

1 **BIBIYAN LAW GROUP, P.C.**

David D. Bibiyan (SBN 287811)

2 *david@tomorrowlaw.com*

3 Vedang J. Patel (SBN 328647)

vedang@tomorrowlaw.com

4 Bradford Smith (SBN 345879)

bsmith@tomorrowlaw.com

5 1460 Westwood Boulevard

Los Angeles, California 90024

6 Tel: (310) 438-5555; Fax: (310) 300-1705

7 Attorneys for Plaintiff, MARICELA BARRON DE ESPINOZA,
8 as an aggrieved employee, and on behalf of all other aggrieved employees

9 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

10 **FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES**

11 ROSARIO LOPEZ, as an aggrieved employee,
12 and on behalf of all other aggrieved employees
13 under the Labor Code Private Attorneys'
General Act of 2004,

14 Plaintiff,

15 v.

16
17 COMMUNITY RESTAURANTS, INC., a
California corporation; GRANVILLE
18 GLENDALE, INC., a California corporation;
GRANVILLE RESTAURANTS PARTNERS,
19 LLC, a California limited liability company;
GRANVILLE RESTAURANTS PARTNERS
20 2, LLC, a California limited liability company;
GRANVILLE MANAGEMENT GROUP,
21 INC., a California corporation; and DOES 1
22 through 100, inclusive,

23 Defendants.
24

CASE NO.: 24STCV09221

[Assigned for all purpose to the Hon. Daniel
Murphy in Dept. 32]

**DECLARATION OF DAVID D. BIBIYAN
IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION
FOR APPROVAL OF
REPRESENTATIVE ACTION
SETTLEMENT**

1 bring overlapping class actions. I have also attended various Continuing Legal Education courses
2 pertaining to advocacy on behalf of employees.

3 8. I also created the content for, helped organize, and served as the Moderator for the
4 2023 California Complex Symposium Wage and Hour/PAGA Section, a Continuing Legal
5 Education seminar and forum featuring four respected Judges serving in the Complex Divisions
6 of their respective county Superior Courts. In addition, my firm served as a sponsor of that event.

7 9. Not only have I practiced almost exclusively in this field for years and have
8 contributed to the legal education curriculum for attorneys practicing within it, I am also a
9 published author in the Daily Journal as a contributor in the Wage and Hour and PAGA context,
10 including, in December 15, an article entitled: "PAGA: What's Gone, What's Left and What's
11 Next." I have also been a quoted source in multiple other publications, including in article pushed
12 by Bloomberg Law dated November 1, 2023 entitled: "Adidas, Home Depot Sued in Test Cases
13 on Job Ad Pay Transparency."

14 10. My firm has the experience, resources, and means necessary to allow us to provide
15 adequate representation as Class Counsel to all class members in this litigation. With
16 approximately 30 attorneys, as well as supporting staff consisting of paralegals and legal
17 assistants, my office has the capacity to represent hundreds of thousands of class members, bring
18 forth efficient resolution of class actions and PAGA actions, engage in complex litigation, file
19 contested motions for class certification, and engage in trial practice.

20 11. My office has filed contested motions for class certification in the past and have
21 been appointed Class Counsel by the Superior Court of California in the past for purposes of
22 certifying a class for settlement purposes. Some examples of Actions in which I was appointed
23 Class Counsel for include:

24 • *Santoyo v. Consolidated Foundries, Inc.*, Case No. BC612298, California Superior
25 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Ann I. Jones, presiding;

26 • *Arendorff v. Stanley Steamer International, Inc.*, Case No. BC681368, California
27 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos, presiding;

28 • *Barreto v. Don Roberto Jewelers, Inc.*, Case No. BC495451, California Superior Court,

