

JCL LAW FIRM, APC

Paul K. Haines (State Bar #248676)
Monnett De La Torre (State Bar #272884)
5440 Morehouse Drive, Suite 3600
San Diego, CA 92121
Telephone: (619) 599-8292
Facsimile: (619) 599-8291
jlapuyade@jcl-lawfirm.com
mdelatorre@jcl-lawfirm.com

ZAKAY LAW GROUP, APLC

Shani O. Zakay (State Bar #277924)
Julieann Alvarado (State Bar #334727)
5440 Morehouse Drive, Suite 5400
San Diego, CA 92121
Telephone: (619) 255-9047
Facsimile: (858) 404-9203
shani@zakaylaw.com
julieann@zakaylaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff
(Additional counsel listed on following page)

SUPERIOR COURT FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN DIEGO

JOSE GARCIA VALLE, as an individual and on
behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

PACIFIC SHELLFISH, INC., a California
corporation; and DOES 1 through 100, Inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 37-2021-00021898-CU-OE-CTL

**DECLARATION OF PAUL K. HAINES,
ESQ., IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF'S
MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY
APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION AND
PAGA SETTLEMENT**

Date: May 26, 2023

Time: 8:30 a.m.

Judge: Hon. Ronald F. Frazier

Department: 65

Trial Date: N/A

Action Filed: May 17, 2021

HAINES LAW GROUP, APC

Paul K. Haines (SBN 248226)

phaines@haineslawgroup.com

2155 Campus Drive, Suite 180

El Segundo, California 90245

Tel: (424) 292-2350

Fax: (424) 292-2355

Attorneys for Plaintiff

1 I, Paul K. Haines, declare as follows:

2 1. I am the principal of the law firm Haines Law Group, APC, and counsel for the named
3 Plaintiff Jose Garcia Valle (hereinafter, "Plaintiff") and the proposed Settlement Class in the above-
4 captioned matter. I am a member in good standing of the bar of the State of California and am admitted
5 to practice in this Court. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated in this declaration and could
6 testify competently to them if called upon to do so.

7 2. I am a 2006 graduate of Pepperdine University School of Law, where I graduated *cum*
8 *laude*. During law school, I worked as a law clerk for the appellate firm of Horvitz & Levy, located in
9 Encino, California. I also spent a semester in Law School working as an extern for the Honorable Judge
10 Edward Rafeedie, District Judge for the United States District Court for the Central District of
11 California.

12 3. Since graduating from law school, my practice has focused almost exclusively on
13 employment litigation. In September 2007, I began working as an associate attorney at the international
14 law firm of Littler Mendelson, P.C. at its Los Angeles office, which according to its website is the
15 "largest U.S.-based law firm exclusively devoted to representing management in every aspect of labor
16 and employment law." While at Littler Mendelson, I was primarily staffed on wage and hour class
17 actions in both state and federal courts, and I also worked on a number of single and multi-plaintiff wage
18 and hour matters as well.

19 4. During my employment at Littler Mendelson, I played a significant role in the class
20 actions that I was staffed on, as I was often the only associate staffed on such cases. In particular, I
21 received a wide array of wage and hour class action experience performing the following types of tasks:
22 drafting demurrers, motions to strike, and motions to dismiss; removing actions from state court to
23 federal court; drafting and responding to written discovery; drafting and opposing discovery related
24 motions; arguing discovery related motions; drafting motions to consolidate related matters;
25 interviewing putative class members and obtaining declarations in connection with class certification;
26 drafting oppositions to motions for class certification; drafting motions for decertification following
27 class certification; conducting exposure analyses to assess the strengths and weaknesses of asserted
28 claims, the likelihood of prevailing at class certification, and potential damages resulting from such
claims; drafting mediation briefs; serving as the primary contact to in-house counsel; deposing named

1 plaintiffs and putative class members; deposing retained expert witnesses; and defending the depositions
2 of corporate witnesses. In short, I played an integral role in all aspects of litigation from the inception
3 of a matter through and beyond class certification. I also supervised the work of several junior attorneys
4 who were staffed on the same wage and hour class actions.

