. v. Parkwood Landscape Maintenance Inc., et al.,* Case No.: 20STCV12795, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding;
- *Williams v. Holland Partner Group Operations, LLC, et al.,* Case No.: 23CV049392, California Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Sarah Standford-Smith presiding;
- *Estrada v Cookunity Inc., et al.,* Case No.: 24STCV12367, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Laura A. Seigle presiding;
- *Silvas v. Catalyst Family, Inc.,* Case No.: 21CV385134, California Superior Court, County of Santa Clara, Honorable Charles F. Adams presiding;
- *Arnett v. Traditions Health LLC*, Case No.: CVRI2305219, California Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harold W. Hopp presiding;

• *Gammaro v. Walgreen Pharmacy Services Midwest, LLC*, Case No.: 23STCV00615, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Daniel M. Crowley;

• *Montoya v. Beauty 21 Cosmetics, Inc*., Case No.: CIVSB2314841, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph T. Ortiz presiding; *and*

• *Santos Martinez et al. v. Le Zinc Bar LLC*, Case No.: 22STCV09367, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;

13. I have also successfully resolved several "PAGA Only" matters as counsel for proxies of the Labor and Workforce Development Agency, including, without limitation:

• *Flores v. Delta Apparel, Inc.*, Case No. BC641499, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Daniel J. Buckley, presiding;

• *Segura v. CJ Foods Service Holdings USA, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV24918, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maureen Duffy-Lewis, presiding;

• *Sierra v. Nexem-Allied, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV11281, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Randolph M. Hammock, presiding;

• *Nodal v. Sodexo, Inc.,* Case No. 20STCV40601, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff, presiding; and

• *Cooper v. Lucas Health Partners,* Case No. 20STCV20050, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;

• *Herrera v. Greystar Management, LP, et al.,* Case No. 37-2020-00009672-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Carolyn Caietti, presiding;

• *Slater v. Jo-Ann Stores, LLC.,* Case No. 21STCV18454, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maurice A. Leiter, presiding;

• *Bolanos v. Canoga Park Heating & Air Conditioning, Co., Inc.,* Case No. 21STCV12674, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yolanda Orozco, presiding;

• *Granados v. Cosmetic Ideas, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV10797, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Richard L. Fruin, presiding;

• *Ruano v. DPC Woodwork, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV00408, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Jon R. Takasugi presiding;

• *Tarin v. TPS Solutions, Inc.,* Case No. 21STCV07844, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren E. Nelson presiding;

• *Echegoyen v. The ADT Security Corporation.,* Case No. 21STCV07206, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;

• *Davood v. NKSFB, LLC., et al.,* Case No. 22STCV17305, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui presiding;

• *Hardy v. Texas Roadhouse Management Corp., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2222259*,* California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;

• *Michelle v. Smithfield Packaged Meats Corp., et al*. Case No. JCCP5244, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jesica Morgan, presiding;

• *Hernandez v. SC Commercial, LLC, d.b.a. SC Fuels, et al.,* Case No. 30-2020-01166961-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon. Hurwitz presiding;

• *Hines v. Constellis Integrated Risk Management Services, et al.* Case No. 20STCV26962*,* California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui presiding;

• *Iraheta v Legacy Farmers, Inc., et al.* Case No. MSC21-00762*,* California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Charles S. Treat presiding; and

• *Landin v Central Janitors' Supply Co., Inc., et al.,* Case No. CV-21-006391, California Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding.

• *Bailey v. Cannon Constructors, et al.* Case No. 21STCV38274, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;

• *Johns, et al. v. Whelan Security of California, Inc., et al.* Case No. 22STCV68687, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Laura Seigle presiding;

• *Carrion v. Clutter, Inc., et al.* Case No. 23STCV06709, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kerry Bensinger presiding;

• *Delia v. The Irvine Company, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2019-01050823-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable William D. Claster presiding;

• *Landin v. Central Janitor's Supply Co., Inc., et al.* Case No. CV-21-006391, California

Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;