1 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;
2 • *Junior Amilcar Laguna Gonzalez v. Takaaki Koyama*, Case No. BC641998, Los Angeles
3 Superior Court, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
4 • *Rios v. Nongshim America, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1807390, California Superior Court,
5 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;
6 • *Stoddard v. Molded Fiber Glass – West*, Case No. 1517758, California Superior Court,
7 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;
8 • *Mata v. Sahara Scaffold, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1810785, California Superior Court,
9 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;
10 • *Carrasco v. Pure Dental Solutions*, Case No. BC645995, Los Angeles Superior Court,
11 Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman, presiding;
12 • *Gonzalez v. Gochez, et al.*, Case No. BC648729, Los Angeles Superior Court, Honorable
13 Maren Nelson, presiding;
14 • *Montoya v. Superior Paving Co.*, Case No. CIVDS1833422, County of San Bernardino,
15 Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;
16 • *Lopez v. Norred & Associates, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1824109, California Superior
17 Court, County of San Bernardino, David S. Cohn, presiding;
18 • *Noyola v. Lacren, LLC*, Case No. BC717024, California Superior Court, County of Los
19 Angeles, Hon. Anthony Mohr, presiding;
20 • *Luciano, et al. v. O’Tasty Foods, Inc., et al.*, Case No. BC711988, California Superior
21 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;
22 • *Gordon v. Hospice Source, LLC*, Case No. 34-2018-00250022-CU-OE-GDS, California
23 Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Christopher E. Krueger, presiding;
24 • *Barragan v. Refrigeration Supplies Distributor*, Case No. 19STCV09312, California
25 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;
26 • *Ramirez v. Acre Gourmet, Inc.*, Case No. CGC-19-575117, California Superior Court,
27 County of San Francisco, Honorable Andrew Y.S. Cheng, presiding;
28 • *Villafuerte v. Bay Alarm Company*, Case No. BC689110, California Superior Court,

1 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;
2 • *Cazares v. Areas USA LAX, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
3 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;
4 • *Magana v. Castlerock Environmental, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 19STCV38353, California
5 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;
6 • *Chilel v. Sushi California, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
7 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;
8 • *Malone v. Orange Courier, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 30-2016-00763474, California Superior
9 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Glenda Sanders, presiding;
10 • *Rivera v. Talamo Food Services, Inc.*, Case No. 19CV355856, California Superior Court,
11 County of Santa Clara, Honorable Patricia M. Lucas, presiding;
12 • *Olguin v. Cal Central Harvesting, Inc.*, Case No. 18CV03860, California Superior Court,
13 County of Santa Barbara, Honorable James F. Rigali, presiding;
14 • *Pence v. Sober Living by the Sea, Inc.*, Case No. 2018-00988742, California Superior
15 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman, presiding;
16 • *Franco v. Vincent Rags, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV07768, California Superior Court,
17 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;
18 • *Cabral v. Miller Castings, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
19 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;
20 • *Bolanos v. Texas Roadhouse, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
21 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Sunshine Sykes, presiding;
22 • *Rodriguez v. Scott A. Humphreys, Inc.*, Case No. 30-2021-01184556-CU-OE-CXC,
23 California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Matthew P. Guasco, presiding; and
24 • *Torres v. Primal Pet Foods, Inc.* Case No. FCS054783, California Superior Court,
25 County of Solano, Honorable Wendy G. Getty, presiding;
26 • *Hanson v. Zapata Nuccio, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV28951, California Superior Court,
27 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
28 • *Molina v. Avibank Mfg, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV03910, California Superior Court,

1 County of Los Angeles, Honorable John P. Doyle, presiding;
2 • *Cetina v. Lawry's Restaurants, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV05201, California Superior Court,
3 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;
4 • *Luna v. Pronto California General Agency, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV39951, California
5 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
6 • *Alvarez v. Kazak-Mars, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV42587, California Superior Court,
7 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
8 • *Noe v. My Pillow, Inc.* Case No. CIVDS 2011360, California Superior Court, County of
9 San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;
10 • *Nunez v. 2751 West Coast Acquisition Company*, Case No. 30-2020-01145215-CU-
11 OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman,
12 Presiding;
13 • *Smith v. McMillen Enterprises, Inc.*, Case No. CV-20-002938, California Superior Court,
14 County of Stanislaus, Honorable John R. Mayne, presiding;
15 • *Turner v. Plant Prefab Inc., et al.*, Case No. CIVDS2017517, California Superior Court,
16 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;
17 • *Duran v. Fresh Select, LLC*, Case No. VCU284892, California Superior Court, County
18 of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;
19 • *Reynoso, et al. v. Cream of the Crop AG Service, Inc.*, Case No. VCU278847, California
20 Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;
21 • *Michel v. Universal Waste Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV46181, California Superior
22 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding;
23 • *Jungers v. U.S. Borax Inc., et al.*, Case No. BCV-21-10003, California Superior Court,
24 County of Kern, Honorable Bernard C. Barmann Jr. presiding;
25 • *Fortune v. Amoroso Limited Partnership, et al.*, Case No. 20STCV25874, California
26 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;
27 • *Montoya, et al. v. Remo, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV34614, California Superior Court,
28 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;

