

1 **BIBIYAN LAW GROUP, P.C.**

Vedang J. Patel (SBN 328647)

2 *vedang@tomorrowlaw.com*

3 Keaton D. Mendoza (SBN 321172)

Kmendoza@tomorrowlaw.com

4 1460 Westwood Boulevard

Los Angeles, California 90024

5 Tel: (310) 438-5555; Fax: (310) 300-1705

6 Attorneys for Plaintiff, DERICK ANTHONY BUTLER,

on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated

7 and aggrieved

8 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

9 **FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES – SPRING STREET COURTHOUSE**

10 DERICK ANTHONY BUTLER, an individual
11 and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

12
13 Plaintiff,

14 v.

15 SEE’S CANDY SHOPS INCORPORATED, a
16 California Corporation; and DOES 1 through
100, inclusive,

17
18 Defendant.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

CASE NO.: 24STCV09521

[Assigned to the Hon. Samantha P. Jessner in
Dept. 7]

**DECLARATION OF DAVID D. BIBIYAN
IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF’S MOTION
FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF
CLASS AND REPRESENTATIVE
ACTION SETTLEMENT AND
PROVISIONAL CLASS
CERTIFICATION FOR SETTLEMENT
PURPOSES ONLY**

DECLARATION OF DAVID D. BIBIYAN

1
2 1. I am an attorney at law, duly licensed to practice before all the Courts of the State
3 of California and I am the principal of Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., counsel of record for plaintiff
4 Derick Anthony Butler (“Plaintiff”) and all others similarly situated and aggrieved. As such, I am
5 familiar with the file in this matter and, if called as a witness, I could and would competently
6 testify to the following facts of my own personal knowledge.

Adequacy of Class Counsel

7
8 2. Class Counsel are experienced class action attorneys, have been appointed as class
9 counsel in other class actions, and have successful track records in litigating class actions.

10 3. I graduated with a Bachelor of Arts degree from the University of California, Los
11 Angeles in 2009.

12 4. I received my Juris Doctorate from The University of Chicago Law School in 2012.

13 5. After practicing for several years as a member of Cohen & Lord, P.C., practicing
14 in an amorphous range of civil litigation on behalf of both plaintiffs and defendants, I opened up
15 a law firm in 2014 with a concentration in representation of employees against employers to
16 recover unpaid wages and vindicate harassment, discrimination and retaliation in various contexts.

17 6. I am an active member of the California Employment Lawyers’ Association
18 (“CELA”), one of only a few members of its Reverse Auctions Subcommittee and serve as a
19 mediator between other plaintiffs’ counsel who bring overlapping class actions. I have also
20 attended various Continuing Legal Education courses pertaining to advocacy on behalf of
21 employees.

22 7. In fact, I recently created the content for, helped organize, and served as the
23 Moderator for the 2023 California Complex Symposium Wage and Hour/PAGA Section, a
24 Continuing Legal Education seminar and forum featuring four respected Judges serving in the
25 Complex Divisions of their respective county Superior Courts. In addition, my firm served as a
26 sponsor of that event.

27 8. Not only have I practiced almost exclusively in this field for years and have
28 contributed to the legal education curriculum for attorneys practicing within it, I am also a

1 published author in the Daily Journal as a contributor in the Wage and Hour and PAGA context,
2 including, in December 15, an article entitled: “PAGA: What’s Gone, What’s Left and What’s
3 Next.” I have also been a quoted source in multiple other publications, including in article
4 published by Bloomberg Law dated November 1, 2023 entitled: “Adidas, Home Depot Sued in
5 Test Cases on Job Ad Pay Transparency.”

6 9. My firm has the experience, resources and means necessary to allow us to provide
7 adequate representation as Class Counsel to all Class Members in this litigation.

8 10. I have filed contested motions for class certification in the past and have been
9 appointed Class Counsel by the Superior Court of California in the past. Some examples of
10 Actions in which I was appointed Class Counsel include:

11 • *Santoyo v. Consolidated Foundries, Inc.*, Case No. BC612298, California Superior
12 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Ann I. Jones, presiding;

13 • *Arendsdorff v. Stanley Steamer International, Inc.*, Case No. BC681368, California
14 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos, presiding;

15 • *Barreto v. Don Roberto Jewelers, Inc.*, Case No. BC495451, California Superior Court,
16 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

17 • *Junior Amilcar Laguna Gonzalez v. Takaaki Koyama*, Case No. BC641998, Los Angeles
18 Superior Court, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;

19 • *Rios v. Nongshim America, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1807390, California Superior Court,
20 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