5 5. In June 2011, I voluntarily resigned from Littler Mendelson in order to accept an
6 associate attorney position with the international law firm of Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP at its Los
7 Angeles office, where I began working in July 2011. During my employment at Morgan, Lewis &
8 Bockius LLP, I worked exclusively on the defense of wage and hour class and collective actions. For
9 the vast majority of these cases, I was the only associate staffed on the matters, and I performed the
10 same job duties as described in the immediately preceding paragraph. In addition to working on wage
11 and hour class actions, at Morgan, Lewis & Bockius I also worked on a number of “hybrid” actions
12 asserting nationwide wage and hour claims under the Fair Labor Standards Act, as well as California-
specific claims under Rule 23 of the Rules of Civil Procedure.

13 6. In July 2012, I transitioned into litigating wage and hour class actions from the Plaintiff’s
14 side, first as a Partner with the law firm of Boren, Osher & Luftman, LLP, and since February 2016 as
15 a Shareholder of Haines Law Group, APC. Currently, over ninety percent (90%) of my practice is
16 dedicated exclusively to the prosecution of wage and hour class and PAGA actions, and my law firm is
17 currently responsible for prosecuting over fifty (50) wage and hour class actions filed in both State and
18 Federal courts throughout California. I have been appointed as Class Counsel in over seventy-five (75)
19 wage and hour class action settlements in state and federal courts within California. Some examples of
20 the matters in which I have been appointed as Class Counsel, all of which have been granted final
21 approval, include the following: *Hilberger v. Eisenhower Medical Center*, Case No. INC1204915,
22 California Superior Court, County of Riverside, Honorable Judge John G. Evans, presiding, (in which I
23 was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2012 and 2013); *Tacker v. Compass*
24 *Health, Inc.*, Case No. CV13-02261 BRO (JCG), United States District Court, Central District of
25 California, Honorable Judge Beverly Reid O’Connell, presiding, (in which I was approved for an hourly
26 rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Noell v. American Professional Ambulance*
27 *Corporation, Inc.*, Case No. BC499345, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable
28 Judge Kenneth R. Freeman, presiding, (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work

1 performed in 2013 and 2014); *Bautista v. Harvest Management Sub LLC*, Case No. CV12-10004 FMO
2 (CWx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Fernando M.
3 Olguin, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2012, 2013
4 and 2014); *Davila v. OCB Restaurant Co.*, Case No. CV13-5403 PA (JCG), United States District Court,
5 Central District of California, Honorable Judge Percy Anderson, presiding (in which I was approved for
6 an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Abad v. Waste Connections, Inc.*, Case
7 No. CV12-06708 DDP (PJWx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable
8 Judge Dean D. Pregerson, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work
9 performed in 2013 and 2014); *Plantillas v. Snap-On Incorporated*, Case No. CV13-05153 DDP
10 (VBKx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Dean D.
11 Pregerson, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013
12 and 2014); *Theodore v. Keyes European, LLC*, Case No. BC521395, California Superior Court, County
13 of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Elihu Berle, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of
14 \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Morales v. Sunset Tower Hotel LLC*, Case No. BC511924,
15 California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge John Shepard Wiley Jr., presiding
16 (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Gonzalez*
17 *v. Universal Alloy Corp.*, Case No. SACV13-00807 JVS (MRWx), United States District Court, Central
18 District of California, Honorable Judge James V. Selna, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly
19 rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014); *Morawski v. Milt Guggia Enterprises, Inc.*, Case
20 No. CV13-2349 ABC (RZx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable
21 Judge Andre Birotte, Jr., presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work
22 performed in 2013 and 2014); *Thorp v. Alcal Industries, Inc., et al.*, Case No. CV13-02289 YGR, United
23 States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable Judge Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers,
24 presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500 for work performed in 2013 and 2014);
25 *Myles v. College Hospital*, Case No. BC487206, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles,
26 Honorable Judge John Shepard Wiley, Jr., presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$500
27 for work performed in 2013, 2014 and 2015); *Sarinana v. DS Waters of America, Inc.*, Case No. C13-
28 0905 EMC, United States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable Edward M. Chen,
presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015);