- *German Vaca et al.*, *v. California Pizza Kitchen, Inc*., et al. Case No. 30-2022-01278828-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall Sherman presiding;
- *London Young v. Amazon.com LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV38280, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elaine Lu presiding;
- *Martinez v. Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc., et al. Case No. 22STCV17283, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Armen Tamzarian presiding;*
- *Latrice Ackles v. Brinker Restaurant Corporation, et al*. Case No. 22STCV19068, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Gail Killefer presiding; and
- *Ruiz v. Edelbrock Foundry, LLC, et al.* Case No. 20STCV19057, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding.
- *Bey v. Holliday Rock Co., Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2316000, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Kory Mathewson presiding;
- *Ruvalcaba v. Rod Fraser Enterprises, Inc., et al.* Case No. 30-2023-01308022-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Hon. Layne H. Melzer presiding;
- *Rhea et al. v. Stars behavioral health Group, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVDS2017661, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Hon. Joseph T. Ortiz presiding;
- *Franco et al. v. Golden Queen Mining Company, LLC, et al,* Case No. BCV-23-102813, California Superior Court, County of Kern, Hon. T. Mark Smith presiding; and
- *Ledesma v. Connell Chevrolet et al.* Case No. 30-2021-01210019-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable William Claster presiding;
- *Essary v. Community Corporation of Santa Monica, et al.* Case No. 23STCV03250, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Samantha Jessner presiding;
- *Nestor et al., v. Redlands Community Hospital, et al.* Case No. CIVSB2327089, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Wilfred J. Schneider, Jr. presiding;
- *Azzawi v. C-Store Services, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVSBZ228712, California Superior

Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph B. Wildman presiding;

- *Quintero v MW BHCC LLC, et al.* Case No. 22STCV32539, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Rice Stuart presiding;
- *Mendivil v. HG Foods, LLC,* Case No.: VCU296223, California Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Gary M. Johnson presiding; and
- *Barron De Expinoza v. Silicon Resourcing Solutions, LLC*., Case No.: 2023CUOE010215, California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Maureen M. Houska presiding.

14. Thus, I and members of my Firm are well qualified to evaluate the claims at issue and viability of Defendants' defenses.

15. After a thorough investigation and settlement discussions, I arrived at terms that I viewed was in the best interest of Plaintiff and Aggrieved Employees.

COMMOND FUND ALLOCATION IS REASONABLE & APPROPRIATE

16. PAGA Counsel requests a fee of thirty-five percent (35%) of the Gross Settlement Amount, which, unless and until escalated pursuant to the Parties' Settlement Agreement, amounts to $122,500.00.

17. I am informed and believe that, historically, courts have awarded percentage fees in the range of 20% to 50% in collective actions, depending on the circumstances of the case. Thus, the requested fee is consistent with the fees awarded in other PAGA settlements approved by California courts.

18. Moreover, I believe the fees are not just consistent with previous settlements approved by California Courts, but well earned.

19. It has been a long-recognized principle that an attorney merits a significantly larger fee when the compensation is contingent, rather than being fixed on a time or contractual basis.

20. During the period that this Action has been pending, PAGA Counsel has advanced all expenses and has not received any compensation for prosecuting the Action on behalf of the State and other Aggrieved Employees. Specifically, PAGA Counsel invested time and resources into litigating this Action, with over $30,697.11 of costs to date and counting deferred to the end

of the case and entirely contingent on the outcome which, as set forth above, the recovery of which was far from certain with much of the litigation still potentially pending. As set forth below, Counsel also expended hundreds of hours in prosecuting this matter. This is particularly true since the Supreme Court decided *Turietta v. Lyft, Inc.* (2024) 16 Cal.5th 664, and it is now possible that all costs expended may be lost without recourse.

21. The significant outlay of monetary, and personnel resources has been completely at risk and wholly dependent upon obtaining a substantial settlement or the imposition of civil penalties at trial PAGA Counsel should not be penalized with a lower fee for settling the case prior to trial, because the percentage of the fund method "encourages early settlement, which avoids protracted litigation."