21 • *Stoddard v. Molded Fiber Glass – West*, Case No. 1517758, California Superior Court,
22 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

23 • *Mata v. Sahara Scaffold, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1810785, California Superior Court,
24 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

25 • *Carrasco v. Pure Dental Solutions*, Case No. BC645995, Los Angeles Superior Court,
26 Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman, presiding;

27 • *Gonzalez v. Gochez, et al.*, Case No. BC648729, Los Angeles Superior Court, Honorable
28 Maren Nelson, presiding;

1 • *Montoya v. Superior Paving Co.*, Case No. CIVDS1833422, County of San Bernardino,
2 Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding;

3 • *Lopez v. Norred & Associates, Inc.*, Case No. CIVDS1824109, California Superior
4 Court, County of San Bernardino, David S. Cohn, presiding;

5 • *Noyola v. Lacren, LLC*, Case No. BC717024, California Superior Court, County of Los
6 Angeles, Hon. Anthony Mohr, presiding;

7 • *Luciano, et al. v. O'Tasty Foods, Inc., et al.*, Case No. BC711988, California Superior
8 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;

9 • *Gordon v. Hospice Source, LLC*, Case No. 34-2018-00250022-CU-OE-GDS, California
10 Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Christopher E. Krueger, presiding;

11 • *Barragan v. Refrigeration Supplies Distributor*, Case No. 19STCV09312, California
12 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;

13 • *Ramirez v. Acre Gourmet, Inc.*, Case No. CGC-19-575117, California Superior Court,
14 County of San Francisco, Honorable Andrew Y.S. Cheng, presiding;

15 • *Villafuerte v. Bay Alarm Company*, Case No. BC689110, California Superior Court,
16 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;

17 • *Cazares v. Areas USA LAX, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
18 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;

19 • *Magana v. Castlerock Environmental, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 19STCV38353, California
20 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

21 • *Chilel v. Sushi California, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV08209, California Superior Court,
22 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;

23 • *Malone v. Orange Courier, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 30-2016-00763474, California Superior
24 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Glenda Sanders, presiding;

25 • *Rivera v. Talamo Food Services, Inc.*, Case No. 19CV355856, California Superior Court,
26 County of Santa Clara, Honorable Patricia M. Lucas, presiding;

27 • *Olguin v. Cal Central Harvesting, Inc.*, Case No. 18CV03860, California Superior Court,
28 County of Santa Barbara, Honorable James F. Rigali, presiding;

1 • *Pence v. Sober Living by the Sea, Inc.*, Case No. 2018-00988742, California Superior
2 Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman, presiding;
3 • *Franco v. Vincent Rags, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV07768, California Superior Court,
4 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Ann I. Jones, presiding;
5 • *Cabral v. Miller Castings, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
6 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl, presiding;
7 • *Bolanos v. Texas Roadhouse, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV39556, California Superior Court,
8 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Sunshine Sykes, presiding;
9 • *Rodriguez v. Scott A. Humphreys, Inc.*, Case No. 30-2021-01184556-CU-OE-CXC,
10 California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Matthew P. Guasco, presiding;
11 • *Torres v. Primal Pet Foods, Inc.* Case No. FCS054783, California Superior Court,
12 County of Solano, Honorable Wendy G. Getty, presiding;
13 • *Hanson v. Zapata Nuccio, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV28951, California Superior Court,
14 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
15 • *Molina v. Avibank Mfg, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV03910, California Superior Court,
16 County of Los Angeles, Honorable John P. Doyle, presiding;
17 • *Cetina v. Lawry's Restaurants, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV05201, California Superior Court,
18 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Amy D. Hogue, presiding;
19 • *Luna v. Pronto California General Agency, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV39951, California
20 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
21 • *Alvarez v. Kazak-Mars, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV42587, California Superior Court,
22 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle, presiding;
23 • *Noe v. My Pillow, Inc.* Case No. CIVDS 2011360, California Superior Court, County of
24 San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;
25 • *Nunez v. 2751 West Coast Acquisition Company*, Case No. 30-2020-01145215-CU-
26 OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman,
27 Presiding;
28 ///