1 *Julio v. Anthony, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-03172 AB (SHx), United States District Court, Central District
2 of California, Honorable Judge Andre Birotte Jr., presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate
3 of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Litt v. Western Stone & Metal Corp.*, Case No. 3:14-cv-
4 02804-PJH, United States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable Judge Phyllis J.
5 Hamilton, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014
6 and 2015); *Rubalcava v. United Towing and Transport Burbank, et al.*, Case No. BC518468, California
7 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Kenneth Freeman, presiding (in which I was
8 approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2013, 2014 and 2015); *Sanchez v. Res-Care,*
9 *Inc.*, Case No. BC526175, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable John S. Wiley,
10 presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2013, 2014 and
11 2015); *Prado v. Warehouse Demo Services, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-3170 JFW (Ex), United States District
12 Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge John F. Walter, presiding (in which I was
13 approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Rodas v. Gateways Hospital*
14 *and Mental Health Center*, Case No. BC503179, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles,
15 Honorable Judge Amy D. Hogue, presiding (in which I was approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for
16 work performed in 2014 and 2015); *Escobar v. Century West, LLC*, Case No BC564873, California
17 Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Jane L. Johnson, presiding (in which I was
18 approved for an hourly rate of \$550 for work performed in 2014 and 2015 and 2016); *Shaw v. Conant*
19 *Auto Retail, San Diego*, Case No. 37-2014-00044052-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior Court, County
20 of San Diego, Honorable Judge Joan M. Lewis, presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work
21 performed in 2014, 2015, and 2016); *Tirado v. Ricon Corp.*, Case No. BC537042, California Superior
22 Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable John S. Wiley, presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575
23 for work performed in 2014, 2015, and 2016); and *Horta v. Searles Valley Minerals, Inc.*, Case No.
24 CIVDS 1507615, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable Donald Alvarez
25 presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2015 and 2016); *Cristobal v. Koos*
26 *Manufacturing, Inc.*, Case No. BC591484, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Hon.
27 William F. Highberger presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2015 and
28 2016); *Rodriguez v. Spartan, Inc.*, Case No. BCV-15-100007-DRL, California Superior Court, County
of Kern, Honorable David R. Lampe presiding (approving hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in

2015, 2016, and 2017); *Kostyuk, et al. v. Golden State Overnight Delivery Service, Inc.*, Case No. RG14727191, California Superior Court, Alameda County, Honorable Winifred Y. Smith presiding (approving an hourly rate of \$575 for work performed in 2015, 2016, and 2017); *Nunez v. CompuCom Systems, Inc.*, Case No. BC618385, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge John Shepard Wiley, Jr., presiding (approved at an hourly rate of \$600 for work performed in 2016 and 2017); *Mansilla v. Haeco Americas Line Services, LLC, et al*, Case No. BC615310, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles, Honorable Judge Elihu M. Berle presiding (approved at an hourly rate of \$600 for work performed in 2016 and 2017); *Morales v. Caremeridian, LLC, et al.*, Case No. BC593191, California Superior Court, County of Los Angeles, Judge William F. Highberger presiding (approved at an hourly rate of \$600 for work performed in 2015-2018).

