

FILED

2025 SEP -3 PM 12: 58

STEPHANIE GONNER, CLERK

Yodane Pashaw

Benjamin H. Haber (SBN 315664)
benjamin.haber@wilshirelawfirm.com
Daniel J. Kramer (SBN 314625)
daniel.kramer@wilshirelawfirm.com
WILSHIRE LAW FIRM
660 S. Figueroa Street, Sky Lobby
Los Angeles, CA 90017
Telephone: (213) 381-9988
Facsimile: (213) 381-9989

Attorneys for Plaintiff Joshua Byers

[Additional counsel listed on following page]

**SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN JOAQUIN**

JOSHUA BYERS, individually, and on behalf
of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

PAN PACIFIC RV CENTERS, INC., a
California corporation; and DOES 1 through 10,
inclusive,

Defendants.

RICKY HERRERA, an individual,

Plaintiff,

v.

PAN PACIFIC RV CENTERS, INC., a
California corporation; and DOES 1 through 10,
inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No.: STK-CV-UOE-2023-742
Consolidated with Case No.: STK-CV-UOE-
2023-0005862

Assigned to Hon. Blanca Banuelos, Dept. 10B

**NOTICE OF RULING RE: ORDER
GRANTING MOTION FOR FINAL
APPROVAL**

Date: August 28, 2025
Time: 9:00 a.m.
Dept.: Dept. 10A

1 Gabriel J. Pimentel (SBN 265328)

2 GJP@pimentellaw.com

3 Jenna M. Koleson (SBN 350355)

4 JMK@pimentellaw.com

5 **PIMENTEL LAW, P.C.**

6 30 N. Raymond Avenue, Suite 211

7 Pasadena, CA 91103

8 Telephone: (626) 765-6505

9 Facsimile: (626) 628-3036

10 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Ricky Herrera*

TO ALL PARTIES & ATTORNEYS OF RECORD:

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiff's Motion for Final Approval has been GRANTED.

A true and correct copy of the Court's Order is attached hereto as **Exhibit A**.

PIMENTEL LAW, P.C.

Dated: September 2, 2025

By: Gabriel J. Pimentel
Gabriel J. Pimentel, Esq.
Jenna M. Koleson, Esq.
Attorneys for Plaintiff

AUG 06 2025

Benjamin H. Haber (SBN 315664)
benjamin.haber@wilshirelawfirm.com
Daniel J. Kramer (SBN 314625)
daniel.kramer@wilshirelawfirm.com
WILSHIRE LAW FIRM
3055 Wilshire Blvd., 12th Floor
Los Angeles, California 90010
Telephone: (213) 381-9988
Facsimile: (213) 381-9989

Attorneys for Plaintiff Joshua Byers

[Additional counsel listed on following page]

**SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN JOAQUIN**

JOSHUA BYERS, individually, and on behalf of
all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

PAN PACIFIC RV CENTERS, INC., a California
corporation; and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive,

Defendants.

RICKY HERRERA, an individual,

Plaintiff,

v.

PAN PACIFIC RV CENTERS, INC., a
California corporation; and DOES 1 through 10,
inclusive,

Defendants.

108
8-25
AUG 28 2025
Filed
STEPHANIE BOHRER, CLERK
By *[Signature]*
DEPUTY

Case No.: STK-CV-UOE-2023-742

Consolidated with Case No.: STK-CV-UOE-
2023-0005862

CLASS & REPRESENTATIVE ACTION

*[Assigned for all purposes to: Hon. Blanca
Banuelos, Dept. 10B]*

**PROPOSED ORDER GRANTING
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR FINAL
APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION &
PAGA SETTLEMENT**

*[Filed with Notice of Motion & Motion for
Approval of Class & PAGA Settlement;
Declaration of Gabriel J. Pimentel;
Declaration of Jenna M. Koleson;
Declaration of Settlement Administrator]*

