

1 JAMIE SERB (SBN 289601)
jamie@crosnerlegal.com
2 BRANDON BROUILLETTE, ESQ. (SBN 273156)
bbrouillette@crosnerlegal.com
3 ZACHARY M. CROSNER, ESQ. (SBN 272295)
zach@crosnerlegal.com
4 **CROSNER LEGAL, PC**
5 9440 Santa Monica Blvd. Suite 301
Beverly Hills, CA 90210
6 Tel: (866) 276-7637
Fax: (310) 510-6429

7 Attorneys for Plaintiff CHARMAINE TATE
8 As an individual and on behalf of all others similarly situated

9
10 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
11 **COUNTY OF EL DORADO**

12 CHARMAINE TATE, as an individual and
on behalf of all others similarly situated,

13
14 Plaintiff,

15 v.

16 PRO ENERGY SERVICES GROUP, LLC,
a Delaware Limited Liability Company;
17 and DOES 1-100, inclusive,

18 Defendants.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Case No.: 23CV0586

Assigned for All Purposes to:
Hon. Gary S. Stossberg
Dept. 9

DECLARATION OF JODEY LAWRENCE
ON BEHALF OF PHOENIX SETTLEMENT
ADMINISTRATORS IN SUPPORT OF
PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR
PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS
AND PAGA ACTION SETTLEMENT

Date: TBD
Time: 8:30 a.m.
Dept. 9

1
2 **DECLARATION OF JODEY LAWRENCE**

3 I, **JODEY LAWRENCE**, declare as follows:

4 1. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein and if called upon to testify, I
5 could and would do so competently under oath.

6 2. I am employed by Phoenix Class Action Administration Solutions (“Phoenix”), as
7 President of Business Development.

8 3. I personally have over fifteen (15) years of experience in claims management and
9 administration of class and collective action matters.

10 4. Phoenix has never had any financial interests in nor affiliation with the Parties or
11 their counsel in the matter of *Charmaine Tate v. Pro Energy Services Group, LLC*. Phoenix also has
12 no actual or potential conflicts of interest with the Class.

13 **Qualifications and Experience as an Administrator**

14 5. A true and correct copy of Phoenix’s Curriculum Vitae is attached hereto as **Exhibit**
15 **A.**

16 6. Phoenix has extensive experience administering class action matters and has been
17 appointed as the administrator in matters pending in both State and Federal courts. Phoenix has
18 administered complex wage-and-hour, labor and employment, consumer/product liability, TCPA,
19 FLSA, FACTA, ERISA, PAGA, and class action matters through final approval and distribution.
20 Phoenix has developed a robust system of quality assurance measures to ensure that the highest
21 quality service is provided.

22 7. Phoenix has extensive experience in, and are experts, at all aspects of administering
23 complex class action matters. This includes: (a) preparing, translating, printing, mailing and tracking
24 privacy notices; (b) operating a 24/7/365 multi-lingual call center; (c) establishing settlement
25 websites; (d) claims management; (e) USPS processes and systems, including third party tracing
26 and the use of reverse telephone directory services; (f) database management, programming and
27 security protocols; (g) calculating and issuing settlement payments; and (8) tax management, filings,
28 and account reconciliation.

1 ///

2 8. Phoenix's Claims Management Group has extensive experience in all aspects of
3 Notification and Identification of Class Members, Claims Processing, Formulation and Calculation
4 Methodologies, Award Distribution and Taxation, and Accounting and Reconciliation.

5 **Protection of Class Data**

6 9. Phoenix has adequate procedures in place to safeguard the data and funds to be
7 entrusted to it. Phoenix's Technology and Banking Groups are directly involved with Management
8 on all issues regarding Information Security and Settlement Fund transfers, as it pertains to the
9 continuance of business processes, and all risk, vulnerability, and security assessments as it pertains
10 to sensitive data. The groups, along with Phoenix's internal systems, monitor and communicate with
11 Management on a comprehensive level to prevent potential Strategic or Compliance Risks. All
12 processing of confidential and personal information is handled and maintained within the
13 organization and therefore all data received is kept within a strict chain of custody internally. All
14 informational assets are classified and assigned based on an initial case assessment as well as client
15 and procedural requirements. The Technology Group handles all higher-level ownership of
16 information and physical peripherals, as well as ownership of direct/indirect assets associated with
17 technology and the continuance of business. Specific Users, Groups, or Entities are assigned Shared
18 Ownership or Management Capability based on procedural needs and security level granted.