7. I have also moved to certify and have received an order certifying a class action and/or conditionally certifying a collective action in the following cases:

- *Medeiros v. Vortex Financial Management Inc.*, Case No. 30-2013-00644741-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Judge Gail A. Andler, presiding (certifying a class of employees who were misclassified as independent contractors);
- *Javine v. San Luis Ambulance Service, Inc.*, Case No. CV13-07480 BRO (SSx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge Beverly Reid O'Connell, presiding (conditionally certifying an unpaid FLSA overtime wage class);
- *Prado v. Warehouse Demo Services, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-3170 JFW (Ex), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Judge John F. Walter, presiding (certifying a rest period violation class and conditionally certifying a FLSA unpaid overtime wage class);
- *Bower v. Cycle Gear, Inc.*, Case No. CV14-2712 HSG, United States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable Judge Haywood S. Gilliam, Jr., presiding (conditionally certifying an unpaid FLSA overtime wage class);
- *Vega v. Weatherford U.S., Limited Partnership*, Case No. CV14-1790-JLT, United States District Court, Eastern District of California, Honorable Jennifer L. Thurston, presiding (conditionally certifying an unpaid FLSA overtime wage class); and

- *Galvan v. AMVAC Chemical Corporation*, Case No. 30-2014-00716103-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Judge William Claster, presiding (certifying unpaid overtime wage class and waiting time penalty class).
- *Camacho v. Residential Fire Systems, Inc.*, Case No. 30-2015-775372-CU-OE-CXC, California Superior Court, County of Orange, Honorable Glenda Sanders, presiding (certifying piece rate pay plan classes, expense reimbursement class, wage statement class, and waiting time penalties class).
- *Ontiveros v. Safelite Fulfillment, Inc., et al*, Case No. CV 15-7118-DMG (RAOx), United States District Court, Central District of California, Honorable Dolly M. Gee presiding (certifying six classes of employees for rest period violations, wage statement violations, meal period violations, and overtime and double-time violations).
- *Vazquez, et al v. Kraft Heinz Foods Company*, Case No. 16-cv-2749-WQH-BLM, United States District Court, Southern District of California, Honorable William Q. Hayes presiding (certifying six classes of employees for unpaid wages, meal period violations, wage statement violations, and waiting time penalties);
- *Caudle, et al v. Sprint/United Management Co.*, Case No. C 17-06874-WHA, United States District Court, Northern District of California, Honorable William H. Alsup presiding (certifying three classes of employees for unlawful wage deductions, wage statement violations, and waiting time penalties);
- *Perez v. Sunbelt Rentals, Inc.*, Case No. 37-2018-00026405-CU-OE-CTL, California Superior Court, County of San Diego, Honorable Eddie C. Sturgeon, presiding (certifying wage statement class); and
- *Staublein v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.*, Case No. CIV DS1712267, California Superior Court, County of San Bernardino, Honorable David S. Cohn, presiding (certifying wage statement class).
- *Bowlin-Burdick, et al v. Life Care Centers of America, Inc.*, Case No. BC657139, Los Angeles County Superior Court, Honorable Maren E. Nelson presiding (certifying four classes for meal period violations, rest period violations, wage statement violations, and waiting time penalties).

- *McDonald v. Sierra Pacific Industries*, Case No. JCCP 5235, Shasta County Superior Court, Honorable Tamara Wood presiding (certifying seven classes for unpaid wages, meal and rest break violations and derivative penalties).

8. In 2015, 2016, and 2017, Thomson Reuters recognized me as a Top Young Attorney in Southern California in the annual Rising Stars Edition of Super Lawyer. This is an honor awarded to no more than two-and-a-half percent of attorneys under the age of forty in Southern California each year. In 2018-2023 Thomson Reuters recognized me as a “Super Lawyer” in the annual Super Lawyer magazine, an honor awarded to no more than five percent of all attorneys in Southern California each year.

9. As co-lead counsel for Plaintiff and the proposed Settlement Class, I have been intimately involved in every aspect of this case from its inception through the present, and I believe that the proposed Settlement is a reasonable result for the Settlement Class Members.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of California and the United States that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on May 2, 2023, at Los Angeles, California.



PAUL HAINES