22. Thus, the requested award of attorneys' fees is reasonable under the percentage of the fund method.

THE REQUESTED FEES ARE REASONABLE UNDER A LODESTAR CROSS-CHECK

23. I understand from my position as principal of Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., my involvement with the case, and information provided by my staff, that Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., will have collectively billed 210.8 hours at customary hourly rates

24. My qualifications are set forth at length above. I expended approximately 11.3 hours in this matter primarily in helping to formulate the theory of the case, helping to prepare for mediation, attending mediation, and helping to prepare the instant motion for approval, and I billed approximately 15.8 hours for my time performing these tasks. My hourly rate is $1,200 per hour

25. Robert Wilson received a Juris Doctorate from Albany Law School and became a member of the California State Bar in 2003. Mr. Wilson practiced in wide array of labor and employment litigation on both plaintiff and defendant sides. He served as a Partner at Gordon Rees Scully Mansukhani before becoming a Partner at Fisher & Phillips, LLP. In 2024, he joined Bibiyan Law Group as a Senior Managing Attorney. He billed 21.6 hours for his time at a billing rate of $1,200 per hour.

26. Paal Bakstad became a member of the California State Bar in 2001 and after over

twenty years of litigation, became a Senior Attorney with Bibiyan Law Group. Mr. Bakstad performed legal research on issues of joint employer liability and issues pertaining to enforceability of arbitration, including briefing motions to compel arbitration, as well as corresponding with opposing counsel regarding mediation. He also performed substantial work in litigation, prepared the matter for mediation, and attended mediation. He billed 71.4 hours to the file at his billing rate of $700 per hour.

27. Pavel Rukavishnikov became a member of the California State Bar in 2024. Prior to relocating to the United States, he practiced law in Russia for nearly fifteen years. Before joining Bibiyan Law Group, he represented plaintiffs in wage and hour class actions and interned with the Los Angeles County Superior Court. Since joining Bibiyan Law Group in November 2025, he has represented plaintiffs in wage and hour class action litigation. He billed 39.3 hours to the file at his billing rate of $450 per hour.

28. Calyn Hadlock became a member of the California State Bar in 2023 and is now a Managing Attorney with Bibiyan Law Group. As a member of Bibiyan Law Group she has successfully prosecuted numerous wage and hour class and PAGA actions and has an extremely successful track record of obtaining large settlements and motion practice on behalf of plaintiffs. She billed 24.1 hours to the file at her billing rate of $600 per hour.

29. Vedang J. Patel has been a member of my law firm for over four (4) years and served as class counsel on numerous actions on which I was also named class counsel. Prior to working with Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., he practiced law with Murchison & Cumming, LLP on a variety of matter on behalf of defendants. Thereafter, he joined Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., practicing law on behalf of plaintiffs in matters of employment law, and specifically on issue of unpaid wages and class action settlements. He is currently a Partner and Senior Managing Attorney with Bibiyan Law Group, P.C.. He billed 4.7 hours to the file at his billing rate of $900 per hour.

30. Keaton Mendoza became a member of the California State Bar in 2018 and, during that time, performed a wide array of both in-house and litigation work. Prior to working with Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., he practiced law at Lewis Brisbois Bisgaard & Smith handling general liability defendant-side litigation. Prior to Lewis Brisbois, he also practiced in-house in the

Adventist Health Office of General Counsel handling labor, employment and wage-and-hour matters for the health system. He joined Bibiyan Law Group in February 2026 practicing law on behalf plaintiffs in matters of employment law, and specifically on issue of unpaid wages and class action settlements. He is currently an associate attorney at Bibiyan Law Group, P.C. where he has played a key part of achieving settlements on tens of wage-and-hour class and representative matters, and has been named class counsel on tens of cases, as well. He billed 21.4 hours to the file for aiding in the settlement papers at his billing rate of $450 per hour.

31. Collectively, the members of the Firm who billed time on this matter performed the following duties:

a) The investigation of the matter, including meeting with Plaintiff, reviewing policies provided by Plaintiff, review of documents in Plaintiff's possession, review and analysis of Plaintiff's personnel files, and exploring Defendants' corporate structure to determine whether any additional individuals or entities should be named in the litigation, and researching other cases filed against Defendants;

b) Researching the dockets for other cases filed against Defendants, determining whether they named all allegedly culpable defendants and included all theories available;

c) Compliance with prerequisites in connection with Plaintiff's causes of action under PAGA;

d) Filing and serving of the PAGA Notice;

e) Filing and serving pleadings in the Action;