1 • *Smith v. McMillen Enterprises, Inc.*, Case No. CV-20-002938, California Superior Court,
2 County of Stanislaus, Honorable John R. Mayne, presiding;
3 • *Turner v. Plant Prefab Inc., et al.*, Case No. CIVDS2017517, California Superior Court,
4 County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn, presiding;
5 • *Duran v. Fresh Select, LLC*, Case No. VCU284892, California Superior Court, County
6 of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;
7 • *Reynoso, et al. v. Cream of the Crop AG Service, Inc.*, Case No. VCU278847, California
8 Superior Court, County of Tulare, Honorable Bret Hillman, presiding;
9 • *Michel v. Universal Waste Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV46181, California Superior
10 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable David S. Cunningham presiding;
11 • *Jungers v. U.S. Borax Inc., et al.*, Case No. BCV-21-10003, California Superior Court,
12 County of Kern, Honorable Bernard C. Barmann Jr. presiding;
13 • *Fortune v. Amoroso Limited Partnership, et al.*, Case No. 20STCV25874, California
14 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;
15 • *Montoya, et al. v. Remo, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV34614, California Superior Court,
16 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
17 • *Rincon, et al. v. New-Indy Tripaq, LLC, et al.* Case No. 20STCV17118, California
18 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
19 • *De Leon, et al. v. Wismettac Asian Foods, Inc.* Case No. 19STCV18172, California
20 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
21 • *Tapia v. Mercer Foods, Inc.* Case No. CV-21-000020, California Superior Court,
22 County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
23 • *Molina v. Reser's Fine Foods, Inc.* Case No. 37-2021-00013052-CU-OECTL, California
24 Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Eddie C. Sturgeon presiding;
25 • *Reyes v. Imperial Sprinkler Supply, Inc.* Case No. 30-2020-01167748-CU-OE-CXC,
26 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Peter Wilson presiding;
27 • *Zavala, et al. v. PLS Check Cashers, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV42586, California Superior
28 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;

1 • *Paz v. Hill Brothers Chemical Company*. Case No. 20STCV48279, California Superior
2 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
3 • *Garcia v. Inwesco Incorporated*. Case No. 20STCV46833, California Superior Court,
4 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
5 • *Guevara v. J&K Culver, LLC, et al.*. Case No. 19STCV39951, California Superior Court,
6 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
7 • *Hamilton v. Michael Kors Stores, Inc. et al.*, Case No. 19STCV37061, California
8 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
9 • *Arzooian v. A&M Administration, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV05576, California
10 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yvette M. Palazuelos presiding;
11 • *Santos, et al. v. Maruzen of America, Inc.*, Case No. 19STCV37662, California Superior
12 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
13 • *Schaffino v. M.O. Dion & Sons., Inc., et al.*, Case No. 20STCV38023, California Superior
14 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Gail Killefer presiding;
15 • *Moreno v. Santa Paula Post Acute, LLC, et al.* Case No. 21STCV12533, California
16 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding;
17 • *Singer v. Desert Area Resources and Training*, Case No. BCV-21-101093, California
18 Superior Court, County of Kern, Honorable Thomas S. Clark presiding;
19 • *Clarizio v. Guard-Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV28667, California Superior Court,
20 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Armen Tamzarian presiding;
21 • *Guzman v. Freschco Painters, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV04683, California Superior Court,
22 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
23 • *Koutny v. PAE Aviation and Technical Services, LLC*, Case No. 21C-0106, California
24 Superior Court, County of Kings, Honorable Melissa R. D’Morias presiding;
25 • *Rodriguez v. Pacifica Trucks, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV37576, California Superior Court,
26 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart Rice presiding;
27 • *Ramos v. AEGIS Treatment Centers, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV41429, California Superior
28 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;

1 • *Valdez v. Integrated Building Services, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV37793, California Superior
2 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
3 • *Harris v. America One Security, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV01399, California Superior Court,
4 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
5 • *Moreno v. M&J Seafood Company, Inc.* Case No. 22STCV03341, California Superior
6 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable William F. Highberger presiding;
7 • *Corrales v. Q&B Foods, Inc.* Case No. 20STCV40885, California Superior Court,
8 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu Berle presiding;
9 • *Arteaga v. Demolition Specialist, Inc.* Case No. RIC2001133, California Superior Court,
10 County of Riverside, Honorable Harold Hopp presiding;
11 • *Vigil, et al. v. Capstone Turbine Corporation*, Case No. 20STCV32123, California
12 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
13 • *Ramirez v. Sea-Win, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV22026, California Superior Court, County of
14 Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
15 • *Ortega Chavez v. Winpak Lane, Inc.* Case No. CIVSB2207313, California Superior
16 Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
17 • *Garcia v. American Licorice Company*. Case No. RG21107049, California Superior
18 Court, County of Alameda, Honorable Brad Seligman presiding;
19 • *Madrono v. Vitale Nursing, Inc, et al.*, Case No. 21STCV09845, California Superior
20 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding; and
21 • *Orellana v. Advanced Building Maintenance*. Case No. 34-2020-00286791-CU-OE-
22 GDS, California Superior Court, County of Sacramento, Honorable Jill Talley presiding.
23 • *Aguilar v. Bioness, Inc., et al.*, Case No. 21STCV41702, California Superior Court,
24 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
25 • *Antoine v. Pinky Beverly Hills, LLC., et al.* Case No. 19STCV44856, California
26 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
27 • *Bailey v. Cannon Constructors, Inc., et al.* Case No. 21STCV38274, California
28 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;