FINAL APPROVAL HEARING

Date: August 28, 2025
Time: 9:00 AM
Dept: 10B

Complaint filed: January 30, 2023
FAC filed: June 1, 2023
Trial date: Not set

1 Gabriel J. Pimentel (SBN 265328)

2 GJP@pimentellaw.com

3 Jenna M. Koleson (SBN 350355)

4 JMK@pimentellaw.com

5 **PIMENTEL LAW, P.C.**

6 30 N. Raymond Avenue, Suite 211

7 Pasadena, CA 91103

8 Telephone: (626) 765-6505

9 Facsimile: (626) 628-3036

10 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Ricky Herrera*

1 **ORDER GRANTING FINAL APPROVAL & JUDGMENT**

2 The Court has before it Plaintiffs Joshua Byers and Ricky Herrera's (collectively,
3 "Plaintiffs") Motion for Final Approval of Class Action & PAGA Settlement. Having reviewed
4 the Motion papers, the declarations of counsel, the settlement administrator, and the plaintiffs, the
5 Class Action and PAGA Settlement Agreement and Class Notice (which is referred to here as the
6 "Settlement Agreement"), and good cause appearing, the Court hereby finds and orders as follows:

7 **THE COURT MAKES THE FOLLOWING DETERMINATION AND ORDERS:**

8 The Court hereby makes a final determination that the settlement amount is fair and
9 reasonable to the Class when balanced against the probable outcome of further litigation relating
10 to class certification, liability and damages issues and potential appeals. The Court finds that
11 significant investigation, research, and litigation has been conducted such that counsel for the
12 Parties at this time are able to reasonably evaluate their respective positions; settlement at this
13 time will avoid substantial costs, delay, and risks that would be presented by the further
14 prosecution of the litigation; the proposed Settlement has been reached as the result of intensive,
15 serious, and non-collusive negotiations between the Parties.

16 ACCORDINGLY, GOOD CAUSE APPEARING, THE MOTION FOR FINAL
17 APPROVAL OF THE CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT IS HEREBY GRANTED, AND AS A
18 PART OF SAID FINAL APPROVAL, THE COURT HEREBY ORDERS THAT THE CLASS BE
19 CERTIFIED FOR SETTLEMENT PURPOSES ONLY.

20 **THE COURT FURTHER FINDS AS FOLLOWS:**

21 1. The Court grants final approval of the Settlement and the Settlement Class based
22 upon the terms set forth in the Settlement Agreement between Plaintiffs Joshua Byers and Ricky
23 Herrera and Defendant Pan Pacific RV Centers ("Defendant"), attached hereto as Exhibit 1.

24 2. The Court finds that the Settlement Agreement is within the range of
25 reasonableness of a settlement that could ultimately be given final approval by this Court and the
26 terms of the Settlement are fair, reasonable, and adequate, pursuant to Section 382 of the California
27 Code of Civil Procedure.

28 3. The Court notes that Defendant has agreed to a non-reversionary cash settlement

1 and to create a Common Fund in the maximum amount of \$575,000.00 to cover (a) settlement
2 payments to class members who do not validly opt out; (b) a \$20,000.00 payment to the State of
3 California, Labor & Workforce Development Agency for its share of the settlement of claims for
4 penalties under the Private Attorneys General Act, with 75% of which (\$15,000.00) will be paid
5 to the LWDA and 25% (\$5,000.00) will be paid to eligible Aggrieved Employees; (c) Class
6 Representative service payment of \$10,000.00 each for Plaintiffs Joshua Byers and Ricky Herrera;
7 (d) Class Counsel's attorneys' fees, 35% of the Gross Settlement Amount (\$201,250.00), and
8 \$18,477.77 in costs for actual litigation expenses incurred by Class Counsel; and (e) Settlement
9 Administration Costs of up to \$10,000.00. Defendant will pay out the entirety of the Net Common
10 Fund to the Participating Class Members, with any uncashed portion of the Net Common Fund to
11 be distributed in accordance with Code of Civil Procedure § 384.

12 4. The Court finds that the elements of numerosity, commonality, typicality,
13 and adequacy have been established to support certification of the Class for settlement purposes,
14 with Plaintiffs acting as Class Representatives.

15 5. The Class certified by this Order for settlement purposes only (the "Settlement
16 Class") includes: "all person employed by Pan Pacific in California and classifies as an hourly-
17 paid, non-exempt employee who worked for Pan Pacific during the Class Period, but excludes any
18 non-exempt employee who worked for Pan Pacific during the Class Period who has signed an
19 individual settlement agreement with Pan Pacific."

20 6. "Class Period" means the period from August 5, 2018, to June 30, 2023.