1 • *Rincon, et al. v. New-Indy Tripaq, LLC, et al.*. Case No. 20STCV17118, California
2 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
3 • *De Leon, et al. v. Wismettac Asian Foods, Inc.* Case No. 19STCV18172, California
4 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
5 • *Tapia v. Mercer Foods, Inc.* Case No. CV-21-000020, California Superior Court,
6 County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
7 • *Molina v. Reser's Fine Foods, Inc.* Case No. 37-2021-00013052-CU-OECTL, California
8 Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Eddie C. Sturgeon presiding;
9 • *Reyes v. Imperial Sprinkler Supply, Inc.* Case No. 30-2020-01167748-CU-OE-CXC,
10 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Peter Wilson presiding;
11 • *Zavala, et al. v. PLS Check Cashers, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV42586, California Superior
12 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
13 • *Paz v. Hill Brothers Chemical Company.* Case No. 20STCV48279, California Superior
14 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
15 • *Garcia v. Inwesco Incorporated.* Case No. 20STCV46833, California Superior Court,
16 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
17 • *Guevara v. J&K Culver, LLC, et al.* Case No. 19STCV39951, California Superior Court,
18 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
19 • *Hamilton v. Michael Kors Stores, Inc. et al.*, Case No. 19STCV37061, California
20 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
21 • *Arzooian v. A&M Administration, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV05576, California
22 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
23 • *Santos, et al. v. Maruzen of America, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV37662, California Superior
24 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
25 • *Schaffino v. M.O. Dion & Sons., Inc., et al.*, Case No. 20STCV38023, California Superior
26 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Gail Killefer presiding;
27 • *Moreno v. Santa Paula Post Acute, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV12533, California
28 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;

1 • *Singer v. Desert Area Resources and Training*, Case No. BCV-21-101093, California
2 Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Thomas S. Clark presiding;
3 • *Clarizio v. Guard-Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV28667, California Superior Court,
4 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Armen Tamzarian presiding;
5 • *Guzman v. Freschco Painters, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV04683, California Superior Court,
6 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
7 • *Koutny v. PAE Aviation and Technical Services, LLC*, Case No. 21C-0106, California
8 Superior Court, County of Kings, Honorable Melissa R. D’Morias presiding;
9 • *Rodriguez v. Pacifica Trucks, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV37576, California Superior Court,
10 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding;
11 • *Ramos v. AEGIS Treatment Centers, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV41429, California Superior
12 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
13 • *Valdez v. Integrated Building Services, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV37793, California Superior
14 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
15 • *Harris v. America One Security, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV01399, California Superior
16 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
17 • *Moreno v. M&J Seafood Company, Inc.* Case No. 22STCV03341, California Superior
18 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
19 • *Corrales v. Q&B Foods, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV40885, California Superior Court,
20 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu Berle presiding;
21 • *Arteaga v. Demolition Specialist, Inc.* Case No. RIC2001133, California Superior Court,
22 County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;
23 • *Vigil, et al. v. Capstone Turbine Corporation*, Case No. 20STCV32123, California
24 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
25 • *Ramirez v. Sea-Win, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV22026, California Superior Court, County
26 of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
27 • *Ortega Chavez v. Winpak Lane, Inc.* Case No. CIVSB2207313, California Superior
28 Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;

1 • *Garcia v. American Licorice Company*. Case No. RG21107049, California Superior
2 Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Brad Seligman presiding;

3 • *Madrono v. Vitale Nursing, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 21STCV09845, California Superior
4 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding; and

5 • *Orellana v. Advanced Building Maintenance*. Case No. 34-2020-00286791-CU-OE-
6 GDS, California Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Jill Talley presiding.

7 • *Aguilar v. Bioness, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 21STCV41702, California Superior Court,
8 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

9 • *Antoine v. Pinky Beverly Hills, LLC., et al.* Case No. 19STCV44856, California
10 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

11 • *Phambui v. Fashion Marketing and Merchandising Group, Inc., et al.* Case No.
12 21STCV06634, Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Rice presiding;

13 • *Ortega Chavez v. Winpak Lane, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2202274, California
14 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;

15 • *Carrasco v O.H. Barkhordar D.D.S., Inc., et al.* Case No. 22STCV21188, California
16 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff presiding;

17 • *Correia v. Gallo Glass Company, et al.* Case No. CV-21-006459, California Superior
18 Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;

19 • *Davis v. Beeline Import and Services, LLC, et al.* Case No. CIVSB2119287, California
20 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;