f) Review and analysis of Defendants' Motion to Compel Arbitration and Reply;

g) Preparing an Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Compel Arbitration;

h) Prepare for and attend hearing on Defendants' Motion to Compel Arbitration;

i) Review and analysis of the Court's Minute Orders, attention to scheduling and delegation of actions in light thereof, drafting and filing Case Management Statements, and preparation for appearance at the Case Management Conferences;

j) Meeting and conferring with counsel for Defendants, drafting and filing Joint

Statements and Joint Reports in advance of the conferences and hearings held by the Court, and preparation and attendance of the same;

k) Obtaining and reviewing informal discovery from Defendants, including time and payroll records for a sampling of the Aggrieved Employees, Defendants' written policies, and other informal discovery produced for Plaintiff to evaluate the claims;

l) Discussing the potential merits of mediation, as well as negotiating the parameters thereof and the informal discovery to be exchanged beforehand, which involved various iterations of written correspondence back and forth and several telephone discussions between counsel regarding the potential scope of discovery, as well as the scope of the pleadings;

m) Working with opposing counsel and consultants for the receipt of a representative sampling and analyzing the same with the aid of retained expert data consultants and Plaintiff to perform analyses of liability and exposure;

n) Preparation of mediation brief, analysis, and damages model in conjunction with expert data consultants, for use at the mediation session;

o) Attendance at a full-day mediation session by various attorneys;

p) Extensive negotiation of the PAGA Settlement Agreement involving numerous drafts exchanged between counsel for the Parties;

q) Drafting and reviewing the Payment Letter to be sent to by the Settlement Administrator to the Aggrieved Employees;

r) Communicating with Plaintiff who requested updates or other information regarding this matter;

s) Requesting bids from third-party settlement administrators for settlement administration;

t) Review, revise, and further meet and confer with Defendants regarding a Protective Order;

u) Reviewing and analyzing the Settlement Administrator's report to provide the information necessary for the Court's review of the Motion for Approval of PAGA Settlement; and

v) Preparing the Motion for Approval of PAGA Settlement and preparation of all documents in support of the Motion.

32. The Firm also employs experienced paralegals with tens of years of experience, as well as legal assistants who help the paralegals with their day-to-day duties. The Firm billed its Paralegals out for 10.4 hours on this matter at a rate of $200 for the paralegals, and its Legal Assistants for 6.6 hours at a rate of $95 per hour.

33. In total, PAGA Counsel has expended over 210.8 hours, and at their hourly rates, this results in a total lodestar amount of $138,172.50. Plaintiff requests attorneys' fees of only $122,500.00 which amounts to less than the time actually billed at counsel's hourly rates.

THE QUALITY OF REPRESENTATION AND THE RESULTS OBTAINED SUPPORT THE SETTLEMENT, PARTICULARLY IN LIGHT OF THE COMPLEX NATURE OF THE LITIGATION

34. My office used a high level of skill in addressing the difficult questions presented in this case, which involved the contested issues regarding: the compliance of various of Defendants' policies with the Labor Code, including whether all time worked was paid for; whether meal and/or rest breaks were given in compliance with the Labor Code; issues regarding the timeliness of pay, including whether all pay was received by termination or resignation; the sufficiency and accuracy of wage statements (including whether issues therewith, if any, were intentional or injurious); and various other issues. Proof of PAGA Counsel's skill in this area of law lies in the size of this Settlement and the recoveries of the State and Aggrieved Employees despite Defendants' contentions that Plaintiff's unpaid wages claims are speculative; Defendants' contention that their meal and rest period policies were compliant; and other hurdles encountered by PAGA Counsel that were traversed in reaching this Settlement pertaining to evolving case law regarding PAGA actions.

COUNSEL SHOULD BE REIMBURSED FOR COSTS EXPENDED, AS WELL

35. The Settlement provides for reimbursement of PAGA Counsel's reasonable litigation costs in an amount up to $50,000.00. PAGA Counsel request only $30,697.11 in total for costs incurred. Because these costs are reasonable, PAGA Counsel requests that the Court

approve those costs.

36. The itemized costs incurred by Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., in the above referenced matter total $30,697.11. A more detailed itemized list of costs is attached hereto as Exhibit "1."