1 • *Phambui v. Fashion Marketing and Merchandising Group, Inc., et al. Case No.*
2 *21STCV06634*, Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Stuart M. Rice presiding;
3 • *Ortega Chavez v. Winpak Lane, Inc., et al. Case No. CIVSB2202274*, California
4 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
5 • *Carrasco v O.H. Barkhordar D.D.S., Inc., et al. Case No. 22STCV21188*, California
6 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff presiding;
7 • *Correia v. Gallo Glass Company, et al. Case No. CV-21-006459*, California Superior
8 Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding;
9 • *Davis v. Beeline Import and Services, LLC, et al. Case No. CIVSB2119287*, California
10 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David Cohn presiding;
11 • *Angel Lopez v Innovative Coatings Technology Corporation dba Incotec, et al. Case No.*
12 *30-2020-01173245-CU-OE-CXC*, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon
13 Hurwitz presiding;
14 • *Lopez v UPM, Inc., et al. Case No. 20STCV36695*, California Superior Court, County of
15 Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
16 • *Moreno v. Infiniti Group LLC., et al. Case No. CIVSB2223551*, California Superior
17 Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Joseph T. Ortiz presiding;
18 • *Kelley v. Applus Technologies, Inc., et al. Case No. CIVSB2204889*, California Superior
19 Court, County of San Bernardino, honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;
20 • *Hernandez v Bromley Foods, Inc., et al. Case No. 56-2021-00561326-CU-OE-VTA*,
21 California Superior Court, County of Ventura, Honorable Henr Walsh presiding;
22 • *Heredia v. Alan Smith Pool Plastering, Inc., et al. Case No. 30-2020-01163609-CU-OE-*
23 *CXC*, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Randall J. Sherman presiding;
24 • *Martinez Guzman v Freshco Painters Inc., et al. Case No. 21STCV04683*, California
25 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence P. Riff presiding;
26 • *Gonzalez v. Total Education Solutions, Inc., et al. Case No. 20STCV37984*, California
27 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson presiding;
28 *///*

1 • *Gomez Mireles v. USG Ceilings Plus, LLC., et al. Case No. 21STCV45606*, California
2 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Elihu M. Berle presiding;
3 • *Garzon v. Mobile Hi-Tech Wheels, LLC., et al., Case No. 21STCV15396*, California
4 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn B. Kuhl presiding;
5 • *Dethrasavong v. ASI Computer Technologies, Inc., et al. Case No. 20STCV32312*,
6 California Superior Court, County of Contra Costa, Honorable Kenneth R. Freeman presiding;
7 • *Iraheta v. Legacy Farmers, Inc.*, Case No. MSC21-00762, California Superior Court,
8 County of Contra Costa, Honorable Edward G. Weil presiding;
9 • *Echegoyen v. The ADT Security Corporation.*, Case No. 21STCV07206, California
10 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding; and
11 • *Tarin v. TPS Solutions, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV07844, California Superior Court,
12 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren E. Nelson presiding;
13 11. I have also settled matters on a “PAGA Only” basis for aggrieved employees in the
14 past, including in:
15 • *Flores v. Delta Apparel, Inc.*, Case No. BC641499, California Superior Court, County
16 of Los Angeles, Honorable Daniel J. Buckley, presiding;
17 • *Segura v. CJ Foods Service Holdings USA, LLC*, Case No. 19STCV24918, California
18 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maureen Duffy-Lewis, presiding;
19 • *Sierra v. Nexem-Allied, LLC*, Case No. 20STCV11281, California Superior Court,
20 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Randolph M. Hammock, presiding;
21 • *Nodal v. Sodexo, Inc.*, Case No. 20STCV40601, California Superior Court, County of
22 Los Angeles, Honorable Lawrence Riff, presiding;
23 • *Cooper v. Lucas Health Partners*, Case No. 20STCV20050, California Superior Court,
24 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren Nelson, presiding;
25 • *Herrera v. Greystar Management, LP, et al.*, Case No. 37-2020-00009672-CU-OE-CTL,
26 California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Carolyn Caietti, presiding;
27 • *Slater v. Jo-Ann Stores, LLC.*, Case No. 21STCV18454, California Superior Court,
28 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maurice A. Leiter, presiding;