21 • *Angel Lopez v Innovative Coatings Technology Corporation dba Incotec, et al.* Case No.
22 30-2020-01173245-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon
23 Hurwitz presiding;

24 • *Lopez v UPM, Inc., et al.* Case No. 20STCV36695, California Superior Court, County of
25 Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

26 • *Moreno v. Infiniti Group LLC., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2223551, California Superior
27 Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph T. Ortiz presiding;

28 • *Kelley v. Applus Technologies, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2204889, California Superior

1 Court, County of San Bernardino, honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
2 • *Hernandez v Bromley Foods, Inc., et al. Case No. 56-2021-00561326-CU-OE-VTA*,
3 California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Henr Walsh presiding;
4 • *Heredia v. Alan Smith Pool Plastering, Inc., et al. Case No. 30-2020-01163609-CU-OE-*
5 *CXC*, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman presiding;
6 • *Martinez Guzman v Freshco Painters Inc., et al. Case No. 21STCV04683*, California
7 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
8 • *Gomez Mireles v. USG Ceilings Plus, LLC., et al. Case No. 21STCV45606*, California
9 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
10 • *Garzon v. Mobile Hi-Tech Wheels, LLC., et al., Case No. 21STCV15396*, California
11 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
12 • *Dethrasavong v. ASI Computer Technologies, Inc., et al. Case No. 20STCV32312*,
13 California Superior Court, County of Contra Costa, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
14 • *Lopez v. Waldorf Astoria Management LLC., et al. Case No. 20STCV17212*, California
15 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
16 • *Viveros v. Mission Produce, Inc., et al. Case No. 20STCV15737*, California Superior
17 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
18 • *Flores v. United Maintenance Company, Inc., et al. Case No. 21STCV07008*, California
19 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
20 • *Blandi v. Francesca Restaurant, LLC., et al. Case No. 37-2022-00049034-CU-OE-CTL*,
21 California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Marcella O. McLaughling presiding;
22 • *Lopez Cabrera v. South Valley Almond Company, LLC, et al. Case No. BCV-2-100722*,
23 California Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Bernard C. Barmann, Jr. presiding;
24 • *Guillermo Cruz v. Alma Family Serives, et al. Case No. 21STCV18156*, California
25 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
26 • *Davood v. NKSFB, LLC, et al. Case No. 22STCV17305*, California Superior Court,
27 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui presiding;
28 • *Ferrer v. Ineos USA, LLC., et al., Case No. 21STCV28076*, California Superior Court,

1 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

2 • *Portillo Sanchez v. Paragon Services Janitorial Orange County, LLC, et al.* Case No.

3 20STCV38562, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F.

4 Highberger presiding;

5 • *Trigueros Garcia v. Highland Plastics, Inc., et al.*, Case No. CVRI2202836, California

6 Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;

7 • *Magana Ramirez v. 360 Support Services, et al.* Case No. 22STCV20456, California

8 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

9 • *Morales v. Baldy's Restaurant Group, LLC., et al.* Case No. 20STCV36535, California

10 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;

11 • *Gonzales v. El Monte Rents, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV10209, California Superior

12 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Rice presiding;

13 • *Gonzalez v. Total Education Solutions, Inc., et al.* Case No. 20STCV37984, California

14 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;

15 • *Helaire v. Smithfield Packaged Meats Corp, et al.* Case No. JCCP5244, California

16 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding; *Hernandez v.*

17 *Central Valley Recovery Services, et al.* Case No. VCU290220, California Superior Court, County

18 of Tulare, Honorable Brett Hillman presiding;

19 • *Hernandez v. SC Commercial, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2020-01166961-CU-OE-CXC,

20 California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon Hurwitz presiding;

21 • *Hines v. Constellis Integrated Risk Management Services, et al.* Case No.

22 20STCV26962, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui

23 presiding;

24 • *Moya v. Valassis Direct Mail, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV09412, California Superior

25 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding;

26 • *Jordan v. The Martin-Brower Company, LLC, et al.*, Case No. 21STCV41435, California

27 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, honorable Stuart Rice presiding;

28 • *Juarez v. Calmet Services, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV33668, California Superior

1 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;

2 • *Mcintosh v. WWL Vehicle Services Americas Inc., et al.* Case No. 56-2022-00562544-

3 CU-OE-VTA, California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Benjamin Coats

4 presiding;

5 • *Mendoza v. Amusement Industry, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV09790, California

6 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;

7 • *Moore v. Dnata US Inflight Catering LLC, et al.* Case No. CGC-20-586512, California