21 7. Notice by first-class mail of the Class Notice constituted the best notice practicable
22 under the circumstances and is in full compliance with the laws of the State of California and, to
23 the extent applicable, the United States Constitution and the requirements of due process. Based
24 on the evidence submitted in conjunction with the Motion, the Court finds that this Class Notice
25 was adequate. The Class Notice fully and accurately informed Class Members of all material
26 elements of the proposed Class Action Settlement, of each Class Member's right to be excluded
27 from the Class, and each Class Member's right and opportunity to object to the proposed Class
28 Action Settlement. The Class Notice adequately advised the Class about: the Class Action; the

1 Settlement terms and the benefits available to each Class Member; each Class Member's right to
2 object and/or "opt out," and the timing and procedures for doing so; the conditional certification
3 of the Class for settlement purposes only; preliminary Court approval of the proposed Settlement;
4 timing and procedures for distributing the settlement funds; and the date of the Final Fairness
5 Hearing, as well as the rights of members to submit objections and appear in connection with said
6 hearing.

7 8. A full opportunity was afforded to Class Members to participate in the Final
8 Fairness Hearing. No Class Member submitted a timely request for exclusion form, nor objected
9 to the settlement.

10 9. The Court approves the Settlement, and each of the releases and other terms set
11 forth therein as fair, reasonable, and adequate to all Class Members. Plaintiff, Defendant, and the
12 Settlement Administrator are directed to perform all required actions in accordance with the terms
13 set forth in the Settlement.

14 8. The Court finds that the plan of allocation for payment of the Net Common Fund
15 as set forth in the Settlement is fair and reasonable. Distribution of the Net Common Fund to Class
16 Members shall be performed in accordance with the terms Class Notice and Settlement.

17 9. The Court appoints as Class Representative, for settlement purposes only,
18 Plaintiffs Joshua Byers and Ricky Herrera. In recognition of their service to the Class, initiating
19 and maintaining this litigation, and the risks and burdens undertaken for the benefit of the Class,
20 the Court approves service awards of \$10,000.00 to each Class Representative (\$20,000.00 total).

21 10. The Court finds that Benjamin H. Haber and Daniel J. Kramer of Wilshire Law
22 Firm, PLC, and Gabriel J. Pimentel and Jenna M. Koleson of Pimentel Law, P.C., are experienced
23 and adequate Class Counsel, and appoints them as Class Counsel. The Court further approves
24 Class Counsel's request for attorneys' fees of 35% of the Total Settlement Amount (\$201,250.00),
25 and costs of \$30,000.00.

26 11. The Court awards \$10,000 to CPT Group, Inc., for notice and settlement
27 administration services rendered in this matter and finds this amount is fair and reasonable.

28 **THE COURT FURTHER ORDERS & ENTERS JUDGMENT AS FOLLOWS:**

1 12. The Settlement Administrator is directed to make the foregoing payments in
2 accordance with the terms of the Settlement.

3 13. Defendant Pan Pacific is directed to pay the \$575,000 Gross Common Fund to the
4 Settlement Administrator within 14 days of entry of this Order as required by the terms of the
5 Settlement.

6 14. Within 14 business days of its receipt of the Gross Common Fund, the Settlement
7 Administrator shall distribute the proceeds as follows: \$100,625 to Class Counsel Pimentel Law,
8 P.C. and \$100,625 to Class Counsel Wilshire Law Firm for payment of attorneys' fees;
9 \$18,477.77 in costs to Class Counsel; \$15,000.00 payment to the State of California, Labor &
10 Workforce Development Agency for its share of the settlement of claims for penalties under the
11 Private Attorneys General Act (75% of \$20,000); \$5,000.00 distributed to the Aggrieved
12 Employees on a *pro rata* basis (25% of \$20,000); \$10,000 service payment to Plaintiff Joshua
13 Byers; \$10,000 service payment to Plaintiff Ricky Herrera; \$10,000 payment to CPT Group for
14 settlement administration services; and the remaining Net Common Fund of \$288,750 is to be
15 distributed to the Participating Class Members.

16 15. Any settlement distribution check shall be negotiable for at least 180 days from the
17 date of mailing.

18 16. Any uncashed portion of the Net Common Fund will be distributed in accordance
19 with CCP § 384 to the California Controller's Unclaimed Property Fund.