19 10. In addition to high levels of Data Center Policies/Procedures and
20 Facility/Maintenance Security Protocols, Phoenix conducts semi-annual training to maintain
21 additional safeguards regarding the following:

- 22 a. Phoenix's Business Continuity Policy;
- 23 b. Phoenix's Disaster Recovery Plan;
- 24 c. Phoenix's Incident Response Plan;
- 25 d. Phoenix's Personal Computer Security Policy;
- 26 e. Phoenix's Data Archiving and Retention Policy;
- 27 f. Phoenix's Personnel Security Policy;
- 28 g. Phoenix's Risk Assessment;

- h. Phoenix's Service Provider Risk Assessment;
- i. Phoenix's Classification and Access Rights Policy;
- j. Phoenix's Password Policy;
- k. Phoenix's Certification of Destruction; and
- l. Phoenix's Security Awareness Training Program.

11. Phoenix currently maintains an errors and omissions insurance policy, with a limit of liability of \$2,000,000, in addition to cyber insurance policy, with a limit of liability of \$3,000,000.

Procedures for Notice Preparation and Distribution

12. As part of the procedures for mailing the Notice Packet, Phoenix will run the names of all Class Members through the National Change of Address Database ("NCOA") to determine any updated addresses prior to the initial mailing. If a Notice Packet from the initial notice mailing is returned as undeliverable, Phoenix will attempt to obtain a current address for the Class Member to whom the returned Notice Packet had been mailed within three (3) business days of receipt of the returned Notice Packet by undertaking skip tracing. If Phoenix is successful in obtaining a new address, it will promptly remail the Notice Packet to the Class Member. Furthermore, any Notice Packets that are returned to Phoenix with a forwarding address before the Response Deadline will be promptly remailed to the forwarding address affixed thereto.

13. Phoenix only employs certified and/or qualified translators to translate Court-approved notices for posting on Phoenix's website and dissemination to the Class.

14. Phoenix's costs are reasonable and competitive when compared to the industry.

15. To complete the administration for *Charmaine Tate v. Pro Energy Services Group, LLC* case, Phoenix will include hard cost and hourly costs detailed below:

- a. **Hard Cost:** Postage, Printing Supplies, Toll Free Setup, QSF Bank Setup, NCOA, Skip Tracing, Remailing, and Translation costs.
- b. **Hourly Cost:** The hourly rates include Programming Database & Setup, Project Management, Notice Packet Formatting, Programming Undeliverable, Programming Claims Database, Programming Calculations,

1 Disbursement Review, Printing of Notice & Checks, Reconcile Uncashed
2 Checks, Conclusion Reports, Potential Tax Filing, and Case
3 Management/Maintenance.

4 16. Phoenix prepared a detailed breakdown illustrating how its fee was calculated. A true
5 and correct copy of Phoenix's fixed flat Not-to-Exceed Total bid of **\$17,500** is attached hereto as
6 **Exhibit B.**

7
8 I declare that under the penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States and California
9 the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on August 2, 2024 at Orange, California.

10
11 

12 Jodey Lawrence
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A



CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT SOLUTIONS

1411 N. Batavia, Suite 105 Orange, CA 92867

800-523-5773

www.phoenixclassaction.com

CURRICULUM VITAE

Phoenix Settlement Administrators. PSA Overview

Phoenix Settlement Administrators, PSA, is an emerging, National, Class Action Notification and Claims Administration firm, located in San Diego and Newport Beach California. PSA's core competencies ensure delivery of the highest quality and accuracy to its Clients and Class members. With a combined 28 years of expert experience, PSA's Managing Partners, Case Supervisors, Managers and Associates, Data Programming, and Certified Secure Strategic Partners, possess all the qualities that our Clients expect throughout the Noticing and Administration process, to Final Approval. It is our Value Pricing, Efficiency, Experience, Consultative Expertise and Delivery, that has perpetuated PSA, as an emerging leader in Class Action Settlement Administration. Expert PSA staff members are currently managing, Consumer and Product Liability, TCPA, Complex Labor & Employment, FLSA, ERISA and PAGA cases.