8 Superior Court, County of San Francisco, Honorable Curtis Karnow presiding;

9 • *Peterson v. Sorenson Engineering, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVDS2023994, California

10 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;

11 • *Torres v. Laurel Avenue, LLC, et al.* Case No. CIVSB2202708, California Superior

12 Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;

13 • *Nunley v. Cardinal Logistics Management Corporation et al.* Case No. CIVSB2210430,

14 California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph T. Ortiz presiding;

15 • *Pastrana v. National Sign & Marketing Corporation et al.* Case No. CIVSB2118749,

16 California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;

17 • *Pineda v. Grand Life, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV28066, California Superior Court,

18 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

19 • *Pattingale v. Laird Family Estate, LLC et al.* Case No. 22CV000048, California Superior

20 Court, County of Napa, Honorable Cynthia P. Smith presiding;

21 • *Ramirez v. Sea Win, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV22026, California Superior Court,

22 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;

23 • *Reategui v. Cal Building & Maintenance Industries, Inc.,* Case No. 20STCV39648,

24 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;

25 • *Rodriguez v. ACRA Aerospace, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2020-01171360-CU-OE-CXC,

26 California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman presiding;

27 • *Rodriguez v. Ultra Pro International LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV11250, California

28 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

1 • *Ruiz v. Kleen Harvest, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21CV002319, California Superior Court,
2 County of Monterey, Honorable Thomas W. Wills presiding;
3 • *Roberto Ruiz v. Protech Delivery and Installation et al.* Case No. 21STCV07001,
4 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Rice presiding;
5 • *Russell v. CIMC Reefer Trailer, Inc., et al.* Case No. RIC2001777, California Superior
6 Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harld Hopp presiding;
7 • *Russell v. Staffmark Investment LLC, et al.* Case No. CVRI12103921, California
8 Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;
9 • *Quintanilla et al. v. Chrome Hearts LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV43180, California
10 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu B. Berle presiding;
11 • *Taat v. Acell, Inc., et al.* Case No. 37-2022-00005437-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior
12 Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Matthew C. Braner presiding;
13 • *Todd v. Motivate, LLC, et al.* Case No. CGC-23-605052, California Superior Court,
14 County of San Francisco, Honorable Anne- Christine Massullo presiding;
15 • *Turner Sr., v. The Sidewalk Café, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV10154, California
16 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
17 • *Vargas-Flores v. Harbor Bay Club, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21CV002396, California
18 Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Michael Markman presiding;
19 • *Vasquez v. Liquid Technologies, Inc., et al.* Case No. CIVDS2023892, California
20 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph Ortiz presiding;
21 • *Vasquez et al. v. Kingswood LLC, et al.,* Case No. 20STCV32123, California Superior
22 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
23 • *Sandoval Villafana v. Satco, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV17085, California Superior
24 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
25 • *Williams v. Marrs Services, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV23775, California Superior
26 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Stuart presiding;
27 • *Low v. Triple Canopy, Inc., et al.* Case No. 37-2023-0007078-CU-OE-CTL, California
28 Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Carolyn Caietti presiding;

1 • *Camacho v. Premium Electric Corp, et al.* Case No. 22STCV26878, California Superior
2 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding;
3 • *Lopez v. Bachem Americas, Inc., et al.* Case No. 23STCV04258, California Superior
4 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Laura Seigle presiding;
5 • *Mendoza Cendejas v. E. & J. Gallo Winery, et al.* Case No. CV-22-005396, California
6 Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
7 • *Romero v. Armstrong Installation Service, et al.* Case No. 22CV022519, California
8 Superior Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Noel Wise presiding;
9 • *Perez v. D&G Restaurants, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2021-01209638-CU-OE-CXC,
10 California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Peter Wilson presiding;
11 • *Sarmiento, et al. v. Neil Jones Food Company* Case No. 21CECG03825, California
12 Superior Court, County of Fresno, Hon. Kristi Culver Kapetan presiding; and
13 • *Garcia v. Nature Fresh Farms, LLC, et al.* Case No. ECU001961, California Superior
14 Court, County of Imperial, Honorable Jeffery B. Jones presiding.