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the state of California that the foregoing is true and correct this 19th day of October, 2026, at Los Angeles, California.

/s/ David D. Bibiyan
David D. Bibiyan

EXHIBIT 1

BIBIYAN LAW GROUP, P.C.

October 19, 2026

DATE	TYPE	PAYABLE TO
9/1/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
7/16/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
7/1/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
6/1/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
5/1/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
4/29/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
4/9/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
4/9/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
4/9/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
4/1/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
3/2/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
2/2/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
1/13/2026	Court Hearing	Steno Agency, Inc.
1/13/2026	Court Hearing	Steno Agency, Inc.
1/8/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
1/2/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
1/2/2026	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
12/10/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
12/3/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
12/3/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
12/1/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
11/3/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
10/1/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
9/22/2025	Case Document Purchase	Los Angeles Superior Court
9/19/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
9/2/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
8/25/2025	Case Document Purchase	Los Angeles Superior Court
8/21/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.

8/20/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
8/10/2025	Case Document Purchase	Los Angeles Superior Court
8/10/2025	Case Document Purchase	Los Angeles Superior Court
8/10/2025	Case Document Purchase	Los Angeles Superior Court
8/10/2025	Case Document Purchase	Los Angeles Superior Court
8/4/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
7/22/2025	Case Document Purchase	Los Angeles Superior Court
7/21/2025	Service of Process	Steno Agency, Inc.
7/17/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
7/1/2025	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
7/1/2025	Analysis	Berger Consulting Group, LLC
6/2/2025	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
5/14/2025	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
4/4/2025	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
3/24/2025	E-Filing/E-Service	Steno Agency, Inc.
3/5/2025	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
2/5/2025	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
1/8/2025	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
10/24/2024	Mediation	Winikow Mediation
8/16/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
8/13/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
7/2/2024	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
5/17/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
5/14/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
5/13/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
5/13/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
4/2/2024	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
4/23/2024	Costs Associated with Related/Dismissed Case	All-N-One Legal Support
3/13/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
2/16/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
1/30/2024	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
1/5/2024	E-Service	Case Anywhere LLC
10/5/2023	Service of Process	Case Anywhere LLC
4/11/2023	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
3/17/2023	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
3/16/2023	Postage	United States Postal Service
3/7/2023	E-Filing	All-N-One Legal Support
3/6/2023	Process Service	All-N-One Legal Support
3/6/2023	Process Service	All-N-One Legal Support

List of Expenses Items 2024.03.28 - 10/19/2026

12/28/2022		All-N-One Legal Support
12/27/2022	Postage	United States Postal Service
12/27/2022	Postage	United States Postal Service
12/20/2022	Postage	United States Postal Service
Various Dates	Photocopies (200 x $0.20 copies)	
		Total

David D. Bibiyan
Attorney at Law
1460 Westwood Blvd.
Los Angeles, California 90024
310.438.5555 T
310.300.1705 F
david@tomorrowlaw.com
www.tomorrowlaw.com

TOTAL AMOUNT	
$	45.00
$	54.95
$	45.00
$	45.00
$	45.00
$	54.95
$	54.95
$	121.95
$	54.95
$	51.00
$	45.00
$	51.00
$	1,050.00
$	1,050.00
$	54.95
$	63.00
$	54.95
$	94.95
$	54.95
$	54.95
$	51.00
$	45.00
$	51.00
$	5.00
$	81.95
$	45.00
$	10.00
$	81.95

$	81.95
$	27.80
$	46.40
$	55.00
$	21.89
$	45.00
$	7.80
$	175.00
$	94.95
$	45.00
$	8,690.00
$	45.00
$	35.25
$	45.00
$	54.95
$	45.00
$	45.00
$	135.00
$	13,500.00
$	13.70
$	13.70
$	135.00
$	13.70
$	33.70
$	13.70
$	9.50
$	153.00
$	1,488.30
$	13.70
$	13.70
$	13.70
$	171.00
$	135.00
$	13.20
$	13.20
$	0.60
$	13.20
$	93.50
$	93.50

$	1,448.20
$	15.64
$	15.64
$	15.64
40	
$	30,697.11