PSA has over 100 Attorney & Law Firm Clients, which have entrusted us with the management of their claim's administration, because of the "Boutique" attention every case receives. PSA is value driven on all size cases. large or small, cases receive expert management, secure data custody, neutral communication and a dedicated team. This seamless process maintains superior case continuity to ensure our clients receive timely final approval and conclusion to their actions. Phoenix Settlement Administrators implements its successful C.A.S.E. solutions on all our class action matters.

With 10's of Millions of dollars in award distributions currently under management since our inception, PSA has the ability and strengths to manage all levels of Complex Cases. PSA's Staff "Synergy" is our greatest attribute. It allows our people to work closely together and solve our client's case issues. PSA prides itself as a true "Third Party Administrator" and holds Neutrality as a mantra. Because of this approach, both Defense and Plaintiff Clients, experience fairness, trust and confidence in us, and allows for continued business from both parties. PSA has been appointed Third Party Administrator in State and Federal Courts.

We look forward to working with you on your next Class Action Noticing Campaign or Claims Administration. Let us design a C.A.S.E. solution, which will allow us to showcase the difference you'll experience. Superior Service, Class Savings Value Pricing and Timely Outcomes is why our clients come back to PSA.



PHOENIX
SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATORS

CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT SOLUTIONS

Expert Core Services

Initial Planning and Consultative Service on Class Action Cases and Noticing Plans.

State/Nationwide Noticing Expertise: Privacy, Media, Publication, Internet & Email Campaigns.

Attorney General(s) CAFA Notification

Claims Programming, Administration, Processing and Reporting.

24/7/365 Multi-Lingual Call Center Support and Claims Processing

Secure Data Management Environment, Individual Firewalls, Encrypted Data and Storage

Settlement Fund Calculations, Solutions, Award Distribution, Award Reconciliation

Tax Filings: State, Federal, EDD, ETT, FUTA, PAGA Payments

Partial PSA Client List, Defense and Plaintiff

Fisher & Phillips
Gordon & Rees
Paul Plevin Sullivan & Connaughton
Call & Jensen
Drinker Biddle
McKenna Long & Aldridge
Greenberg Traurig
Manning & Kass
Littler Mendelson
Kring & Chung
Orrick Herrington & Sutcliffe
Ogletree Deakins Nash Smoak & Stewart
Perkins Coie
Ross Wersching & Wolcott
Winston & Strawn
Sheppard Mullins
Lewis Brisbois Bisgaard & Smith
Morgan Lewis & Bockius
Paul Hastings
Park & Zheng
Sidley Austin
Higgs Fletcher & Mack
Jackson Lewis
Norton Rose Fulbright

Law Offices of Jonathan Ricasa
Dente Law Firm
Mahoney Law Group
Law Office of Thomas Rutledge
Law Office of Briana Kim
Dychter Law Firm
Garay Law Firm
Olsen Law Offices
Gould & Associates
Cohelan, Khoury & Singer
Ridout, Lyon & Ottoson
Carter Law Firm
Law Office of Justian Jusuf
The Phelps Law Group
The Emilio Law Group
Zeldes, Haeggquist & Eck
Markham Law Firm
Arias Ozzello & Gignac
David Yeremian & Associates
Aegis Law Firm
Rukin Hyland Doria & Tindall
Malk Law Firm
Spiro Law Corp
Levine Law Group, APC

Phoenix Settlement Administrators 411 N. Batavia, Suite 105 Orange, CA 92867

Phone: 800-784-2174 Fax: 619.338.0308

www.psaaction.com

EXHIBIT B



CASE ASSUMPTIONS

Class Members	1,600
Opt Out Rate	1%
Opt Outs Received	16
Total Class Claimants	1,584
Subtotal Admin Only	\$17,500.00

Not-to-Exceed Total \$17,500.00

For 1600 Class Members

Pricing Good for Scope of Estimate Only

July 19, 2024

Case: Tate v. Pro Energy Opt-Out Administration wTranslation

Phoenix Contact: Jodey Lawrence

Contact Number: 949.566.1455

Email: Jodey@phoenixclassaction.com

Requesting Attorney: Brandon Brouillette

Firm: CROSNER

Contact Number: 424-332-3955

Email: bbrouillette@crosnerlegal.com

Assumptions and Estimate are based on information provided by counsel. If class size changes, PHX will need to adjust this Estimate accordingly.