15 12. I have also settled matters on a “PAGA Only” basis for aggrieved employees in the
16 past, including in:

17 • *Flores v. Delta Apparel, Inc.*, Case No. BC641499, California Superior Court, County
18 of Los Angeles, Honorable Daniel J. Buckley, presiding;
19 • *Segura v. CJ Foods Service Holdings USA, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV24918, California
20 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maureen Duffy-Lewis, presiding;
21 • *Sierra v. Nexem-Allied, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV11281, California Superior Court,
22 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Randolph M. Hammock, presiding;
23 • *Nodal v. Sodexo, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV40601, California Superior Court, County of
24 Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff, presiding; and
25 • *Cooper v. Lucas Health Partners*, Case No. 20STCV20050, California Superior Court,
26 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;
27 • *Herrera v. Greystar Management, LP, et al.*, Case No. 37-2020-00009672-CU-OE-CTL,
28 California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Carolyn Caietti, presiding;

1 • *Slater v. Jo-Ann Stores, LLC.*, Case No. 21STCV18454, California Superior Court,
2 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maurice A. Leiter, presiding;
3 • *Bolanos v. Canoga Park Heating & Air Conditioning, Co., Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV12674,
4 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yolanda Orozco, presiding;
5 • *Granados v. Cosmetic Ideas, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV10797, California Superior Court,
6 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Richard L. Fruin, presiding;
7 • *Ruano v. DPC Woodwork, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV00408, California Superior Court,
8 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Jon R. Takasugi presiding;
9 • *Hardy v. Texas Roadhouse Management Corp., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2222259,
10 California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
11 • *Iraheta v Legacy Farmers, Inc., et al.* Case No. MSC21-00762, California Superior
12 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Charles S. Treat presiding;
13 • *Landin v Central Janitors' Supply Co., Inc., et al.* Case No. CV-21-006391, California
14 Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
15 • *Bailey v. Cannon Constructors, et al.* Case No. 21STCV38274, California Superior
16 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;
17 • *Johns, et al. v. Whelan Security of California, Inc., et al.* Case No. 22STCV68687,
18 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Laura Seigle presiding;
19 • *Carrion v. Clutter, Inc., et al.* Case No. 23STCV06709, California Superior Court,
20 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kerry Bensinger presiding;
21 • *Delia v. The Irvine Company, LLC, et al.* Case No. 30-2019-01050823-CU-OE-CXC,
22 California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable William D. Claster presiding;
23 • *Landin v. Central Janitor's Supply Co., Inc., et al.* Case No. CV-21-006391, California
24 Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
25 • *German Vaca et al., v. California Pizza Kitchen, Inc., et al.* Case No. 30-2022-01278828-
26 CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall Sherman
27 presiding;
28 • *London Young v. Amazon.com LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV38280, California Superior

1 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elaine Lu presiding;

2 • *Martinez v. Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc., et al.* Case No. 22STCV17283, California
3 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Armen Tamzarian presiding;

4 • *Latrice Ackles v. Brinker Restaurant Corporation, et al.* Case No. 22STCV19068,
5 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Gail Killefer presiding; and

6 • *Ruiz v. Edelbrock Foundry, LLC, et al.* Case No. 20STCV19057, California Superior
7 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding.

8 Furthermore, my office has succeeded in certifying classes in contested motions for class
9 certification. Some of the classes and theories we have certified include, without limitation, for
10 failure to pay the regular rate of pay; failing to pay overtime and minimum wages, including,
11 without limitation, for temperature checks; failure to provide meal and rest premiums, including,
12 without limitation, for requiring employees to walk during breaks; failure to timely pay wages
13 prior to separation of employment; wage statement violations; and unfair competition. Some
14 examples of matters in which we have done so include, without limitation:

15 • *Hernandez, et al. v. C.R. Lawrence Co., Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV32372, California
16 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon. William Highberger presiding; and

17 • *Lopez v. Rolling Hills Country Club*, Case No. 21STCV22636, California Superior
18 Court, County of Los Angeles; Hon. Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding; and

19 • *Torres v. Johnston Nurseries, FLP*, Case No. BCV-19-100830 TSC, California Superior
20 Court, County of Kern; Hon. Thomas S. Clark, presiding.

21 13. I believe that I am sufficiently experienced and qualified to evaluate the Class
22 Members' claims and viability of Defendants' defenses.

23 14. Vedang J. Patel has been a member of my law firm for over three (3) years and
24 served as class counsel on numerous actions on which I was also named class counsel. Prior to
25 working with Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., he practiced law with Murchison & Cumming, LLP on a
26 variety of matter on behalf of defendants. Thereafter, he joined Bibiyan Law Group, P.C.,
27 practicing law on behalf of plaintiffs in matters of employment law, and specifically on issue of
28 unpaid wages and class action settlements. He is currently a senior attorney at Bibiyan Law Group,

1 P.C. and head of the Settlement Department. Among other tasks, he oversees and manages all
2 settlements at Bibiyan Law Group, P.C. He also oversees several attorneys, paralegals, and legal
3 assistants and has overseen the settlement of over one hundred (100) class and PAGA matters
4 while with our office.