20 17. Within 15 days after the time for cashing Individual Settlement Payments has
21 passed, the Settlement Administrator shall file with the Court a report concerning uncashed
22 checks. The report will be in the form of a declaration from the Settlement Administrator,
23 describing (i) the date the checks were mailed, (ii) the total number of checks mailed to the Class
24 Members, (iii) the average amounts of those checks, (iv) the number of checks that remain
25 uncashed, (v) the total value of those uncashed checks, (vi) the average amount of the uncashed
26 checks and (vii) the nature and date of the disposition of those unclaimed funds. The report shall
27 be accompanied by a proposed amended Judgment that complies with Civil Procedure Code §
28 384.5. The Final Report Hearing (nonappearance) shall take place on _____.

18. Upon entry of this Order and Judgment, all Participating Class Members, and their successors, shall conclusively be deemed to have given full releases of the Released Claims against the Released Parties.

19. The Court maintains exclusive and continuing jurisdiction over this action for purposes of supervising the implementation, enforcement, construction, administration and interpretation of the Settlement and this Judgment.

20. The Settlement Administrator shall also provide a mailed copy of the signed Order & Judgment to Class Members.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATE: 3/28/25


Hon. Blanca Banuelos
San Joaquin County Superior Court

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 and not a party to the within action. My business address is 30 N. Raymond Ave., Suite 211, Pasadena, CA 91103.

On August 6, 2025, I served the foregoing document described as [PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT on the interested parties in this action as follows:

☐ By placing true copies enclosed in a sealed envelope addressed to each addressee as follows:

☒ Electronically to from my email address, VAB@PimentelLaw.com on the persons identified below at the following electronic service address:
dorothy1@malmfagundes.com; ScottM@malmfagundes.com;
dkramer@wilshirelawfirm.com; justin@wilshirelawfirm.com;
rebecca.padilla@wilshirelawfirm.com; christina.hicklin@wilshirelawfirm.com;
alan.wilcox@wilshirelawfirm.com; benjaminhabersteam@wilshirelawfirm.com;

Malm Fagundes LLP
Dorothy Luther, Esq.
Scott Malm, Esq.
444 South Flower Street, Ste. 4100
Los Angeles, CA 90071

Attorneys for Defendant

Wilshire Law Firm, PLC
Daniel Kramer, Esq.
Justin Marquez, Esq.
3055 Wilshire Blvd., 12th
Los Angeles, CA 90010

Attorneys for Plaintiff Joshua Byers

☐ BY MAIL:

☐ I deposited each envelope in the mail at Pasadena, California, with postage thereon fully prepaid.

☐ I enclosed the documents in an envelope or package provided by an overnight delivery carrier and addressed to the persons at the addresses above. I placed the envelope or package for collection and overnight delivery at an office or regularly utilized drop box of the overnight delivery carrier.

☒ STATE I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Viktoria Baklan

Viktoria Baklan

Executed on August 6, 2025, at Pasadena, California.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 and not a party to the within action. My business address is 30 N. Raymond Avenue, Suite 211, Pasadena, CA 91103.

On September 2, 2025, I served the foregoing document described as **NOTICE OF RULING RE: ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL** on the interested parties in this action as follows:

- ☐ By placing true copies enclosed in a sealed envelope addressed to each addressee as follows:
- ☒ Electronically from my email address, VAB@PimentelLaw.com on the persons identified below at the following electronic service address:
- dorothy1@malmfagundes.com; scottm@malmfagundes.com;
drakmer@wilshirelawfirm.com; justin@wilshirelawfirm.com;
rebecca.padilla@wilshirelawfirm.com; christina.hicklin@wilshirelawfirm.com;
alan.wilcox@wilshirelawfirm.com; benjaminhabersteam@wilshirelawfirm.com;

Dorothy Luther
Malm Fagundes LLP
2351 W. March Ln, Suite A
Stockton, CA 95207

*Defendants Pan Pacific RV Centers, Inc.,
Josef Darin Shields, Sherry Lavonne
Shields, and Matthew Curtis Jones*

Daniel Kramer
Wilshire Law Firm PLC
3055 Wilshire Blvd., 12th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90010

Plaintiff Joshua Byers

- ☐ BY MAIL:
- ☐ I deposited each envelope in the mail at Pasadena, California, with postage thereon fully prepaid.
- ☐ I enclosed the documents in an envelope or package provided by an overnight delivery carrier and addressed to the persons at the addresses above. I placed the envelope or package for collection and overnight delivery at an office or regularly utilized drop box of the overnight delivery carrier.
- ☒ STATE I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Viktoria A. Baklan

Viktoria Baklan

Executed on September 2, 2025 at Pasadena, California.