Estimate is based on 1600 Class Members. Class data Must be sent in Microsoft Excel or uploaded in the same format. Class Data Must be sent in one spreadsheet, with no additional programming needed. A rate of \$150 per hour will be charged for any additional analysis or programming. Pricing good for 90 days.

Case & Database Setup / Toll Free Setup & Call Center / NCOA (USPS)

Administrative Tasks:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Programming Manager	\$125.00	2	\$250.00
Programming Database & Setup	\$125.00	2	\$250.00
Toll Free Setup*	\$142.36	1	\$142.36
Call Center & Long Distance	\$2.00	16	\$32.00
NCOA (USPS)	\$150.00	2	\$300.00
Total			\$974.36

* Up to 120 days after disbursement

Data Merger & Scrub / Notice Packet, Opt-Out Form & Postage / Spanish Translation / Reporting

Project Action	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Notice Packet Formatting	\$125.00	3	\$375.00
Data Merge & Duplication Scrub	\$0.65	1,600	\$1,040.00
Notice Packet & Opt-Out Form	\$1.50	1,600	\$2,400.00
Estimated Postage (up to 2 oz.)*	\$0.98	1,600	\$1,568.00
Static Website	\$200.00	1	\$200.00
Language Translatiomn	\$1,000.00	1	\$1,000.00
Total			\$6,583.00

* Prices good for 90 days. Subject to change with the USPS Rate or change in Notice pages or Translation, if any.



PHOENIX

CLASS ACTION ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

Skip Tracing & Remailing Notice Packets / Tracking & Programming Undeliverables

Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Case Associate	\$55.00	3	\$165.00
Skip Tracing Undeliverables	\$1.50	320	\$480.00
Remail Notice Packets	\$1.50	320	\$480.00
Estimated Postage	\$0.98	320	\$313.60
Programming Undeliverables	\$50.00	2	\$100.00
Total			\$1,538.60

Database Programming / Processing Opt-Outs, Deficiencies or Disputes

Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Programming Claims Database	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
Non Opt-Out Processing	\$125.00	1	\$125.00
Case Associate	\$55.00	2	\$110.00
Opt-Outs/Deficiency/Dispute Letters	\$10.00	16	\$160.00
Case Manager	\$85.00	3	\$255.00
Total			\$850.00

Calculation & Disbursement Programming/ Create & Manage QSF/ Mail Checks

Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Programming Calculations	\$125.00	2	\$250.00
Disbursement Review	\$125.00	2	\$250.00
Programming Manager	\$95.00	2	\$190.00
QSF Bank Account & EIN	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
Check Run Setup & Printing	\$125.00	2	\$250.00
Mail Class Checks *	\$1.25	1,584	\$1,980.00
Estimated Postage	\$0.76	1,584	\$1,203.84
Total			\$4,323.84

* Checks are printed on 8.5 x 11 in. sheets with W2/1099 Tax Filing



PHOENIX

CLASS ACTION ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

Tax Reporting & Reconciliation / Re-Issuance of Checks / Conclusion Reports and Declarations			
Project Action:	Rate	Hours/Units	Line Item Estimate
Case Supervisor	\$125.00	3	\$375.00
Remail Undeliverable Checks (Postage Included)	\$1.50	317	\$475.20
Case Associate	\$55.00	2	\$110.00
Reconcile Uncashed Checks	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
Conclusion Reports	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
Case Manager Conclusion	\$85.00	2	\$170.00
Final Reporting & Declarations	\$100.00	2	\$200.00
IRS & QSF Annual Tax Reporting * (1 State Tax Reporting Included)	\$1,500.00	1	\$1,500.00
Total			\$3,230.20

* All applicable California State & Federal taxes, which include SUI, ETT, and SDI, and FUTA filings. Additional taxes are Defendant's responsibility.