5 15. After a thorough investigation and settlement discussions, I arrived at terms that I
6 viewed was in the best interest of both Plaintiff and Aggrieved Employees.

7 **Plaintiff's Counsel's Requested Fees and Costs are Reasonable**

8 16. I believe PAGA Counsel are entitled to recover attorneys' fees and costs. PAGA
9 Counsel request a fee of thirty-five percent (35%) of the Gross Settlement Amount, which, unless
10 and until escalated pursuant to the Parties' Settlement Agreement, amounts to \$119,000.00, is
11 reasonable, is well within the range of fees generally sought and approved in other class and
12 representative cases, and is also reasonable based on PAGA Counsel's lodestar.

13 17. PAGA Counsel invested time and resources into litigating this Action, with
14 \$16,600.58 of costs to date and counting deferred to the end of the case and entirely contingent
15 on the outcome, which, as set forth above, the recovery of which was far from certain with much
16 of the litigation still potentially pending.

17 18. During the period that this Action has been pending, PAGA Counsel have advanced
18 all expenses, and have not received any compensation for prosecuting the Action on behalf of the
19 State and other Aggrieved Employees.

20 **An Award of Fees Based on a Percentage of the Common Fund**
21 **is Appropriate and Reasonable**

22 19. I believe the percentage of attorneys' fees set forth in the Settlement (*i.e.*, 35% of
23 the GSA) is reasonable. I am informed and believe that, historically, courts have awarded
24 percentage fees in the range of 20% to 50% in collective actions, depending on the circumstances
25 of the case.

26 20. Here, I believe the requested fee is consistent with the fees awarded in other PAGA
27 settlements approved by California courts.

28 21. PAGA Counsel invested time and resources into litigating this Action, with over

1 \$15,000 of costs to date and counting deferred to the end of the case and entirely contingent on
2 the outcome which, as set forth above, the recovery of which is far from certain with much of the
3 litigation still potentially pending. It has been a long-recognized principle that an attorney merits
4 a significantly larger fee when the compensation is contingent, rather than being fixed on a time
5 or contractual basis. During the period that this Action has been pending, PAGA Counsel have
6 advanced all expenses, and have not received any compensation for prosecuting the Action on
7 behalf of the State and other Aggrieved Employees.

8 22. I believe the significant outlay of monetary and personnel resources has been
9 completely at risk and wholly dependent upon obtaining a substantial settlement or the imposition
10 of civil penalties at trial. I believe PAGA Counsel should not be penalized with a lower fee for
11 settling the case prior to trial, because the percentage of the fund method “encourages early
12 settlement, which avoids protracted litigation.” Thus, the requested award of attorneys’ fees is
13 reasonable under the percentage of the fund method.

14 **The Requested Fees are also Reasonable under a Lodestar Crosscheck**

15 I understand from my position as principal of Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., my involvement
16 with the case, and information provided by my staff, that Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., have collectively
17 billed 321.1 hours. Specifically, David D. Bibiyan billed 19.8 hours at his hourly rate of \$1,200.
18 Vedang J. Patel billed 43.2 hours at his hourly rate of \$900. Robert Wilson billed 65.3 hours at his
19 hourly rate of \$1,200. Kate Willis billed 81.7 hours at her hourly rate of \$400. Bradford Smith billed
20 43.2 hours at his hourly rate of \$400. Adam Lonner billed 15.6 hours at his hourly rate of \$550.
21 Laurel Holmes billed 1.2 hours at her hourly rate of \$550. Paralegals billed 28.6 hours at \$200 per
22 hour. Finally, legal assistants billed 22.5 hours at \$75 per hour. Cumulatively, this amounts to a total
23 lodestar of \$207,608.00 for Bibiyan Law Group, P.C.

24 **PAGA Counsel’s Hours Spent on the Case**

25 23. After diligent inquiry of the members of my firm, I can attest that Bibiyan Law
26 Group, P.C., has spent over 321.1 hours litigating this Action to bring it to resolution, not
27 including time which will be expended monitoring the administration of the settlement and
28 distribution of funds to Aggrieved Employees.