1 • *Bolanos v. Canoga Park Heating & Air Conditioning, Co., Inc.*, Case No.
2 21STCV12674, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Yolanda Orozco,
3 presiding;

4 • *Granados v. Cosmetic Ideas, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV10797, California Superior Court,
5 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Richard L. Fruin, presiding;

6 • *Ruano v. DPC Woodwork, Inc.* Case No. 21STCV00408, California Superior Court,
7 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Jon R. Takasugi presiding;

8 • *Tarin v. TPS Solutions, Inc.*, Case No. 21STCV07844, California Superior Court,
9 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Maren E. Nelson presiding;

10 • *Echegoyen v. The ADT Security Corporation.*, Case No. 21STCV07206, California
11 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Carolyn Kuhl presiding; and

12 • *Iraheta v. Legacy Farmers, Inc.*, Case No. MSC21-00762, California Superior Court,
13 County of Contra Costa, Honorable Edward G. Weil presiding;

14 • *Davood v. NKSFB, LLC., et al.* Case No. 22STCV17305, California Superior Court,
15 County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui presiding;

16 • *Hardy v. Texas Roadhouse Management Corp., et al.* Case No. CIVSB2222259,
17 California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jessica Morgan presiding;

18 • *Michelle v. Smithfield Packaged Meats Corp., et al.* Case No. JCCP5244, California
19 Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Jesica Morgan, presiding;

20 • *Hernandez v. SC Commercial, LLC, d.b.a. SC Fuels, et al.*, Case No. 30-2020-01166961-
21 CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Lon. Hurwitz presiding;

22 • *Hines v. Constellis Integrated Risk Management Services, et al.* Case No.
23 20STCV26962, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Christopher K. Lui
24 presiding;

25 • *Iraheta v Legacy Farmers, Inc., et al.* Case No. MSC21-00762, California Superior
26 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Charles S. Treat presiding; and

27 • *Landin v Central Janitors' Supply Co., Inc., et al.* Case No. CV-21-006391, California
28 Superior Court, County of Stanislaus, Honorable Sonny S. Sandhu presiding.

1 12. I believe that I am sufficiently experienced and qualified to evaluate the Class
2 Members' claims and viability of Defendant's defenses.

3 13. Vedang J. Patel has been a member of my law firm for over two (2) years and served
4 as class counsel on numerous actions on which I was also named class counsel. Prior to working
5 with Bibiyan Law Group, P.C., he practiced law as a member of Murchison & Cumming, LLP,
6 on a variety of matter on behalf of defendants. Thereafter, he joined Bibiyan Law Group, P.C.
7 practicing law on behalf plaintiffs in matters of employment law, and specifically on issue of
8 unpaid wages and class action settlements. He is currently a senior attorney at Bibiyan Law Group,
9 P.C. Among other tasks, he oversees and manages all settlements at Bibiyan Law Group, P.C.

10 14. Currently, my firm is acting as counsel in tens of wage and hour class actions and
11 representative PAGA actions.

12 15. Class Counsel believe no conflicts, disabling or otherwise, exists between Plaintiff
13 and Class Members because Plaintiff alleges to have been damaged by the same alleged conduct
14 of Defendant (i.e., Plaintiff classified as a non-exempt, hourly-paid employee, not paid premium
15 pay, etc.) and thus has the incentive to fairly represent all Class Members' claims to achieve the
16 maximum possible recovery.

17 16. After a thorough investigation and settlement discussions, Class Counsel arrived at
18 terms that they viewed was in the best interest of both the Class Members and the Parties.

19 17. Should the Court refuse to grant preliminary approval of this Settlement, many of
20 the Class Members may be denied any recourse for Defendant's alleged violations.

21 18. For these reasons, as well as the reasons provided in the Declaration of Vedang J.
22 Patel, I believe that Class Counsel are sufficiently experienced and qualified to evaluate the Class
23 Members' claims and viability of Defendant's defenses.

24 19. I believe, and as further set out in the Declaration of Vedang J. Patel, the settlement
25 presented here only resulted after having engaged in extensive informal discovery and investigation
26 and is the product of hard-fought litigation and extensive arm's-length negotiations.

27 20. I believe, based on my experience as class counsel, that the settlement is fair,
28 reasonable, adequate and in the best interests of class members.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct this May 18, 2026, at Los Angeles, California.

/s/ *David D. Bibiyan*

David D. Bibiyan