Estimate Total: \$17,500.00



PHOENIX

CLASS ACTION ADMINISTRATION SOLUTIONS

TERMS AND CONDITIONS

Provisions: The case estimate is in good faith and does not cover any applicable taxes and fees. The estimate does not make any provision for any services or class size not delineated in the request for proposal or stipulations. Proposal rates and amounts are subject to change upon further review, with Counsel/Client, of the Settlement Agreement. Only pre-approved changes will be charged when applicable. No modifications may be made to this estimate without the approval of PSA (Phoenix Settlement Administrators). All notifications are mailed in English language only unless otherwise specified. Additional costs will apply if translation into other language(s) is required. Rates to prepare and file taxes are for Federal and California State taxes only. Additional charges will apply if multiple state tax filing(s) is required. **Pricing is good for ninety (90) days.**

Data Conversion and Mailing: The proposal assumes that data provided will be in ready-to-use condition and that all data is provided in a single, comprehensive Excel spreadsheet. PSA cannot be liable for any errors or omissions arising due to additional work required for analyzing and processing the original database. A minimum of two (2) business days is required for processing prior to the anticipated mailing date with an additional two (2) business days for a National Change of Address (NCOA) update. Additional time may be required depending on the class size, necessary translation of the documents, or other factors. PSA will keep counsel apprised of the estimated mailing date.

Claims: PSA's general policy is to not accept claims via facsimile. However, in the event that facsimile filing of claims must be accepted, PSA will not be held responsible for any issues and/or errors arising out of said filing. Furthermore, PSA will require disclaimer language regarding facsimile transmissions. PSA will not be responsible for any acts or omissions caused by the USPS. PSA shall not make payments to any claimants without verified, valid Social Security Numbers. All responses and class member information are held in strict confidentiality. Additional class members are \$10.00 per opt-out.

Payment Terms: All postage charges and 50% of the final administration charges are due at the commencement of the case and will be billed immediately upon receipt of the data and/or notice documents. PSA bills are due upon receipt unless otherwise negotiated and agreed to with PSA by Counsel/Client. In the event the settlement terms provide that PSA is to be paid out of the settlement fund, PSA will request that Counsel/Client endeavor to make alternate payment arrangements for PSA charges that are due at the onset of the case. The entire remaining balance is due and payable at the time the settlement account is funded by Defendant, or no later than the time of disbursement. Amounts not paid within thirty (30) days are subject to a service charge of 1.5% per month or the highest rate permitted by law.

Tax Reporting Requirements

PSA will file the necessary tax returns under the EIN of the QSF, including federal and state returns. Payroll tax returns will be filed if necessary. Under the California Employment Development Department, all taxes are to be reported under the EIN of the QSF with the exception of the following taxes: Unemployment Insurance (UI) and Employment Training Tax (ETT), employer-side taxes, and State Disability Insurance (SDI), an employee-side tax. These are reported under Defendant's EIN. Therefore, to comply with the EDD payroll tax filing requirements we will need the following information:

1. Defendant's California State ID and Federal EIN.
2. Defendant's current State Unemployment Insurance (UI) rate and Employment Training Tax (ETT) rate. This information can be found in the current year DE 2088, Notice of Contribution Rates, issued by the EDD.
3. Termination dates of the class members, or identification of current employee class members, so we can account for the periods that the wages relate to for each class member.
4. An executed Power of Attorney (Form DE 48) from Defendant. This form is needed so that we may report the UI, SDI, and ETT taxes under Defendant's EIN on their behalf. If this form is not provided we will work with the EDD auditors to transfer the tax payments to Defendant's EIN.
5. Defendant is responsible for reporting the SDI portion of the settlement payments on the class member's W-2. PSA will file these forms on Defendant's behalf for an additional fee and will issue an additional W-2 for each class member under Defendant's EIN, as SDI is reported under Defendant's EIN rather than the EIN of the QSF. The Power of Attorney (Form DE 48) will be needed in order for PSA to report SDI payments.