1 24. The efforts expended by Plaintiff's Counsel to achieve this result include, but are
2 not limited to, the following:

- 3 • The investigation of the matter, including meeting with Plaintiff, reviewing
4 policies provided by Plaintiff, review of documents in Plaintiff's possession,
5 review and analysis of Plaintiff's personnel file, and exploring Defendants'
6 corporate structure to determine whether any other individuals or entities should
7 be named in the litigation;
- 8 • Researching the dockets for other cases filed against Defendants, determining
9 whether they named all allegedly culpable defendants and included all theories
10 available;
- 11 • Compliance with prerequisites in connection with PAGA;
- 12 • Filing the complaints in the Class Action;
- 13 • Reviewing and analyzing Defendants' Answers to Plaintiff's Complaint;
- 14 • Review and analysis of the Court's Minute Orders, attention to scheduling and
15 delegation of actions in light thereof, drafting and filing Case Management
16 Statements and preparation for appearance at the Case Management Conferences;
- 17 • Meeting and conferring with counsel for Defendants, and drafting and filing Joint
18 Reports in advance of the conferences and hearings held by the Court, and
19 preparation and attendance of the same;
- 20 • Negotiating, drafting, and reviewing various Joint Stipulations with co-counsel
21 and counsel for Defendants, and a potential Joint Stipulation and Protective Order
22 for the production of Confidential Materials;
- 23 • Meeting and conferring with defense counsel regarding mediation, performance
24 of informal discovery beforehand, and negotiating with opposing counsel
25 regarding the parameters thereof;
- 26 • Selecting a mediator and mediation date;
- 27 • Preparation of a mediation brief and damages model for use at mediation;

- 1 • Communicating with Plaintiff regarding updates on this matter to ensure he
- 2 remained apprised of the events and happenings;
- 3 • Negotiating, finalizing and fully executing the Settlement Agreement; and
- 4 • Preparing the instant Motion for Settlement Approval.

5 25. PAGA Counsel also bear the risk of taking whatever actions are necessary if
6 Defendants fail to pay. Thus, the Court should find that PAGA Counsel's hours were necessary
7 and reasonable to achieve the excellent result. PAGA Counsel's hourly rates are in line with, and,
8 in fact, modest, compared with the hourly rates of other Counsel in similar actions.

9 26. And, the over 321.1 combined hours expended by the lawyers and staff members
10 of Bibiyan Law Group, P.C. in connection with this Action is only a calculation of efforts made
11 thus far; it does not include the time that will be spent preparing for and attending the approval
12 hearing, reviewing the Settlement Administrator's final calculations, and subsequent coordination
13 with the Settlement Administrator to ensure payments to Aggrieved Employees are timely
14 distributed. Thus, PAGA Counsel request that the Court find that these hours are reasonable in
15 this litigation.

16 27. Here no multiplier is required as PAGA Counsel have incurred more in fees than
17 is being requested.

18 **The Quality of Representation, the Novelty and Complexity of the Issues,**
19 **and the Results Obtained**

20 28. I believe my office used a high level of skill in addressing the difficult questions
21 presented in this case, which involved the contested issues regarding: the compliance of various
22 of Defendants' policies with the Labor Code, including whether all time worked was paid for;
23 whether meal and/or rest breaks were given in compliance with the Labor Code; issues regarding
24 the timeliness of pay, including whether all pay was received by termination or resignation; the
25 sufficiency and accuracy of wage statements (including whether issues therewith, if any, were
26 intentional or injurious); and various other issues.

27 29. PAGA Counsel are not aware of any other pending matter or action asserting claims
28 that will be extinguished or adversely affected by the Settlement.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Litigation Expenses Incurred by PAGA Counsel

30. The Settlement provides for reimbursement of PAGA Counsel’s reasonable litigation costs in an amount up to \$30,000.00. PAGA Counsel request only \$16,600.58 in total for costs incurred. Because these costs are reasonable, PAGA Counsel request that the Court approve those costs.

31. The itemized costs incurred by Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., in the above-referenced matter total \$16,600.58:

(1) Filing and Messenger Fees	\$2,264.00
(2) LWDA Filing Fee	\$75.00
(3) Mediation	\$9,000.00
(4) Expert Data Consultant Fees	\$4,730.00
(5) Service of Process	\$500.90
(6) Postage / FedEx	\$3.88
(7) Photocopies (134 x \$0.20)	\$26.80.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the state of California that the foregoing is true and correct this 5th day of November 2025, at Los Angeles, California.

David D. Bibiyan
David D. Bibiyan